

## **Pride and Prejudice**

A Review of police **Race Relations** in Scotland

## **Pride and Prejudice**

A Review of police Race Relations in Scotland

Published by the Scottish Executive on behalf of HM Inspectorate of Constabulary

Edinburgh 2003

Crown copyright 2003

ISBN 0 7559 0605 5

Astron B27795



### Contents

Preface		vii
Dictionary definitions of Pride and Prejudice		
Executive Summary		
List of Recommendations		7
Chapter One	Strategic Drivers	10
Chapter Two	Police Staff Introduction	16 17
	Recruitment Positive action A national approach	18 20 21
	Special constables Police support staff Training	22 23 25
	Minority ethnic staff Staff appraisal	28 30
Chapter Three	Police Service Delivery	32
	Introduction Data collection Usage of data Quality of case reporting Lord Advocate's Guidelines Interpreting and translating Cultural and religious needs Provision of information Community policing Police complaints	33 34 36 37 38 39 41 41 42 42
Chapter Four	Monitoring and Performance Introduction Performance indicators Public satisfaction surveys Ethnic classification Monitoring ethnicity in the criminal justice system Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 External scrutiny Summary	46 47 48 50 50 51 51 51 53 53



ommunity	56
itroduction	57
ay advisory groups	58
onsolidation of established liaison	58
evelopment of consultation	59
ommunity involvement	60
rime	61
ommunity cohesion	62
ational Intelligence Model/Critical Incident Management	66
cottish Police Information and Co-ordinating Centre	69
ledia	69
top search	70
ummary	71
sylum and Immigration	72
	73
	77
	78
	78
	78
	80
	81
	81
ummary	82
iversity	84
ntroduction	85
	86
	87
	88
	88
	88
ummary	89
	90
Acknowledgements	
orthy practice	92
Some useful web addresses	
Glossary of terms	
	Artroduction ay advisory groups onsolidation of established liaison evelopment of consultation ommunity involvement rime ommunity cohesion ational Intelligence Model/Critical Incident Management cottish Police Information and Co-ordinating Centre ledia top search ummary sylum and Immigration troduction eserved issues cottish Executive aison with councils nited Kingdom Immigration Service aison with councils nited Kingdom Immigration Service aison with councils nited Kingdom Immigration Service aison yet raporting legal immigrants ummary iversity troduction ay, bi-sexual and transgender ectarianism ypsy travellers exism especting difference ummary



#### Preface

#### 1.

During 2000, HMIC carried out a thematic inspection of police race relations in Scotland, the report of which was entitled *Without Prejudice?*.<sup>2</sup> The review contained herein is not simply a check list of actions since that time. *Pride and Prejudice – a review of police race relations in Scotland* offers a strategic assessment of progress and identifies areas for future development. Where there is significant cross reference to *Without Prejudice?*, this is acknowledged.

#### 2.

As the 21st century begins, a major challenge for the police service in Scotland is to deliver positive police race relations. That responsibility is laid out in authoritative documents including the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report<sup>3</sup> and is now included in statute. Scrutiny of police performance in this area is robust and detailed, carried out by government, communities, and the media. It carries such a deserved degree of weight because it is about how a powerful and visible service treats a section of society which historically has not been able to depend on equal opportunity and where discrimination and racism have been apparent.

#### 3.

The history of police race relations in the United Kingdom is generally one of lack of confidence, which in England has occasionally been punctuated by episodes of serious public disorder. While Scotland has not experienced the equivalent of such troubles, there is scope for continued development of positive race relations to sustain community cohesion. Full advantage must be taken of local conditions to create a Scotland with true equality of opportunity. Particular account must be taken of young people in future race relations strategy.

#### 4.

The police service has a part to play as a service provider, an employer, and as a partner. Each of these roles deserves attention with progress in one area complementing the others.

#### 5.

The international context of race relations must also be considered, its implications realised, and challenges addressed. Forces need to ensure they are responsive to local issues created by international events such as the terrorist attacks in America on September 11 2001, the ever changing asylum seeker issue, or global hostilities.

#### 6.

It is a mistake to think that racism is not an issue in Scotland, or if it is then it is only relevant to our cities. The minority ethnic population is rising through natural growth and immigration, as borne out by the national census in 2001 which shows an increase of 1.2% to 2% of the total population. Significant numbers are choosing a rural life, often attracted by employment opportunities. It is crucial that practices are in place to ensure a confidence in, and access to, policing services throughout Scotland. Isolation on top of discrimination is a double jeopardy that must be avoided.

#### **7**.

Forces must also work with their minority ethnic population to tackle criminality when it arises within that community. The demand for such police activity is considerable with a public determination for the law to be enforced and offenders brought to justice. Inactivity through a lack of confidence or criminal and community intelligence are matters that should be addressed, as inaction can often be perceived as racism and malpractice.

#### 8.

A key issue is consultation and Forces must continue to build on the progress they have made, most notably through advisory groups. While such groups can contribute substantially, they cannot offer the breadth or depth of dialogue required for full and comprehensive consultation. Forces must work to engage with groups such as young people, older persons and women while responding to the needs of new arrivals including asylum seekers.

#### 9.

One question posed throughout the inspection was '*Why do you think the police have such a prominent role in race relations?*' Many replies pointed to the visibility of the service, and that the police would be the first organisation they would turn to. This can be seen as a compliment. However, it is important for the police service to emphasise that building positive race relations is an area where they are only one of the agencies with a part to play. The police service must engage fully in a multiagency approach if the widest progress is to be achieved in race relations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> *Without Prejudice?* – a thematic inspection of police race relations in Scotland, A Report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (2001)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: Report of an inquiry by Sir William Macpherson of Cluny. Cmd 4262-1. London: HMSO. (1999)

## Dictionary definitions<sup>1</sup> of **Pride and Prejudice**

#### pride –

- n. (Unduly) high opinion of one's own qualities, merits, etc., arrogant bearing or conduct, (~ of place, exalted position, consciousness of this); (proper) ~, sense of what befits one's position, preventing one from doing unworthy thing; feeling of elation and pleasure (take a ~ in, be proud of); object of this feeling; best condition, prime.
- 2. v.refl. ~ oneself (up)on, be proud of (thing, quality, doing). [E(proud)]

#### prejudice -

- n. Preconceived opinion, bias (against, in favour of, person or thing); injury that results or may result from some action or judgement (to the prejudice of; without ~ice, without detriment to any existing right or claim).
- 2. v.t. Impair validity of (right, claim, statement, etc.); (esp in *p.p.*) cause (person) to have prejudice (*against or in favour of*).
- **3.** ~icial a. (;lly), causing prejudice, detrimental (*to* rights, interests, etc.).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> *The Oxford Handy Dictionary* (6th edition), Chancellor Press, London (1986)

#### **Executive Summary**

#### Influences

In 2002/03, Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary carried out a review of police race relations in Scotland. The reasons for doing so included:

- Assessing progress on the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Recommendations in Scotland
- Following up *Without Prejudice?* an HMIC report on police race relations carried out in 2000
- Assessing compliance with the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000
- Taking account of the relevant aspects of the reports following the murder of Surjit Singh Chhokar in 1998
- Examining the impact upon policing of asylum and immigration
- Assessing the influence on policing from prevailing international tensions
- Taking heed of any learning points from the instances of urban disorder occurring in northern England in 2001
- Projecting as far as possible the future of police race relations in Scotland, for the purpose of providing the best policing service to all the people in Scotland.

#### **Method**

To assist in the review, HMIC sought a wide range of views and opinions from the public, other organisations, and people within the police service. As part of the public consultation, a large number of individuals and groups from the community were visited and gave of their time to contribute their own experiences and perspectives.

Within the police service itself, all of Scotland's police forces were visited at length and provided comprehensive evidence on the developing state of their race relations. The nature of race relations is such that numerous police functions and services are affected and all of these were examined in each police force. Scotland's common police services – the Scottish Police College, the Scottish Drug Enforcement Agency and the Scottish Criminal Record Office – were also inspected.

In addition, many organisations from the public, private and voluntary sectors were consulted in Scotland, the United Kingdom, and abroad. Study visits were made on issues of asylum and immigration and on issues of polarisation and community cohesion.

HMIC would like to acknowledge and thank every one of the individuals and organisations who participated in the review. Their assistance, co-operation and welcome were of enormous value.



#### **Findings**

The findings from the HMIC review of police race relations in Scotland are detailed in full within the main report. These can be summarised as follows:

• Strategic

HMIC has found a great deal of progress on race relations has been made by the Scottish Police Service. Across Scotland and in all environments, people in the community offered praise and gratitude towards the police for the service they were delivering at a local level. HMIC believes the Scottish Police Service has significantly improved the strength of its race relations in recent years and this is an aspect of its service in which it is entitled to hold a measure of pride.

Pride can be a positive influence. Pride in the community, pride in cultural diversity, pride in being a welcoming nation, pride in delivering a professional service – these are all attributes to be pursued. In turn, pride must also be measured to ensure it does not turn to arrogance or complacency. Prejudice however, cannot be condoned in any form. By definition, prejudice is preconceived and therefore ill informed. For policing, prejudice will manifest itself at best as stereotyping and at worst as open discrimination. The future of police race relations in Scotland involves both pride and prejudice, working for the correct measure of one and the removal of another.

Whilst real and positive progress is acknowledged, there is much that remains to be done. Just as there were good examples found of developing race relations, so there were instances where police service and knowledge could have been far better. It is a reality that poor police service has an impact far beyond the immediate circumstances of that service. Complacency must never be allowed to feature.

Recently emerging issues are having a significant influence on police race relations in Scotland, making it a dynamic environment in which to operate. These include asylum and immigration, community tensions from domestic and international incidents, and the potential for racial polarisation in the community.

Given the sensitive interactions involved in policing, a propensity for tension in police race relations exists. Policing cannot isolate itself from a society in which racism, ignorance and prejudice remain harsh realities of this new century. It is the responsibility of the community and its police to continue working together for strong, supportive and sustained community relations.

Police Staff

The recruitment and retention of minority ethnic staff in the Scottish Police Service is improving with increasing numbers. This reflects the programmes of positive action which police forces have followed. However, the employment profile of each police force in Scotland is still far from reflecting the ethnic profile of the local population. Energies into this aspect of recruitment must continue. Positive action must be carefully utilised and the benefits of such an approach need to be effectively communicated to staff.



A comprehensive training programme in diversity awareness is being delivered to every person in the Scottish Police Service. The training is generally well received and appears to be having a positive effect on both performance and service delivery. There was little evidence of a long-term plan for such training and HMIC believes this should be developed to ensure the benefit from such training is sustained and updated.

The appraisal system for police staff should be improved to better reflect diversity.

An HMIC consultation event took place with more than half of all minority ethnic police staff in attendance. A clear desire emerged from this for a framework to exist for minority ethnic staff to provide a means of interaction, representation and consultation.

Police Service Delivery

The number of racist incidents reported to the police continues to rise. The number of racially aggravated offences recorded by the police has also risen and this is in line with police forces being able to demonstrate robust methods for ensuring such crimes are correctly identified and reported. Partnership arrangements and third party reporting initiatives for racist incidents have developed well across Scotland but the police should review such arrangements to ensure their benefit is maximised and that partners are able to fulfil their potential contribution.

The use of interpreters by the police has risen very substantially in recent years and this is a positive development in itself. To ensure best value in service provision, robust arrangements for accessing, delivering and monitoring quality interpreting services are now necessary.

Information provided to the public by the police, in both written and verbal forms, is critical in forming relations between the police and the community. Various documents of police information are now translated into common minority languages and placed in the public domain. An analysis of the needs of minority ethnic persons, with a particular focus on the needs of asylum seekers, is required to ensure the most relevant information is being conveyed.

Monitoring and Performance

The Scottish Police Service is now formally scrutinised on its race relations in a variety of ways, including self-imposed scrutiny through internal audit and inspection, HMIC primary, review and thematic inspection, performance indicators, public satisfaction surveys, legislation (Race Relations Amendment Act 2000), lay advisory groups and national steering committees. The amount of scrutiny is considerable. As many of these methods have been introduced relatively recently, they should now be allowed to establish and consolidate, with both the police and the community becoming adjusted to them. HMIC inspection of forces on race relations will continue to be mainstreamed into the routine inspection programme.



Community

Consultation between the police and minority ethnic people was found by HMIC to have progressed considerably in recent years. A range of consultation now takes place on both policy and practice through formal, social and personal networks. Most forces have implemented lay advisory groups on race and diversity issues, providing constructive but challenging criticism to the senior management of the force. More could now be done to develop effective networks with minority ethnic young people, minority ethnic young women and asylum seekers.

The prospect of racial polarisation in Scotland, and its potential impact upon policing, was looked at closely by HMIC. The public disorder experienced in towns in northern England, along with the subsequent inquiries, recommendations and outcomes which followed, are all felt to provide relevant background to community safety and community cohesion considerations in Scotland.

The assessment, management and response to fluctuating community tensions are areas where HMIC is recommending greater attention be paid. Elsewhere in the United Kingdom, skilled risk assessment of community tensions has become an effective and essential policing tool, worthy of further development in Scotland.

• Asylum and Immigration

HMIC found that policing across Scotland is significantly affected by asylum and immigration, with up to ten thousand people seeking asylum and an unknown number of illegal immigrants now resident. Strathclyde Police, with by far the most acute experience to date, has earned wide acknowledgement from both its public and its partners for the community policing of a difficult situation. Alongside the sense of pride that this force has in its achievements to date, there is equally a strong will to ensure no complacency in an area of policing that remains fragile.

As the complex issues and impact of asylum and immigration are unlikely to diminish, and may potentially increase, HMIC believes greater dialogue should take place at senior levels to ensure Scotland is as informed and prepared as it can be to assist in the management of this new dynamic.



#### **Recommendations**

HMIC makes a total of twenty four recommendations for the future of police race relations in Scotland. Some of the key recommendations include:

- Ensuring proper attention is given to community cohesion and stability across Scotland
- Broadening and deepen existing consultation with minority ethnic people, with a particular focus on those groups perceived as 'hard to reach'
- Improving levels of senior liaison and dialogue in Scotland on the issues of immigration and asylum
- Carrying out a needs analysis of information required on policing and related matters by minority ethnic people in Scotland
- Pursuing vigorously positive action in recruiting minority ethnic police officers, with an increasing focus on police support staff and special constables
- Fulfilling the desire for a minority ethnic police framework in Scotland.

Translated versions of this executive summary in Arabic, Bengali, Chinese, Gaelic, Hindi, Punjabi and Urdu are available from HMIC or on the web at www.scotland.gov.uk/hmic



#### LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS

#### HMIC recommends to chief constables that they

#### Police Staff

- 1. Continue to support positive action, but do so in a way which conveys an understanding of its value and implementation to all their staff. (page 20)
- 2. Vigorously pursue a national approach to minority ethnic recruitment, complementing local initiatives, and subject it to regular monitoring and review. (page 21)
- 3. Instigate an analysis and review of minority ethnic special constabulary employment, with the development of actions and targets under the framework of the *National Policy for the Recruitment, Retention and Development of Minority Ethnic Staff within the Scottish Police Service*. (page 23)
- 4. Instigate an analysis and review of minority ethnic support staff employment, with the development of actions and targets under the framework of the *N ational Policy for the Recruitment, Retention and Development of Minority Ethnic Staff within the Scottish Police Service.* (page 25)
- 5. Work collectively to ensure the national equal opportunity training strategy is vibrant and sustained within a strategic approach towards improving police race relations. (page 27)
- 6. Along with relevant stakeholders, engage and support moves to fulfil the desire for a minority ethnic police framework in Scotland. (page 30)
- 7. Review the existing police staff appraisal system to ensure proper account is given to diversity. (page 31)

#### Service Delivery

- 8. Review existing third party reporting schemes and racist incident reporting partnerships in order to make appropriate improvements. (page 36)
- 9. Instigate a review of data analysis and profiling on racial offending and offenders to ensure effective action takes place at both national and local levels. (page 38)
- 10. In the short term, review and improve existing processes for achieving compliance with Lord Advocate's Guidelines<sup>4</sup> while pursuing vigorously the longer-term resolution envisaged through ISCJIS.<sup>5</sup> (page 38)
- **11.** Along with relevant stakeholders, collectively engage in a Best Value review of interpreting and translation to ensure services are as effective as possible. (page 41)
- In liaison with the Scottish Executive and other stakeholders, conduct a needs analysis of information required on policing and related matters by minority ethnic people in Scotland. (page 42)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Lord Advocates Guidelines to chief constables on: 1. *Investigation and reporting of racist incidents*,

<sup>2.</sup> Assessment of language needs and cultural sensitivities, 3. Death reports and associated crime reports; Crown Office,

published April 2002

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Integration of the Scottish Criminal Justice Information Systems



#### Monitoring and Performance

 Consolidate developing methods of scrutinising performance on race relations to improve strategic analysis and review and to ensure there is access to information on ongoing performance. (page 55)

#### Community

- 14. Review consultation with minority ethnic people with a view to increasing its breadth and depth. 'Hard to reach' groups should be a particular focus. (page 60)
- **15.** Review their current response to endemic crime and concerns in their minority ethnic groups to ensure appropriate priority and response. (page 62)
- **16.** Along with the Scottish Executive, COSLA and other stakeholders, review progress on social inclusion and community safety within the concept of community cohesion, taking account of emerging findings from the Cantle Report<sup>6</sup> and related studies. (page 65)
- **17.** Individually consider the priority which community cohesion and stability has within their jurisdictions, and ensure robust systems are in place to give early warning of emerging risks and to deal with any contingencies. (page 66)
- 18. As part of the introduction of the National Intelligence Model, ensure it is used to maximum benefit to address issues relevant to minority ethnic persons. (page 67)
- 19. Consider the robustness of individual forces' awareness, training and contingencies regarding critical incidents with a race element and make any improvements necessary. (page 68)
- 20. Conduct a review of the Scottish Police Information and Co-ordinating Centre (S/PICC) in light of the introduction of the National Intelligence Model and developments in critical incident management. (page 69)

 $<sup>^{6}</sup>$  Community Cohesion: A Report of the Independent Review Team, chaired by Ted Cantle, Home Office (2001)



#### Asylum and Immigration

- 21. Work to enhance their liaison with appropriate agencies on matters of asylum and immigration to ensure suitable levels of liaison and dialogue at a UK national level on this fast moving and complex issue. (page 77)
- 22. Keep the Scottish Executive aware of demands that are being placed on the service as a result of the asylum issue along with details of the police response and its implications. (page 78)
- **23.** Ensure the ability to extrapolate information on racist incidents involving asylum seekers as victims, to allow analysis and action. (page 80)

#### Diversity

24. Take forward race relations as part of the wider diversity agenda whilst sustaining a focus on race relations that its inherent tensions and challenges deserve. (page 89)



## Chapter 1 Strategic Drivers

1.1

This report provides a review of police race relations in Scotland for 2003. The influences and drivers which apply are as numerous as they are varied.

#### 1.2

To a considerable extent, this report builds on the continuing response to the Stephen Lawrence Report<sup>7</sup> to which each police force in Scotland has implemented a response. At a national level, this was co-ordinated by a cross functional team of the Association of Chief Police Officers in Scotland (ACPOS). This team, which also comprised police staff associations and the Scottish Executive, produced and published strategic documents<sup>8</sup> which set out the future direction of the police on issues of race relations.

#### 1.3

In January 2000, the Scottish Executive convened a Steering Group chaired by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Justice, Mr Jim Wallace QC MSP. This Group contained agencies of the criminal justice system including HMIC, the police staff associations, and a number of independent members from a variety of perspectives. The Steering Group set out to oversee the implementation of the Lawrence Inquiry Recommendations in Scotland, producing and reviewing an action plan<sup>9</sup> on each of the seventy recommendations. The Association of Chief Police Officers in Scotland consulted the Steering Group on a range of developing issues including recruitment, training, complaints, consulting with communities, and dealing with racist incidents.

#### 1.4

There was an HMIC inspection of police race relations in Scotland in 2000. The resulting report commented *'while most forces had a race relations policy not all forces linked this to effective action. Not all policies were supported by clear action plans... Despite some obviously good intentions detailed policies mean little in a real life context if the principles are not understood and acted upon at street level.'*<sup>10</sup> To all intents and purposes there was a 'policy – practice gap'.

#### 1.5

Another key driver for this inspection, which originally came from a Lawrence Inquiry Recommendation, has been the implementation of the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 which has introduced a positive duty on a wide range of public authorities to promote racial equality and prevent racial discrimination. These authorities have had to prepare and publish race equality schemes during 2002. In particular the police service, which was previously exempt from many aspects of race relations legislation, now falls fully within the race relations legal framework with chief constables having vicarious liability for the actions of police staff. This inspection allows for an assessment of how Scotland's police forces have prepared for this legislative change.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Macpherson, op. cit.

<sup>°</sup> ACPOS Racial Diversity Strategy and ACPOS Racial Diversity Guidance Manual (2000)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry – An Action Plan for Scotland, Review by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Steering Group, February 2001

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> *Without Prejudice?*, op. cit., page 35

#### 1.6

The murder of Surjit Singh Chhokar in North Lanarkshire in 1998 is a critical factor in this inspection. The failure to convict the persons responsible, and the subsequent inquiries<sup>11</sup> into that failure carried out in 2001, provided learning points for the police as well as the Crown Office. Indeed, the Inquiry and subsequent Report by Dr Jandoo served as a trigger for the HMIC review of police race relations in Scotland. Although many of the points relevant to the police are covered in the recently published HMIC report on family liaison,<sup>12</sup> several aspects focused solely on race issues. An example of this was the call for effective ethnic monitoring within the criminal justice system – an issue which is looked at further in Chapter 4.

#### 1.7

In May 2002, ACPOS formally brought its business arrangements on race and community relations within a substantive standing committee, chaired by a chief constable and with senior representation from all police forces. This consolidated the networks and policy making groups which had evolved in response to the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report.

#### 1.8

There are also influences to this report which are less well documented within the Scottish Police Service. As far as possible, HMIC has tried to seek out the issues which are likely to impact heavily upon police race relations in Scotland in the future.

#### 1.9

The subject of asylum and immigration is covered in depth. This phenomenon has come to Scotland on a large scale only very recently and there are many connecting issues for the police which look set to develop and increase in the years ahead. Asylum and immigration is an area reserved to the UK Government under the Scotland Act 1998, as are many aspects of race relations. Policing of course is a devolved area within criminal justice and this potential dichotomy for police race relations needs to be considered further.

#### 1.10

There is also a focus on issues of community cohesion – a subject which is integral to the response by the authorities in England when dealing with urban deprivation – and one which is relevant in Scotland in complementing community planning and social inclusion.

#### 1.11

A timeline of the past few years illustrates the major policy influences on race relations for the Scottish Police Service.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See 1. Report of the Inquiry into the liaison arrangements between the police, the Procurator Fiscal service and the Crown Office and the family of the deceased Surjit Singh Chhokar in connection with the murder of Surjit Singh Chhokar and the related prosecutions, by Dr Raj Jandoo, HMSO, SP Paper 424 (2001) and 2. The Report of an Inquiry into Crown Decision Making in the Case of the Murder of Surjit Singh Chhokar, by the Rt Hon. Sir Anthony Campbell, HMSO, SP Paper 425 (2001)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Relatively Speaking – a thematic inspection of family liaison in Scotland, A Report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary, published by the Scottish Executive (2003)



April 1993	Murder of Stephen Lawrence
November 1998	Murder of Surjit Singh Chhokar
February 1999	Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report published
January 2000	Scottish Executive Steering Group convenes
March 2000	ACPOS Racial Diversity Strategy published
March 2000	Major dispersal program for asylum seekers begins in Glasgow
August 2000	ACPOS Racial Diversity Guidance Manual published
January 2001	HMIC publishes Without Prejudice? report on police race relations
February 2001	Scottish Executive Steering Group publishes updated action plan on the Lawrence Inquiry Recommendations
August 2001	Murder of Firsat Dag (asylum seeker, Glasgow)
September 2001	Terrorist attacks in United States of America
May 2002	ACPOS Race and Community Relations Standing Committee is convened
October 2001	Chhokar Inquiry Report by Dr Raj Jandoo is published
November 2002	<i>Race Relations Amendment Act 2000</i> is implemented in full with public authorities being required to publish Race Equality Schemes
June 2003	HMIC publishes Pride and Prejudice report on police race relations

#### 1.12

During its inspection, HMIC has found that a great deal of progress has been made by the Scottish Police Service. Across Scotland and in all environments, people in the community offered praise and gratitude towards the police for the service they were delivering at a local level. Indeed, unprompted views were often presented which suggested the police service was ahead of other agencies in the public sector in encouraging positive race relations. Qualitative judgement would suggest the policy practice gap is closing, albeit quantitative forensic analysis of progress cannot yet be readily demonstrated as comprehensive data gathering for performance indicators only commenced in 2002/03. Nevertheless, HMIC believes that the Scottish Police Service has significantly improved the strength of its race relations in recent years and this is an aspect of its service in which it is entitled to hold a measure of pride. HMIC will continue to develop the monitoring of performance indicators on race relations within the mainstream inspection programme.

#### 1.13

Whilst real and positive progress is acknowledged, there is much that remains to be done. Just as good evidence was found of developing race relations, for example in the spheres of racist incident response, training and community consultation; so there were also instances where police service and knowledge could have been better, for example in the use and application of positive action. It is a reality that poor police service has an impact far beyond the immediate circumstances and consequences. It is for this reason that complacency must never be allowed to feature.

#### 1.14

There will always be a sensitivity to police race relations given the potential for tension which exists between the investigation of crime and maintaining good public relations, and between working with other agencies towards the integration of minorities and the rigours of the immigration process. Racism, ignorance and prejudice in society remain harsh realities of this new century. It is the responsibility of the community and its police to continue working together for strong, supportive and sustained community relations.

#### 1.15

Pride can be a positive influence. Pride in the community, pride in cultural diversity, pride in being a welcoming nation, pride in delivering a professional service – these are all attributes to be pursued. In turn, pride must also be measured to ensure it does not turn to arrogance or complacency. Prejudice however, cannot be condoned in any form. By definition, prejudice is preconceived and therefore ill-informed. For policing, prejudice will manifest itself at best as stereotyping and at worst as open discrimination. The future of police race relations in Scotland involves both pride and prejudice, working for the correct measure of one and the removal of another.







#### Introduction

2.1

A separation is often made in police race relations between the responsibilities of delivering a high quality police service (e.g. responding to racist incidents, investigating and reporting racist crime, working with the community) and the responsibilities of police organisations as employers (e.g. recruitment, retention, career development, support networks, respecting diversity, a positive working environment). From an administrative perspective this can be sensible, as these differing responsibilities align themselves with different components of traditional police organisational structures.

Constable Steven McIntosh of Strathclyde Police, along with leukaemia sufferer Johanna MacVicar, helps the Anthony Nolan Trust with an appeal for bone marrow donors. Healthy bone marrow is essential in helping to fight leukaemia and more donors are needed, especially men and people from a minority ethnic background.

#### 2.2

However, for positive race relations to develop in respect of an organisation, it is crucial that the separate functions carrying out these responsibilities are able to merge and interact effectively. Sound race relations policies in police service delivery are extremely influential on the success of race relations in employment. So too are sound employment policies on race relations critical to service delivery. In simple terms, one cannot operate successfully without the other. HMIC was particularly keen during its inspection to examine how well police forces were able to combine these two elements productively.

#### Recruitment

#### 2.3

Minority ethnic recruitment for the police in Scotland is rising steadily and the indication is that this upward trend is set to continue. However, this will not happen without continued diligence and commitment on the part of the prospective employers. The composition of the Scottish Police Service is still far from representative in terms of ethnicity.

#### 2.4

Figure One illustrates the number of regular minority ethnic police officers employed within the Scottish Police Service. From 31 March 1999 (one month after the publication of the *Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report*) to 31 March 2003, minority ethnic employment in the Scottish Police Service rose by 82%. Clearly this is a positive trend and reflects the targeted recruitment activity undertaken by police forces in recent years.



#### Figure One: Number of minority ethnic police officers in Scotland

#### 2.5

Figure Two below shows the number of minority ethnic police officers as a percentage of the total number of police officers, as of 31 March 2003. This is set alongside data on the local minority ethnic population, obtained from the 2001 census information. Forces will wish to use the recently published 2001 census information to make further and deeper analysis of their recruitment and employment profile in addition to wider race relations needs.

## Figure Two: Minority ethnic police officers as a percentage of total police officers (as of 31 March 2003), set alongside local minority ethnic population as a percentage of total local population (taken from 2001 census data)



#### 2.6

The vast majority of these police officers hold the rank of police constable. Whilst this clearly has implications for the need for effective career progression, this must be set against the fact that a high proportion of minority ethnic staff have joined the service in recent years and therefore can only realistically be expected to hold the rank of constable. The future career development of minority ethnic staff (by rank held) is now a performance indicator for the Scottish Police Service and will be monitored closely in the years ahead (see para. 4.6). On 31 March 2002, of the 94 minority ethnic police officers in Scotland, 88 held the rank of constable, with the remainder comprising four sergeants, one inspector and one chief inspector.

#### 2.7

HMIC notes the positive initiative recently undertaken by the Scottish Police College, with the agreement of ACPOS, to undertake an analysis of the existing labour market, to assist the police service in making informed decisions on the issues of recruiting and training.

#### **Positive Action**

#### 2.8

The concept of positive action by employers in the context of minority ethnic employment is well established as good practice. It consists of:

- lawful action to assist under represented staff, for example additional training or shortterm secondments
- systems solely based on merit not ethnicity
- the creation of a level playing field for under represented staff rather than tilting the field in their favour.

#### 2.9

It needs to be understood that positive action is not the same as positive discrimination, the latter being both unlawful and unethical. Positive discrimination would be to implement a staff selection policy based simply on historical disadvantage.

#### 2.10

HMIC found the difference between positive action and positive discrimination to be generally well understood within human resource functions, as well as at senior executive levels.

#### 2.11

However, a significant degree of confusion was found across forces amongst less senior officers and operational staff including minority ethnic staff. A sound understanding of the rationale and benefits of positive action was appreciated by some, but there was sufficient confusion and negativity in this area to generate concern. Negativity on this subject has the potential to compromise status, welfare and morale.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they continue to support positive action, but do so in a way which conveys an understanding of its value and implementation to all their staff.

#### 2.12

HMIC found most force recruitment departments to be engaging in programmes of positive action. It was disappointing to find that one force had not progressed positive action, while other forces had allowed the momentum of their programmes to slow. Amongst the initiatives that had been undertaken were targeted advertising in specialist publications, presentations and networking within minority ethnic groups, plus having willing and appropriate minority ethnic staff interact with potential recruits.

#### **A National Approach**

#### 2.13

The debate on common police services has received much attention recently. It is not the purpose of this report to look at that topic as it is well detailed elsewhere. However, it is clear that recruitment, and by association minority ethnic recruitment, is one of those issues which has potential benefits to be gained from national co-ordination. The relatively small market place becomes shared as opposed to divided. There are financial benefits in terms of advertising opportunities. Staff, expertise and specialist resources can be combined.

#### 2.14

It is equally apparent that local networking by police forces for the purposes of recruitment contributes significantly to recruitment success as well as to positive police race relations.

#### 2.15

HMIC suggests that in the context of minority ethnic recruitment, the respective benefits to be accrued from both national co-ordination and local action are capable of being brought together. The possibility of a stronger and more coherent national approach on minority ethnic recruitment is very real.

#### 2.16

During 2001 and 2002, ACPOS developed a national policy<sup>13</sup> on minority ethnic recruitment. This was done under the auspices of its personnel sub committee and was put to wide consultation, including the various elements of the Scottish Executive's Steering Group on the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry. This extensive consultation gives the policy document added strength and credibility. It places robust expectations upon forces to deliver effective positive action and create a supportive working environment.

#### 2.17

Upon the policy document being finalised in mid 2002, its implementation was referred to individual forces for action. From a national perspective there would appear to be considerable scope to monitor its implementation and review the policy at an appropriate time. HMIC found no sign of this being the case and would urge chief constables to pursue collectively their agenda on minority ethnic recruitment.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they vigorously pursue a national approach to minority ethnic recruitment, complementing local initiatives, and subject it to regular monitoring and review.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> National Policy for the Recruitment, Retention and Development of Minority Ethnic Staff within the Scottish Police Service, ACPOS (2002)

#### **Special Constables**

#### 2.18

The special constabulary in the Scottish Police Service is an invaluable resource, with its members highly appreciated and regarded in the community and by the service across Scotland.

#### 2.19

It is clear that for regular police employment, the special constabulary offers a means for many people to consider further a career as a police officer. Some people wish to find out more about an organisation of which they know little, others may wish to explore their own aptitude and liking for police work, while others still may want to try to enhance their application to the regular police service. The special constabulary offers a real opportunity for people to explore these areas initially without the major commitment brought of changing jobs. In short, it can be an attractive way into the police for those who may be cautious and still have questions to ask. The potential for minority ethnic recruitment in this regard is obvious.

#### 2.20

The level of minority ethnic special constables within the Scottish Police Service has followed a less consistent trend than that of regular officers over the past few years, as can be seen from Figure Three below.



#### Figure Three: Number of minority ethnic special constables in Scotland

#### 2.21

The reasons for this low and erratic trend in minority ethnic special constables are worthy of further exploration. It may be recruiting energies in minority ethnic recruitment have been directed towards regular full-time police officers. It may be there are retention issues for special constables, particularly minority ethnic special constables, which need further study and possible redress. As of 31 March 2003, following a trend of general decline in numbers, there were 1,137 special constables in Scotland, with a minority ethnic proportion of 1.2%.



#### 2.22

One positive aspect to wastage in minority ethnic special constables is that seven of them have moved on to become regular police officers over the past five years.

#### 2.23

The subject of special constables in general is looked at in the recent HMIC report on police visibility,<sup>14</sup> which as well as commenting on the overall decline in special constabulary numbers, makes three recommendations on improving their use.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they instigate an analysis and review of minority ethnic special constabulary employment, with the development of actions and targets under the framework of the *National Policy for the Recruitment, Retention and Development of Minority Ethnic Staff within the Scottish Police Service.* 

#### **Police Support Staff**

#### 2.24

The range of employment activities for support staff in the Scottish Police Service is now considerable. The conditions and requirements associated with such employment vary substantially and therefore have the potential to provide an attractive career option to a wide span of society – far wider in fact than that those who might consider a career as a regular police officer.

#### 2.25

This range of employment will expand further as the role of policing develops. For example, Strathclyde Police is embarking upon a cadet and apprenticeship scheme and the deployment of police community wardens is being implemented in parts of England, with a pilot scheme also underway in the Strathclyde Police area.

#### 2.26

Minority ethnic recruitment for police support staff has also risen, but not as consistently as regular police officers. This is illustrated at Figure Four below. During inspection, HMIC found very few forces actively engaged in positive action for support staff and this may be a factor in the low increase. For the year 2002/03, there were 31 minority ethnic police support staff, amounting to 0.5% of total support staff.

<sup>14</sup> Narrowing the Gap: Police visibility and public reassurance – Managing public expectation and demand, A Report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary, published by the Scottish Executive (2002)







#### Figure Four: Number of minority ethnic police support staff in Scotland

#### 2.27

Within the context of minority ethnic support staff employment, it is useful to differentiate by job type as illustrated at Figure Five below. Clearly, most employment of minority ethnic support staff takes place within the clerical sphere, raising the suggestion that barriers or disincentives to employment may exist in other areas.

## Figure Five: Minority ethnic support staff in Scotland as percentage within job type, as of 31 March 2003



#### 2.28

Given the unimpressive rate of progress in minority ethnic support staff recruitment, HMIC considers this an area worthy of far greater attention.



HMIC recommends to chief constables that they instigate an analysis and review of minority ethnic support staff employment, with the development of actions and targets under the framework of the National Policy for the Recruitment. Retention and Development of Minority Ethnic Staff within the Scottish Police Service.

#### Training

#### 2.29

Training on race relations in the Scottish Police Service takes several different forms including:

- Diversity Training
- As part of training for a specific police role
- Information on ethnic customs and traditions

#### **Diversity Training**

#### 2.30

This comprises anti-discrimination training which challenges prejudice and personal attitudes, either by looking at racism in its own right or as part of a wider programme looking at prejudice and different forms of discrimination. By far the largest proportion of this training has been delivered through the National Equal Opportunity Training Strategy (NEOTS) programme.

#### 2.31

The development of a national equal opportunity training strategy for the Scottish Police Service began in 1998. This was influenced heavily by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report.<sup>15</sup> In 2000 specific training packages and lesson plans were drawn up and in 2001, delivery of the training, now commonly referred to as 'diversity awareness', began.

#### Figure Six: Percentage of staff to have received diversity training by 28 February 2003 (staff includes regular officers, special constables and support staff combined)







During the course of its inspection, HMIC looked at the nature of diversity training in each force and would make the following comments:

- Although a national training strategy, clearly each individual force is subject to its own particular circumstances and pressures, including the considerable financial and abstraction costs, which affect local delivery.
- HMIC found forces to be at different stages of training delivery.
- Force training packages vary from force to force.
- In some forces, the basic 'level one' training for all staff was of three days' duration, in others this had been condensed to two days'.
- Some forces used external speakers while others relied purely on 'in house trainers'.
- The use of external speakers from community groups enhanced the dynamics of the training, producing active participation and learning.
- Some complemented the training with distance learning packages while others did not.
- Some forces were training their managers first, others were not. The value of training senior managers first was emphasised in a recommendation of the NEOTS strategy.
- On the whole, HMIC found no evidence that local variation in training had led to a major difference in the quality of the training.
- There was considerable anecdotal evidence that the confidence of police staff in handling diversity issues was improved upon receipt of training.
- A simple but consistent observation during HMIC's regular and frequent interaction with staff in each force was that in forces where training was well advanced, staff attitudes towards diversity were more inclined to be healthy and positive. In forces where training was only just beginning, staff attitudes were cautious and more negative. Indeed, the few and disappointing examples of police staff with ill informed views were all found within forces where training had not been delivered to any extent.
- Most forces were scheduled to have all their staff trained in diversity awareness by 2004. Only one force went beyond this with training expected to run until 2006.
- Those forces which had implemented diversity training in advance of the NEOTS programme suffered no detriment and were well able to demonstrate their compatibility with NEOTS. Indeed, these forces had the early advantage of trained and informed staff when it came to handling diversity issues. In particular, Northern Constabulary had embarked on a comprehensive diversity related training programme, with the assistance of Grampian Racial Equality Council, long before the pressures brought about by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry were introduced. The insight and value which this Force obviously placed on such training is to be applauded.
- There was little evidence of a long-term plan for diversity training. Few forces had even considered the prospect of refresher training.
- Participant feedback from diversity training was generally positive. There were clear examples of feedback being used to review and develop training content.



- Evaluation of the training was being undertaken in every force area.
- Diversity trainers acknowledged the stresses and strains their role contained. However, they clearly understood the support mechanisms available to them, including an appreciation of the flexible measures which some forces had introduced to their working conditions.
- The national network of diversity trainers which had been developed was felt to be of real value to trainers as a means of support and sharing best practice.
- Some forces had worked hard to ensure that the role of diversity trainer was time managed to avoid 'burn out' and that there were also opportunities for trainers to develop their knowledge, skills and experience.
- Diversity awareness training will be delivered at the Scottish Police College to all probationers, following the implementation of the review of probationer training. It will thereafter fall to forces to deliver refresher training at a local level.

#### 2.32

HMIC was particularly concerned at the apparent absence of a long-term plan for diversity awareness at a local level. Without it, such training runs the risk of becoming a worthy but forgotten initiative, perceived by some in hindsight to have been undertaken as a quick reaction to satisfy political demands.

> HMIC recommends to chief constables that they work collectively to ensure the national equal opportunity training strategy is vibrant and sustained within a strategic approach towards improving police race relations.

#### 2.33

The strategy should set out how training in this area contributes towards enhanced police race relations, how police staff can sustain knowledge and skills gained from initial diversity training and also how further knowledge can be gained as new issues emerge and develop (e.g. asylum seekers). Clearly the development of this strategy will need to be informed by the diversity trainers and the feedback received from participants.

#### 2.34

HMIC in England and Wales has recently published a report entitled 'Diversity Matters',<sup>16</sup> following a thematic inspection of diversity awareness training. Tayside Police was involved in this inspection as part of a benchmarking process and is cited in the report as providing several examples of best practice. HMIC Scotland liaised closely with its counterpart during their respective studies and practitioners will find this report a useful additional point of reference.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Diversity Matters, a thematic report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary on diversity training of the police in England and Wales, published March 2003

#### As part of training for a specific police role

#### 2.35

Examples of this include training for Family Liaison Officers, Custody Officers and Police Managers. In this regard, HMIC found race relations inputs on role specific training programmes to have been reviewed and updated where relevant. This had occurred at both a national and local level. Custody officer training is a good example of this as issues of ethnicity and culture can be particularly relevant when people come into police custody. HMIC was pleased to find this type of training well adjusted to reflect issues of race and diversity.

#### Information on ethnic customs and traditions

#### 2.36

This includes educational inputs and reference materials on policing a multi-racial society, looking at the customs and traditions of differing ethnic groups. This can be classroom based but commonly takes the form of distance learning or reference manuals and databases. HMIC found that each force now has in place a modern and up to date source of information on its local minority ethnic groups. HMIC found this to be available to all staff, either in paper form or via force computer systems. The information covers issues such as customs, names, diet, death and local contact points. The provision of such information is intended to be dynamic in nature, capable of being amended and developed as circumstances change. Usually, these reference materials had been developed in consultation with, or by, representatives from local minority ethnic groups.

#### **Minority ethnic staff**

#### 2.37

The experiences of minority ethnic staff in the Scottish Police Service are of course critical to any assessment of the status of police race relations.

#### 2.38

As part of its inspection, HMIC instigated a national event on 3 December 2002, to which all minority ethnic staff in Scotland were invited. This included regular officers, special constabulary and support staff.

#### 2.39

The day itself comprised workshops to ascertain the views and experiences of those present. Over half of Scotland's minority ethnic police staff attended. A broad summary of the points emerging from the discussions was as follows:


#### 2.40

#### Support for staff

- Minority issues should be formalised within the Scottish Police Federation framework they need a far better profile and understanding
- Widely disparate views on the Black Police Association or equivalent
- Network for social/support activities a popular idea
- There should be no specific mentoring for minority ethnic staff
- Strong and informed leadership is critical
- Selection and promotion must be more open
- Lack of confidence in Scottish Police Federation on race issues

#### 2.41

#### Recruitment and career development

- Community misconception of policing as a career
- Police need to manage public expectation of its services
- Access courses and tokenism are damaging
- More than one (recruitment) solution for more than one ethnic group
- Personalise the recruitment process engage with public
- More numbers = positive image = more numbers
- Everyone needs to understand the process takes time
- Promotion selection should be independent and anonymous where possible
- Feelings of exclusion from the establishment can have a big impact on progression
- Attitudinal test on race issues in recruitment and promotion
- More monitoring of progression

#### 2.42

#### Removing racism in the police

- Chief officers must show sustained leadership on the issues
- Chief officers must understand and believe
- Education/children are the key takes time
- Clear grades of punitive measures and sanctions
- There should be a clear victim input to complaint and grievance processes
- Training must be consistent, have a lay input and be lasting
- Managers must create the culture of challenge
- Race issues must feature in appraisal
- · Specialist external body for police complaints



The full analysis of the consultation with minority ethnic staff may be obtained in hard copy from HMIC or at www.scotland.gov.uk/hmic

#### 2.44

To run this event successfully, it was necessary to have the support of individual chief constables in allowing staff to attend. HMIC wishes to record its gratitude and appreciation for the support shown.

#### 2.45

A clear message from the event was that there is a strong desire for a framework to take forward views, interaction and representation for minority ethnic police staff in Scotland.

#### 2.46

As well as the potential support benefit to the participants of such a framework, there is considerable potential benefit to the Scottish Police Service as a whole. Police training, police recruitment, community relations and personnel issues are all spheres which may gain from the development of a minority ethnic police framework in Scotland.

HMIC recommends that chief constables, along with relevant stakeholders, engage and support moves to fulfil the desire for a minority ethnic police framework in Scotland.

#### 2.47

HMIC consulted with UNISON, the trade union representing the largest number of police support staff in Scotland, who have a well established framework of self-help groups for women members, black members, disabled members and lesbian and gay members. There was a positive approach taken to these groups within UNISON at a national level. Those groups in which a sustained momentum of progress had been achieved were felt to be of most benefit, having a real impact on both policy development and support to staff.

#### Staff appraisal

#### 2.48

A recommendation in *Without Prejudice?*<sup>17</sup> was for chief constables to act to implement the undertaking given in the ACPOS Racial Diversity Strategy in respect of performance appraisal. This was to *'ensure supervisors make direct reference to appraisee's handling of diversity issues within the appraisal system'*. HMIC pursued this point with each police force, and also dip sampled a number of staff appraisals. A varied picture emerged with a general finding that diversity was still not being addressed adequately, if at all, within the scope of most staff appraisals.

#### 2.49

HMIC recognises the existing national staff appraisal system does not use the word 'diversity' specifically in its guidance on the appraisal competencies. However, HMIC contends there is still scope for addressing diversity issues within the staff appraisal system as it stands, particularly under the competencies of 'Relationships with Colleagues' and 'Relationships with the Public' where the guidance notes place an emphasis on fairness.

#### 2.50

HMIC noted that not all forces were continuing with the national appraisal system, and were instead developing systems to better suit local conditions and circumstances. The lack of focus on diversity and related issues in the existing national system was cited as one of the reasons why this divergence had occurred.

#### 2.51

It is clear that currently, at a national level, police officer appraisal does not properly illustrate officer performance on diversity. This is at odds with the importance of such issues in modern day policing. It also does not reflect the importance of, and huge investment in, training of staff in diversity. Long-term evaluation and management of diversity within the service will be weakened without a robust appraisal system to take account of it.

HMIC recommends that chief constables review the existing police staff appraisal system to ensure proper account is given to diversity.

#### 2.52

There is a link between this recommendation and the recommendation on reconsidering the appraisal process to all chief constables contained within the recent HMIC primary inspection report of Tayside Police.<sup>18</sup>







# Chapter 3 Police Service Delivery

#### Introduction

3.1

The primary issue emerging from the public consultation part of the Inspection was police service delivery. There is no doubt that the quality or otherwise of service to minority ethnic customers has a significant bearing on confidence in the police and the state of police race relations. This is not restricted to the way that racist incidents are dealt with, but extends to cover all functions of the service, from stopping speeding motorists to dealing with a housebreaking, and from taking a report of lost property to conducting a stop search procedure. Attitude and feedback were raised time and time again by consultees from a wide range of backgrounds as factors which they consider fundamental in influencing minority ethnic opinion of the police.

It was widely recognised that the experiences need not be personal and that bad service could be a particular talking point in the community. Many noted that when poor service was received the issue of racism was raised, or at least considered as an explanation. This view was endorsed during HMIC consultation with minority ethnic police staff. While this is an important point for all Forces to consider, the gap between general public expectation of the police and what can be delivered, as outlined in the recent HMIC publication *Narrowing the Gap*,<sup>19</sup> has a relevance here. The recommendations contained in that report offer practical improvements to general service delivery including that to minority ethnic customers.

#### 3.3

There are also other improvements of a more race specific nature which can contribute to quality of service, and thereby to confidence. These are outlined below.

#### **Data collection**

#### 3.4

The Inspection revealed that since the publication of *Without Prejudice?*<sup>20</sup> steps have been taken to improve the integrity of racist incident recording, with adoption in full on 1 November 1999 of the definition contained in the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report.<sup>21</sup> Numbers recorded have continued to increase across Scottish Forces (see Table below).



#### Figure Seven: Number of racist incidents in Scotland

<sup>19</sup> Op. cit. <sup>20</sup> Op. cit.

#### 3.5

While there is anecdotal evidence that this in part reflects an increasing confidence to report incidents on the part of victims, HMIC commends the research initiative currently underway commissioned by Strathclyde Police which seeks to distil the reasons behind the trend. i.e. increased confidence, an increase in incidents, or elements of both. It is anticipated the findings, expected in May 2003, will contain learning points for the Scottish police service as a whole.

#### 3.6

There is evidence that third party reporting (also known as remote reporting) can make a significant contribution to encouraging the reporting of racist incidents, for example as experienced in the case of those seeking asylum in Sighthill in Glasgow (see Chapter 6). This operates through partner organisations taking an initial brief report of an incident and passing it on to the police service for action. Third party reporting is developed to varying extents and in different ways across Scotland. The table below offers a broad outline of racist incidents referred to the police through established third party schemes for 2001/02.



# Figure Eight: Racist incidents in Scotland referred to police through a third party in 2001/02

#### 3.7

Given the importance of this methodology, especially in encouraging reports from members of the communities of harder to reach groups such as asylum seekers, women, youth, and older people, HMIC considers this technique is not yet being used to its full potential.



HMIC welcomes the fact that forces which do not yet have such a model are actively developing one, and that some forces where arrangements are already in place are seeking to review, develop and expand their schemes. Experience has shown that partner organisations require a constant input of energy and resources to ensure the successful operation and vitality of such schemes. Both sustained contact and regular training to ensure awareness and competence amongst staff are particularly important in organisations which experience substantial staff turnover. It is also important the police response to such reports is professional, thorough, and that the third party organisation is included in feedback.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they review existing third party reporting schemes and racist incident reporting partnerships in order to make appropriate improvements.

#### 3.9

This topic is revisited in Chapter 6 in specific relation to asylum seekers.

#### **Usage of data**

#### 3.10

While HMIC is pleased to note improvements in data collection, there was less evidence that the information being gathered is being put to use, either unilaterally or with partners, to inform response and action.

#### 3.11

While some forces do take forward basic evaluation and share this product with partners, this process lacks consistency in others. Now that the information available has improved considerably it is appropriate to ensure this advantage is exploited fully. Other sources of information such as racist incident reports gathered by schools and other council departments should also be considered, with partners, in terms of monitoring areas and informing appropriate action.

#### 3.12

Following directly from the expectations and recommendations of the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report<sup>22</sup> and the ACPOS Racial Diversity Strategy,<sup>23</sup> all police forces in Scotland have been working to develop a centrally collected, comprehensive reporting and recording system for racist incidents recorded by the police. This has been co-ordinated and led by the Scottish Executive and should provide the function necessary for analysis, profiling and action on racist incident data, looking at criteria such as time and day, location, age, gender, ethnicity, language and repetition. Data collection began on 1 January 2003 and regular publication will be a feature as the data is gathered and analysed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Op. cit.

#### 3.13

Most forces have in place a system of multi agency racist incident monitoring to consider general trends and specific cases. These have generated some joint successes but there remains scope in forces to reinvigorate these structures and ensure quality, consistency and standardisation. While HMIC noted a general acceptance among partners that multi-agency fora had been driven principally by the police, they also noted a willingness to participate more fully. HMIC suggests this goodwill is embraced, and new more robust partnerships be constituted and relaunched where appropriate.

#### 3.14

These data can also be a useful source of information to the National Intelligence Model which is fully discussed in Chapter 5 at paragraph 5.31.

#### **Quality of case reporting**

#### 3.15

HMIC also notes that since the previous inspection all forces have sought to *ensure that robust case management systems are in place to improve the consistency and accuracy of reporting of racist crime (Without Prejudice?,*<sup>24</sup> Recommendation 9). The number of offences of racially aggravated conduct and racially aggravated harassment recorded by the police are shown in the Table below.

#### Figure Nine: Racially aggravated offences reported to the police in Scotland



#### 3.16

While a considerable improvement in integrity appears to have been achieved, chief constables will wish to ensure probity through adherence to Recommendation 4 of Without Prejudice?<sup>25</sup> that 'once new race relations policies and procedures have bedded in, forces should carry out regular compliance audits with credible reality checking to ensure consistency of application'.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Op. cit.

While Recommendation 1 of Without Prejudice?<sup>26</sup> that 'chief constables liaise with the management of SCRO, to implement effective measures, to ensure that information on racial offending and offences is provided in a way which maximises the capture of information thus enabling effective analysis and profiling to take place on a national basis' has been achieved, this has not proceeded to effective action on a national basis.

> HMIC recommends to chief constables that they instigate a review of data analysis and profiling on racial offending and offenders to ensure effective action takes place at both national and local levels.

#### Lord Advocate's guidelines

#### 3.18

In April 2002 as part of the actions arising out of the Jandoo report<sup>27</sup> into the death of Surjit Singh Chhokar the Lord Advocate issued guidelines<sup>28</sup> to police. These set out guidance on the use of bail and custody, the recording and transmission of the impact of the crime on the victim, expectations on the assessment and provision of language need and cultural sensitivities, instruction on death reports and associated crime reports and the liaison with the next of kin and bereaved relatives.

#### 3.19

It is incumbent on chief constables to ensure through robust case management and regular compliance audit that the guidelines are being implemented. Compliance with the guidelines will ensure joined up working with the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service (COPFS) and an improved service to the public.

#### 3.20

Initial feedback from a monitoring function set up by the COPFS has indicated considerable scope for improvement. Implementation has been carried out very effectively in some forces but not in others.

#### 3.21

In consultation with ACPOS, it has been identified that placing the data required by the guidelines within the ISCJIS<sup>29</sup> programme offers a long-term effective solution which is being progressed at present.

> HMIC recommends to chief constables that in the short term, they review and improve existing processes for achieving compliance with Lord Advocate's guidelines while pursuing vigorously the longer-term resolution envisaged through ISCJIS.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Op. cit. <sup>28</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> ISCJIS stands for the Integration of the Scottish Criminal Justice Information Systems and enables information to be passed electronically between agencies within the criminal justice system.



## **Interpreting and Translating**

#### 3.22

HMIC noted during the review the numerous initiatives that have taken place in most forces to improve the provision of interpreting and translating services. This includes face-to-face interpreting services, interpreting via a telephone link, involvement in training and consultation, and the translation of written information.

#### 3.23

Information on the uptake of interpreting services, including reasons for use, number of call outs, languages needed and costs incurred was sought from forces. Some forces were able to provide such information going back several years and clearly maintained an overview of this information. Others were able to provide very recent data only and information on costs was particularly sparce or inaccessible.

#### 3.24

The use of interpreters is rising considerably (as illustrated at Figure Ten below, in which some approximation has been used) and so also is the resultant cost (see Figure Eleven below, also with some approximation used). HMIC strongly advocates that forces establish a comprehensive hold on management information relating to interpreting and translation to ensure the best available service is provided (see recommendation below).

# Figure Ten: Number of face-to-face interpreter call outs (for Fife, Grampian, Lothian and Borders and Strathclyde Police forces only)







# Figure Eleven: Costs of face-to-face interpreter call outs (for Fife, Grampian, Lothian and Borders and Strathclyde Police forces only)



#### 3.25

Forces have made use of partnerships, a rapidly developing private sector in Scotland and telephone interpreting to meet ever increasing demand both in terms of volume and variety. HMIC is pleased to note the emergence in some areas of service standards regarding response times and the qualification of interpreters. The ability to effectively monitor the quality of interpreting is now critical, for without this there is a strong element of vulnerability.

#### 3.26

HMIC is also pleased to note the degree of innovation that has been exhibited, including interpreters patrolling with community police officers in Glasgow to communicate with asylum seekers and refugees, and robust mutual arrangements with the United Kingdom Immigration Service at the ports of Stranraer and Rosyth.

#### 3.27

For both interpreting and translation, the scope for partnership working is considerable. There are a range of service users from the public sector who are keen to provide the best service they can in this critical area. They include the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service and other elements of the criminal justice system as well as local authorities. HMIC found examples of joint effort taking place at both local and national levels and there is obvious benefit in these now to be consolidated to provide a coherent and high quality service.

#### 3.28

HMIC believe it is now time to build on the progress made and ensure Best Value continues to be achieved. This should include recognising that the standards and qualifications expected, notably in relation to the justice system, will continue to rise as improvements become reasonable and achievable. There is considerable scope for Forces to learn from each other and other service users, as well as the opportunity to develop further innovative partnerships.



HMIC recommends to chief constables that along with relevant stakeholders, they collectively engage in a Best Value review of interpreting and translation to ensure services are as effective as possible.

## **Cultural and religious needs**

#### 3.29

HMIC noted the robust policies and practices in place to ensure that cultural and religious needs and sensitivities are respected, notably in issues such as persons in custody. This remains an area of keen interest and one where community members have expressed satisfaction with this improved respect and provision. In Tayside Police, HMIC notes the input on cultural awareness by the force's Diversity Advisory Group into lay visitor arrangements and welcomes the cross fertilisation of scrutiny and advice this offers. HMIC also notes the work which Lothian and Borders Police have carried out on the subject of forced marriages. Efforts have been made to improve the knowledge and response of police officers on this issue, with policies, procedures and a force contact officer in place.

## **Provision of information**

#### 3.30

Forces vary considerably in the information they have available in languages other than English. Distribution and display methods also differed greatly. Feedback to HMIC from its consultation indicated considerable demand for information not currently available about policing and the law. This demand is particularly acute amongst many refugees and people seeking asylum. Topics raised during the consultation included:

- What do the police in Scotland do, and not do?
- When is it reasonable to phone the police? When do I phone '999' or when do I phone the local number? What is the local telephone number?
- Can I carry a knife in Scotland?
- Why are young people who have committed serious crimes not kept in custody?
- What is the law in relation to owning a car and driving it?

#### 3.31

The demand for translated material appeared limited. By far the most popular choice was to be spoken to by a police officer at a meeting, using interpreters where necessary and supported by simple translated handouts.

#### 3.32

A strong point made during the review was the need for critical information relating to operational policing to be translated for concise and accessible use by police officers in directing members of the public. For example, the common law caution, road traffic requirements and basic information for an arrested person.





The thirst for knowledge about policing identified during the consultation was considerable and significant.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that, in liaison with the Scottish Executive and other stakeholders, they conduct a needs analysis of information required on policing and related matters by minority ethnic people in Scotland.

#### 3.34

This should include an assessment of language needs and accessibility. Support should be sought as appropriate from the Scottish Executive and others with a responsibility in this area. Police practitioners should also be consulted on the type of information to be delivered.

#### 3.35

Communication is a vital part of building positive police relations and investment in this area offers considerable benefit. Such a review should include consideration of the best way to communicate important information about the nature and accountability of the police service in Scotland, incorporating information about complaints against the police.

#### **Community policing**

#### 3.36

This Inspection confirmed the importance of the contribution of community officers in combating racism and promoting the development of race relations. Minority ethnic communities throughout Scotland highlighted this and HMIC witnessed some excellent work in numerous forces. HMIC notes the progress of Strathclyde Police in implementing (on 1 February 2003) a policy designed to monitor and control the abstraction of Community Officers from their primary role. This is in line with Recommendation 5 of *Without Prejudice?*<sup>30</sup> that 'forces produce and apply policies in respect of the duties of officers with a specific responsibility for community policing, with a view to controlling their abstraction from their primary role'. HMIC encourages other forces to adopt a similar approach without further delay.

#### **Police complaints**

#### 3.37

The number of complaints of racially discriminatory behaviour by police officers is set out in Figure Twelve below. Clearly, the number of such complaints has seen a general rise over the past few years, although there has been a marked drop of 17% from 2000/01 to 2001/2002. This decrease may be encouraging for the police and reflect an improving quality of service. However, it may also reflect the level of public confidence in the police complaints system.



# Figure Twelve: Number of complaints of racially discriminatory behaviour by police staff in Scotland





#### 3.38

There may be a link between the trend of police complaints in this area and the reasons for the rising level of reported racist incidents discussed at paragraph 3.5. A rise in the number of police complaints of racially discriminatory behaviour, whilst not welcome, may not be wholly negative in the short term. Likewise a decrease in number may not be wholly positive.

#### 3.39

The thirty four allegations of racially discriminatory behaviour by police staff in 2001/02 represented 0.8% of the total number of police complaints which forces disposed of that year. Table Thirteen below sets out how these allegations were disposed of, alongside the comparative proportions of how total police complaints were disposed of.

Figure Thirteen: Percentages for how allegations of racially discriminatory behaviour by police officers were disposed of, set alongside percentages for how all police complaints were disposed of (for financial year 2000/01)



Along with HMIC, chief constables will wish to continue to pay close attention to future trends and the reasons behind them. Examination of force records indicate the majority of this type of allegation are largely based on an attitudinal experience. It will be useful to see if the programme of implementation of diversity training to staff bears any relationship with police complaints in this area.

#### 3.41

HMIC was pleased to note within all police forces a strong resolve to deal both firmly and fairly with complaints of racially discriminatory behaviour.

#### 3.42

A particular aspect of the Race Relations Act 1976 is the expectation upon employers who are subject to a complaint of breaching this legislation, to respond with the completion of an RR65 questionnaire. Chief constables will wish to ensure that robust systems are in place to deal with these enquiries. Further information for practitioners on this subject can be gained from the Commission for Racial Equality (see useful web addresses).







# Chapter Monitoring and Performance

#### Introduction

4.1

Throughout the inspection, HMIC was reminded of the importance of ensuring policies translate into actual police services. Being able to demonstrate the translation of policy into practice is an important task for any police force and is critical for sustaining the co-operation and support of the community. This needs to be done in a way which is neither overly complex nor overly bureaucratic so it can be readily accepted and understood.

#### **Performance indicators**

#### 4.2

The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report<sup>31</sup> suggested areas for developing performance indicators on race issues. These areas were endorsed for Scotland in the HMIC *Without Prejudice?*<sup>32</sup> inspection of 2000. Consequently, ACPOS developed a suite of performance indicators on race issues during 2001 in close consultation with Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Constabulary, the Scottish Executive, Audit Scotland, the Commission for Racial Equality and the Justice Minister's Steering Group on the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry.

#### 4.3

A broad range of policing activity is covered – racist incidents and crime, partnership working and third party reporting, police complaints, recruitment and retention, career development and training. These subjects cut across the policing spectrum, reflecting the nature of work in racial diversity.

#### 4.4

In any assessment of performance, it is critical that key indicators are selected which can best illustrate how an organisation is progressing. For the Scottish Police Service this is achieved through the use of select statutory performance indicators. On race issues, the statutory indicators are:

- The number of racist incidents reported per 1,000 general population
- The number of crime-related racist incidents
- The percentage of crime-related racist incidents reported, which have been cleared up.

#### 4.5

This focus on racist crime as a key area of performance is right and reflects the impetus provided by Lord Advocate's Guidelines on racist crime,<sup>33</sup> referred to in Chapter 3. These are then supported by the suite of racial diversity indicators which have been developed and are contained within the Scottish Police Service performance manual.

#### 4.6

The suite of indicators on racial diversity came fully into effect from 1 April 2002 and will provide forces with information on which to inform future improvements. As the information available grows and is built upon from year to year, so should the Service's ability to identify, respond and improve areas of performance also grow. HMIC will gather the data and publish it regularly within their annual report.

<sup>31</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Op. cit.



## **Racial Diversity Performance Indicators for the Scottish Police Service**

#### **Racist incidents**

1. The number of racist incidents per 1,000 population

#### **Racist crime**

- 2(a). The number of recorded offences of racially aggravated harassment
- 2(b). The number of recorded offences of racially aggravated conduct
- 3(a). The number of recorded offences of racially aggravated harassment that are cleared up
- 3(b). The number of recorded offences of racially aggravated conduct that are cleared up

#### **Complaints against police staff**

- 4(a). Number of recorded complaints of racist behaviour per 1,000 staff
- 4(b). Number of recorded complaints of racist behaviour found to be substantiated per 1,000 staff

#### Partnership working and third party reporting

5. Number of third party reports of racist incidents made to the police through agreed multi-agency mechanisms, as a percentage of total racist incidents

#### **Employment**

6. Number of minority ethnic staff as a percentage of total staff

#### Recruitment

- 7(a). Applications received from minority ethnic persons as a percentage of total applications
- 7(b). Successful applications by minority ethnic persons as a percentage of the total successful applications

#### Retention

8. Proportion of exit of employment of minority ethnic staff against proportion of exit of employment of all staff

#### **Career development**

- 9(a). Proportion of minority ethnic officers in each rank against proportion of all officers in that rank
- 9(b). Proportion of minority ethnic support staff at different levels against proportion of all support staff at that level

#### Training

10. Percentage of staff trained to an appropriate standard of Diversity Awareness in accordance with the National Equal Opportunities Training Strategy



#### **Public satisfaction surveys**

#### 4.7

The Scottish Police Service has for some time carried out public satisfaction surveys within each force area. HMIC was pleased to note that police forces have recently amended such surveys at a national level to record ethnicity. This will allow public satisfaction of the police to be assessed along the lines of ethnicity and glean information which was not previously available. This should assist the police in directing their services as effectively as possible.

#### **Ethnic classification**

#### 4.8

The subject of ethnic classification has been a much debated area of policy development. The HMIC report *Without Prejudice*?<sup>34</sup> in 2000 made the point that the eight different forces categorised ethnicity in eight different ways, and called for a greater level of standardisation.

#### 4.9

In July 2001, the Association of Chief Police Officers in Scotland decided that where the police should be recording the self defined ethnicity of persons with whom they come into contact, then the categories used in the Scotland 2001 census should be used as a basis. Since that time, individual forces have moved to develop their various recording and monitoring systems accordingly. Consequently, a level of standardisation has been achieved.

#### 4.10

Pursuing the 2001 census categories as a common standard is a sensible step and allows for interaction with the published census results. Chief constables should stay alive to the debate and sensitivity around ethnic classification whilst preserving the standardisation achieved.

#### 4.11

There is deliberately a degree of flexibility afforded to local police forces in the detail of which ethnic categories they use. This allows local circumstances and local population issues to be addressed by forces adding 'sub categories'; for example, including Scottish Travellers as an ethnic group to try and improve the services that minority group receives.

#### 4.12

This approach does not provide for a prescriptive 'single list' that might go some way towards reducing the debate in this area. However, the importance of flexibility was endorsed by the guidance<sup>35</sup> on ethnic monitoring from the Commission for Racial Equality under the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000. This guidance recommended close adherence to the 2001 census classifications with local flexibility to local circumstances.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Ethnic Monitoring – guidance for Race Relations Amendment Act 2000, published by the Commission for Racial Equality (2001)

#### 4.13

There is a distinct difference between self-defined ethnicity and the police need to capture the physical description of certain persons with whom the police interact, e.g. missing or wanted persons. Information in this context is presently categorised within the codes prescribed by the Police National Computer system. The distinction between these two concepts is important and needs to be well understood to avoid confusion. Historically, the concepts had been 'merged' which was both inaccurate and potentially offensive.

#### Monitoring ethnicity in the criminal justice system

#### 4.14

A recommendation of the Chhokar Inquiry Report<sup>36</sup> by Dr Jandoo called for greater monitoring of ethnicity within the criminal justice system, to include offenders, victims and witnesses. This brings added focus to the ability of criminal justice agencies to monitor their services by ethnicity and thereby avoid potentially discriminatory practice. Crucially though, this recommendation calls for an ability of those agencies to exchange data on ethnicity. This emphasises the importance of standardisation as well as the need for compatible computer systems.

#### 4.15

This area is presently the subject of a scoping study commissioned by the Scottish Executive, the results of which are expected in spring 2003, and should assist Scotland's criminal justice system in providing monitoring of its services by ethnicity.

#### **Race Relations Amendment Act 2000**

#### 4.16

The Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 was a direct consequence of Recommendation 11 of the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report<sup>37</sup> which said:

'The full force of the race relations legislation should apply to all police officers, and that Chief officers should be made vicariously liable for the acts and omissions of their officers relevant to that legislation.'

#### 4.17

The Amendment Act achieved this and more, placing a general duty upon public authorities to actively promote race relations.





In Scotland, the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 has been introduced in stages. In July 2001, the general duty for public authorities to promote race relations was introduced. On 30 November 2002, public authorities (including individual police forces) had to publish race equality schemes setting out how they would consult and deliver on promoting race relations. Specific duties in employment and service delivery were also introduced.

#### 4.19

HMIC found that all police forces had produced and published a race equality scheme within the time scale set. All of these are in the public domain, produced to a high standard and approved by the Commission for Racial Equality. In all police forces HMIC found an extremely positive attitude towards the new legislation and the value of race equality schemes. A common view was that police forces were in a position of advantage having invested considerable resources into race relations over the past few years. Links with the community fora for consultation and awareness of the issues were already well established. For many practitioners, the production and publication of race equality schemes was a good way of encapsulating and formalising recently developed processes.

#### 4.20

HMIC found a strong sense of self confidence in police forces' ability to fulfil the duties under the legislation.

#### 4.21

HMIC acknowledges that such schemes are still in their infancy. However, there is one point relating to race equality schemes which chief constables may wish to consider further as they develop. In some forces it was not always clear from the reading of a Force's Race Equality Scheme, how the actions and commitments made within the Scheme complemented and linked to the force's wider planning process. This is obviously important to ensure as it places race relations at the heart of the organisation's values and is not seen merely as an 'add on'. Chief constables may wish to satisfy themselves that this link has been effectively made.

#### 4.22

The inspection framework for the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 has been developed by the Commission for Racial Equality, and HMIC will take an active part in this process. Compliance with the Act will be verified during the course of the regular HMIC inspection process, with a close involvement and overview being maintained by the CRE.



#### **External scrutiny**

#### 4.23

During its inspection, HMIC found that Scotland's police forces have taken an active approach over the past few years to engage and consult externally on the development of their race relations. This is looked at in depth in Chapter 3 but receives some comment here as such consultation has inevitably become a means of demonstrating performance.

#### 4.24

At a national level, police forces have collectively sought out views and suggestions on national policy as it has developed. These include broad strategic messages as well as specific subject areas such as recruitment, training, racist crime and interpreting. The range of the consultation base has extended from established police multi-agency partners to community activists and campaign leaders. As well as paper based consultation, there have also been visits to the Scottish Police College and the involvement of independent assessors on training courses.

#### 4.25

At a local level, police organisations have developed lay advisory fora which are now scrutinising police policy and practice in a variety of areas.

#### 4.26

The concept of providing critics with an opportunity to influence has not always made things easy for the police in the short term. Such consultation often slows down the time scale and inevitably throws up challenges and disagreements which need to be negotiated and overcome. However, HMIC found the longer term advantage from such consultation to be widely acknowledged and understood. An approach on race relations which has the involvement and support of the community is far more likely to be accepted and successful than one which has not. Indeed, an absence of such consultation has the potential to reinforce perceived barriers and hostility towards the police.

#### 4.27

During the course of the inspection, HMIC was often told by agency or community representatives that the increased level of consultation by the police was a prime reason for the strengthening reputation of the police on race relations. *'They are at least listening'* was an often used phrase in reference to the police. Clearly the very act of honest and open consultation has been a significant influence upon police credibility and performance.





#### Summary

#### 4.28

HMIC found the Scottish Police Service to be scrutinised on its race relations work in a variety of ways, including:

- · Self-imposed scrutiny through internal audit and inspection
- HMIC thematic and regular inspection
- Performance indicators
- Public satisfaction surveys
- Legislation Race Relations Amendment Act 2000
- Lay advisory groups
- National steering committees

#### 4.29

In general, the product of such scrutiny by these methods is placed in the public domain as is right. The amount and intensity of scrutiny in recent times has far exceeded that of other public services. Police professionals on race relations appear accepting of such scrutiny and recognise the importance of it.

#### 4.30

HMIC believes that monitoring of police services and scrutiny of police performance should continue to develop but also be allowed to consolidate. The performance indicators are new and by definition need time to elapse to allow data to be gathered and analysed. Many of the initiatives, particularly methods of lay advice, are new in concept for organisations and a degree of caution is appropriate in their implementation. A period of time to allow the various methods of scrutiny to settle in should now be afforded.

#### 4.31

In assessing performance in police race relations, it is important that a balance is maintained alongside other policing functions. A cursory glance at all the performance indicators for the Scottish Police Service is all that is needed to see that race and community relations issues predominate.



#### 4.32

Of course, the police in Scotland provide many varied functions and services for the people in Scotland. Race relations is an important part of that service. But it is just that, a part of a comprehensive policing service with a finite amount of resources.

#### 4.33

HMIC believes the high priority given to race relations in recent years has been correctly balanced and that continuous improvement must now be sustained. Equally, so must improvement in other areas of policing be allowed to develop and flourish.

#### 4.34

This report is the product of the second general thematic inspection of police race relations in Scotland in recent years. Race relations has also become a standing element of the regular inspection programme of police forces carried out by HMIC and is encompassed within the HMIC Annual Report. This process has recently been reviewed and updated in consultation with the Commission for Racial Equality to accommodate the long term approach to monitoring compliance with the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000.

#### **4.35**

HMIC considers that a more sustainable and robust regime is thus emerging to monitor performance on race relations and suggests the leaning should be towards greater reliance on this regular cyclical inspection regime than periodic thematic inspections.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they consolidate developing methods of scrutinising performance on race relations to improve strategic analysis and review and to ensure there is access to information on ongoing performance.







#### Introduction

5.1

A guiding principle contained within the ACPOS Racial Diversity Strategy<sup>38</sup> is the need to engage the community. This includes sharing information and concerns between the community and the police, creating focused and productive partnerships, and developing mutual understanding and agreement.

The people of North Glasgow come together to celebrate the North Glasgow International Festival – a police-led initiative aimed at bringing the community together.

<sup>38</sup> Op. cit.

57

During this Inspection, evidence was gathered across Scotland of a great deal of initiative and effort being devoted to this ongoing challenge.

#### 5.3

Key issues identified during the inspection for maintaining momentum, and incorporated in this chapter, are the strength of consultation and community involvement, dealing with endemic crime, and working with partners in pursuit of community cohesion. Also considered are the benefits of advances in policing, including the National Intelligence Model (NIM) and critical incident management. Tensions arising externally from international or national events, or internally from issues such as police attitude or police search tactics are also addressed.

#### Lay Advisory Groups

#### 5.4

Examples of consultation and interaction are manifold, with the majority of forces and the Scottish Police College having established Lay Advisory Groups. Visiting and meeting these Groups was an important aspect of the HMIC inspection programme. They were found to vary considerably in their evolution, composition and role, designed as they are to address local circumstances and needs. They are clearly proving to be a good source of ongoing advice and have made a significant contribution to most race equality schemes and numerous other race issues.

#### 5.5

It is recognised that while they have an important part to play they can only supplement much broader and deeper interaction with minority ethnic communities. However, their contribution and potential is significant and there is now benefit in Forces sharing the best practice from their lay advisory initiatives to ensure maximum benefit is accrued throughout the Scottish police service from this welcome advance.

#### **Consolidation of established liaison**

#### 5.6

Forces have also shown good initiative in consolidating most established liaison. This includes places of worship, community leaders, local Race Equality Councils, other local and national networks for minority ethnic people, businesses, community groups and individuals. Such liaison has been productive and was particularly useful in assisting the police response following the terrorist attacks in the United States of America on September 11 2001 in providing help and reassurance to concerned minority ethnic groups.

#### 5.7

While such networking is positive, HMIC found some inconsistency in maintaining contact and less than robust feedback to management in some forces. A standard approach utilising the National Intelligence Model is explored at Paragraph 5.31 of this Chapter.

#### **5.8**

Forces have been positive in dealing with the change brought about by the Commission for Racial Equality's modernisation of local race equality delivery. This has impacted massively on local race equality councils and significantly affected their relationships with local police forces. In some areas, the local race equality council continues to deliver a range of services, reflecting the strength, quality and flexibility of the organisation. In other areas, the local race equality council has ceased to function altogether. Efforts have been made to help minimise any diminution of service delivery to ensure contact and local joint working have been preserved as much as possible. It is in the interest of forces to continue to ensure the closest working relations with evolving race equality services.

#### **Development of consultation**

#### 5.9

There is a realisation in forces that certain key areas of consultation require to be improved. Inclusion of harder to reach groups and individuals within police contact and consultation has the potential to be very positive for police race relations.

#### 5.10

One such issue is the interaction with minority ethnic **youth**. It is paramount that forces engage with these young people who may have the most negative perceptions of the service and are important stakeholders in the future of Scotland. HMIC detected some shoots of progress in this area which require to be nurtured and developed. The whole issue of engaging youth requires some creative thinking but embracing sport, culture, and the emerging minority ethnic media offer some ways ahead. Regular face-to-face contact with community and other police officers of all ranks is also paramount to enable dialogue about controversial issues such as stop search, and police attitudes.

#### 5.11

Another group who often lack an equal voice is minority ethnic **women**. It is important for Forces to develop their liaison to ensure full account is taken of what women would wish from the service. The fact that this liaison has to respect cultural and religious needs and sensitivities does not preclude its importance and examples exist already that show the way ahead. Throughout Scotland individual officers have shown the quality and sometimes persistence needed to build trust and dialogue without compromising or offending any party. This deserves expansion because it is clear from the work done that women often have a significant need of police help or referral on specific issues such as racism or domestic abuse. This also provides welcome opportunities to express concerns about issues such as young people's conduct and wellbeing, drugs in society, and personal safety.



A more recent issue for the police has been the need to engage **asylum seekers**. This is considered in more detail in Chapter 6. Forces must embrace this challenge as asylum seekers can be amongst the most vulnerable people in our society. While consulting with this very disparate group presents particular obstacles in terms of their temporary status, disorganisation, language, culture, and previous experiences of policing, some commendable work has begun, assisted by a degree of organisation emerging amongst some groups of asylum seekers.

#### 5.13

It is also clear that the degree of liaison and confidence the police enjoy varies from one ethnic group to another, even amongst the more established minority ethnic population. It is worthwhile for forces to consider the robustness of liaison with all ethnic groups to ensure equal quality and opportunity. Given the considerable diversity, forces will have to employ a variety of approaches and emphases, treating everyone according to their need.

*It is no longer enough to treat people the same. People should be treated according to their needs.* 

John Grieve, Deputy Assistant Commissioner with the Metropolitan Police (now retired)

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they review consultation with minority ethnic people with a view to increasing its breadth and depth. 'Hard to reach' groups should be a particular focus.

#### 5.14

There is scope within all Scottish forces to build the product of minority ethnic consultation into the planning process. The Race Equality Schemes developed under the Race Relations Amendment Act 2000 require to be an integral part of force planning considerations and these are examined in greater detail in Chapter 4.

#### **Community involvement**

#### 5.15

During the Inspection a substantial amount of enthusiasm was shown by numerous members of minority ethnic groups to have even greater police involvement in community and cultural events. All expressed the view this could go a long way to building confidence and that officers involved should include senior and community staff. There should also be opportunities for officers who do not routinely enjoy the same engagement with minority ethnic people.



#### 5.16

Police forces throughout Scotland are already committed to such events but chief constables may wish to examine ways to broaden the base of involvement and to complement the roll out of diversity training with opportunities to experience it.

#### 5.17

HMIC was pleased to note in more rural areas and those with lower numbers of minority ethnic people that work was being done to promote contact and there was a general appreciation that if racism did take place in more remote areas then isolation could add to the distress. HMIC supports such approaches and suggests they be repeated appropriately to build confidence and ensure communication and support.

#### Crime

#### 5.18

During HMIC's consultation with minority ethnic groups, a great deal of concern was expressed about endemic crime in their community which people expected the police to address. A good example of a positive response to this issue is 'Operation Gather' on the south side of Glasgow in 'G' Division of Strathclyde Police. A unit consisting of six police officers operates in the division which has a substantial number of minority ethnic people living and working there. Their remit is to deal with issues (not just crime) which affect the minority ethnic community.

#### 5.19

This operation was set up in response to community concerns. It has been conducted with the support of the community with a good two-way exchange of information helping the process. The confidence and cultural awareness adopted have helped to develop positive race relations and improve confidence in the police. The focus has been on tackling endemic serious violence between gangs, fraud, and providing contact and reassurance to the community regarding rumours of right wing extremist activity in the area. The team's activity, with the assistance of witnesses from the community, has led to important convictions and prison sentences.

#### 5.20

During the Unit's three years of existence, only two complaints have been raised against members of the team, neither of which alleged racism or discrimination. During the Inspection positive feedback was received about Operation Gather as it was tackling real community concerns in a professional, sensitive and inclusive way. Consultees understood potential police reticence about engaging in work which might attract complaints alleging racism but were heartened this had not happened, attributing this to the police's professional approach and community support. The work of the Unit has been commended in a local newspaper read extensively by members of the minority ethnic community and witnesses have been encouraged to come forward.





While proactive initiatives always require ongoing review, scrutiny and support, Operation Gather is creating a virtuous circle of confidence, report and action which is an example of good practice.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they review their current response to endemic crime and concerns in their minority ethnic groups to ensure appropriate priority and response.

#### **Community cohesion**

#### 5.22

In the spring and early summer of 2001, there were a number of disturbances in towns and cities in the north of England involving large numbers of people from different cultural backgrounds and which resulted in the destruction of property and attacks on police. Part of the UK Government response was to set up a Ministerial Group on Public Order and Community Cohesion to examine and consider how national policies might be used to promote better community cohesion, based upon shared values and a celebration of diversity. At the same time a Review Team, led by Ted Cantle, former chief executive of Nottingham City Council, was established to seek the views of local residents and community leaders in the affected towns and other parts of England on the issues which need to be addressed about social cohesion and also to identify good practice in the handling of these issues at local level.

#### 5.23

HMIC recognises a wide raft of activity in a Scottish context on social inclusion, community planning and community safety. However, HMIC believes the findings of the Cantle Report<sup>39</sup> are relevant to wider considerations of community cohesion. Although they derive from a set of circumstances that differ in some aspects from the current Scottish situation, there are learning points that can inform good practice in promoting positive race relations and preventing negative conditions. The following extracts provide a flavour of salient points.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Community Cohesion: A Report of the Independent Review Team, chaired by Ted Cantle, Home Office (2001)

## **Our Findings**

Whilst the physical segregation of housing estates and inner city areas came as no surprise, the team was particularly struck by the depth of polarisation of our towns and cities. The extent to which these physical divisions were compounded by so many of the other aspects of our daily lives, was very evident. Separate educational arrangements, community and voluntary bodies, employment, places of worship, language, social and cultural networks, means that many communities operate on the basis of a series of parallel lives. These lives do not seem to touch at any point, let alone overlap and promote any meaningful interchanges.

There is little wonder that the ignorance about each others' communities can easily grow into fear, especially when this is exploited by extremist groups determined to undermine community harmony and foster divisions.

Some communities had responded to this challenge with vigour and determination, and had done so over a long period of time. This commitment was much less evident elsewhere or was not shared by the principal agencies and community leaders. Indeed, some agencies were not used to working together, or had not even met together previously.

But meetings are one thing, an open and honest dialogue are quite another. We found little evidence of such a debate and rather, a reluctance to confront the issues and to find solutions. It was evident that this failure ran through most institutions, including the political parties and even voluntary organisations.

In such a climate, there has been little attempt to develop clear values which focus on what it means to be a citizen of modern multi-racial Britain and many still look backwards to some supposedly halcyon days of mono-cultural society, or alternatively look to their country of origin for some form of identity.

Unfortunately, the programmes devised to tackle the needs of many disadvantaged and disaffected groups, whilst being well intentioned and sometimes inspirational, often seemed to institutionalise the problems. The plethora of initiatives and programmes, with their baffling array of outcomes, boundaries, timescales and other conditions, seemed to ensure divisiveness and a perception of unfairness in virtually every section of the communities we visited.

We recognised that some communities felt particularly disadvantaged and that the lack of hope and frustration borne out of the poverty and deprivation all around them, meant that disaffection would grow. Yet they were not always well targeted, nor even identified. For example, some black and ethnic minorities felt they were always identified without sufficient differentiation and 'problematised' as a result. Similarly some poorer white communities felt left out completely.

Opportunities are also far from equal, with many differences in real terms, in respect of housing, employment and education. Good practice could be found and obstacles were generally overcome where there was the will to do so. This was not always evident and the means to develop and generally spread good practice did not generally exist. The same observation can be made in respect of policing, where there was not only inconsistency but also in the extent to which they felt supported and part of a positive vision for the local area.





The Cantle Report includes sixty seven recommendations on a variety of issues including:

People and Values Political Organisations Regeneration Programmes, Initiatives and Funding Younger People Community Organisations Disadvantaged and Disaffected Communities Employment Political and Community Leadership Strategic Partnerships Integration and Segregation Education Policing Housing The Press and Media

#### 5.25

There is an important emphasis in the Report on the need to involve a range of agencies. It sets out *community cohesion* as the goal and provides an analysis of this concept in appendix C of the Report. HMIC strongly encourages ACPOS and relevant stakeholders to examine this thinking further.

The sociological work of Forrest and Kearns is used extensively in the Cantle Report to explain community cohesion and their summary<sup>40</sup> of its domains is given below.

#### Common values and a civic culture

- Common aims and objectives
- Common moral principles and codes of behaviour
- Support for political institutions and participation in politics

#### Social order and social control

- Absence of general conflict and threats to the existing order
- Absence of incivility
- Effective informal social control
- Tolerance; respect for differences; inter-group co-operation

#### Social solidarity and reductions in wealth disparities

- Harmonious economic and social development and common standards
- Redistribution of public finances and of opportunities
- Equal access to services and welfare benefits
- Ready acknowledgement of social obligations and willingness to assist others

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Forrest, R., & Kearns, A. , 2000, 'Social Cohesion, Social Capital and the Neighbourhood', cited in Cantle, p.13, op. cit.


#### Social Networks and Social Capital

- High degree of social interaction within communities and families
- Civic engagement and associational activity
- Easy resolution of collective action problems

#### Place Attachment and Identity

- Strong attachment to place
- Inter-twining of personal and place identity

#### 5.26

Forrest and Kearns also suggest that the simplest observable measure of community cohesion 'would be of groups who live in a local area getting together to promote or defend some common local interest' and the analysis concludes 'to achieve community cohesion everyone must be involved, not just excluded groups'.<sup>41</sup>

#### 5.27

Community cohesion is a term that has become increasingly popular in public policy debates especially south of the border. It is closely linked to other concepts such as *inclusion and exclusion, social capital, capacity building* and *neighbourhood*. In this way it has indirectly been a focus of a number of policies and initiatives aimed principally at reducing social exclusion. HMIC considers that community cohesion is worthy of deeper consideration in Scotland, to complement the social inclusion agenda.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they, along with the Scottish Executive, COSLA and other stakeholders, review progress on social inclusion and community safety within the concept of community cohesion, taking account of emerging findings from the Cantle Report and related studies.

#### 5.28

From the policing perspective, this would be a major strategic bridge in developing cohesion and stability within community planning and community safety.

#### 5.29

In addition to the Cantle Report, it would be appropriate also to consider the related Ministerial Group Report on Building Cohesive Communities<sup>42</sup> as well as the Clarke,<sup>43</sup> Ouseley<sup>44</sup> and Ritchie<sup>45</sup> Reports into the disorder in Burnley, Bradford and Oldham respectively, and the action taken subsequently.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Cantle, p. 75, op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Building Cohesive Communities: A Report of the Ministerial Group on Public Order and Community Cohesion, Home Office 2001

<sup>43</sup> Lord Clarke, Burnley Task Force 2001

<sup>44</sup> Community Pride not Prejudice – Making Diversity Work in Bradford, Sir Herman Ouseley, July 2001

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> David Ritchie, Oldham Panel, one Oldham one Future, 2001



#### 5.30

HMIC suggests there may be useful precedent in the Scottish Executive Steering Group on the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry report.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they individually consider the priority which community cohesion and stability has within their jurisdictions, and ensure robust systems are in place to give early warning of emerging risks and to deal with any contingencies.

#### 5.31

In contributing to positive race relations and building cohesive communities, chief constables will wish to include the recent advances in policing. HMIC considers the National Intelligence Model and Critical Incident Management to have particular value in this area.

#### National Intelligence Model/Critical Incident Management

#### 5.32

An important role for the police service to play within partnerships is the ongoing assessment of community tensions and management of critical incidents. The National Intelligence Model which is currently being rolled out to Scottish forces offers a sound model on which to base this work. Amongst other things it can ensure improved awareness of concerns within the minority ethnic community, and through good communication, evaluation and action, offer an improved service.

#### 5.33

The NIM is a policing model that has been accepted by all UK police forces as collective best practice to impact on crime and related matters. Although termed an intelligence model, it is more properly described as a policing model, of which intelligence forms one of the core strands. The NIM examines the core business of the police service, the outcomes desired, and gives a framework on which to achieve them.

#### **POLICE BUSIN ESS**

RESULTS

Manage crime Manage criminals Manage disorder Manage problems Manage resources

#### Reduce crime Control criminality Control disorder Ensure community safety Positive race relations



#### **5.34**

The NIM operates at three levels:

#### LEVEL 1 LOCAL ISSUES

The problems affecting a division or small police force. These will be capable of resolution locally, or with help from other resources. Problems can be minor in nature or involve serious crime, for example, murder. However, they are concentrated locally and can be resolved within the division.

#### LEVEL 2 CROSS BORDER

The actions of a criminal or other specific problems affecting more than one division. Problems may affect a group of divisions, neighbouring forces or a group of forces. Issues will be capable of resolution by forces, perhaps with support from agencies such as the SDEA, NCIS, UKIS or HMCE. Key issues will be the identification of common problems, the exchange of appropriate data and the provision of resources for the common good.

#### LEVEL 3 SERIOUS AN D ORGAN ISED CRIME

Usually operating in the upper echelons of crime or on a national or international scale, requiring identification by proactive means and response primarily through targeting operations by dedicated units and a preventative response on a force, Scotland-wide or national basis.

#### 5.35

NIM is supported by Tasking and Co-ordinating operating at local, force and Scottish levels. It is designed to generate more information and subject it to quality analysis to make maximum use of it and take better decisions.

#### 5.36

During the inspection information from minority ethnic communities and police staff introduced issues falling into all three levels, highlighting the utility of the NIM in addressing community concerns.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that as part of the introduction of the National Intelligence Model, they ensure it is used to maximum benefit to address issues relevant to minority ethnic persons.

#### **5.37**

The opportunity should be taken to ensure community and front line officers work to develop their extensive contact base and feed community concerns back into the NIM system for evaluation and appropriate action.



#### 5.38

During the review, HMIC noted Lancashire police in Pennine Division at Burnley had taken forward the NIM and had experience of its use in dealing with community tensions. The same part of that force also exhibits noteworthy practice in relation to the management of critical incidents defined as 'an incident where the effectiveness of the police response is likely to have a significant impact on the confidence of the victim, the family and/or community'. They recognise that it is most important that any potential incidents are managed appropriately in order to prevent any escalation of tension and/or disorder. Regular disorder risk assessments are produced which are used to negotiate within the Force for an appropriate level of resources.

#### 5.39

Examples of critical incidents in Burnley include events such as an attack on an Asian taxi driver, the murder of a football supporter and a forthcoming parade by a right-wing political party.

#### 5.40

It seems reasonable in Scotland to ensure the same degree of awareness and organisation, exploiting the advantages that NIM and Critical Incident Management make available. Scotland has already experienced a number of critical incidents including the murders of Imran Khan, Surjit Singh Chhokar and Firsat Dag, demonstrations and protests by minority ethnic groups, and action in response to fear of extreme right wing activity. Action was required to be taken in Scotland following September 1 1 2001 to lower community tensions and a considerable degree of awareness and reassurance was appropriate during the war in Afghanistan and in relation to other international tensions.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they consider the robustness of individual forces' awareness, training and contingencies regarding critical incidents with a race element and make any improvements necessary.

#### 5.41

Full regard should be paid of linkage to the NIM, and consideration given to the noteworthy practice from Lancashire Police.

#### 5.42

The NIM, incorporating Tasking and Co-ordinating and allied to Critical Incident Management, offers the opportunity to weave together influences from the local to the international on crime and security and ensure the appropriate response. Confidence in the police can be improved greatly when positive action is taken and seen to be taken to deal with community concerns.

# Scottish Police Information and Co-ordinating Centre (S/PICC)

#### 5.43

In response to critical incident management, S/PICC was established as the professional mechanism for inter-force co-ordination of specific operations. While S/PICC is a temporary structure for the duration of particular events, it has become an effective, standardised and consistent entity for collecting, evaluating and disseminating information and intelligence to appropriate response services. This ensures that regardless of the nature of an incident, negative impact on the life of communities in Scotland is kept to a minimum for the duration of such incidents.

#### 5.44

The use of the S/PICC following September 11 2001 was an appropriate and useful response which assisted Scottish forces greatly in dealing with the numerous challenges that resulted and it is an option which remains available. In light of developments through NIM and Critical Incident Management it may now be appropriate to review S/PICC to ensure full account is taken of these emerging advances.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they conduct a review of the Scottish Police Information and Co-ordinating Centre (S/PICC) in light of the introduction of the National Intelligence Model and developments in critical incident management.

#### Media

#### 5.45

In common with many other policing issues, public opinion on race relations can be affected by the media. Their copy, broadcasts and programmes can influence tensions and have to be taken into account in modern day policing responses. While the police certainly do not control and can only hope to positively influence the media, it is important for the police service to have a media strategy. Whenever possible this should be shared by partners and its aims must include the lowering of community tensions and the positive promotion of race relations.

#### 5.46

Interest in international problems, racism and discrimination will always ensure race relations is a top news item and forces must be prepared to play their part with both the national and local media.

#### 5.47

An important opportunity in Scotland is to work in partnership with the fast emerging Scottish minority ethnic media in order to communicate more directly with minority ethnic people.



#### **Stop search**

#### 5.48

Stop search is a shorthand description of a variety of powers held by police officers to stop and, where necessary, search people or motor vehicles. There are a range of powers arising from common law and statute dealing with drugs, weapons, firearms, stolen property and the carrying of alcohol. There is also the use of non statutory or consent searches, whereby an officer can carry out a search where they have received the subject's freely given consent. At a UK level, the police action of stop search can be a controversial issue, concerns being that it can easily be manipulated and result in abuses of individuals' human rights. It can become particularly contentious when the powers are used or appear to be used to target a particular group in society, notably minority ethnic young people.

#### 5.49

In 2002 the Scottish Executive Central Research Unit published a report on police stop and search in Scotland.<sup>46</sup> This followed research commissioned by the Scottish Executive in response to a recommendation by the steering group set up by the Justice Minister to consider the implications for Scotland arising from the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report.<sup>47</sup>

#### 5.50

There is a range of findings from this research. In terms of the overall impact of stop and search in Scotland at present there is little evidence that the issue has a particularly high profile. It was however noted that stop search is immensely controversial in England and Wales and indeed there was some evidence from the research that it is regarded in Scotland as an English issue. Overall, the number of searches recorded on minority ethnic people was lower then might be expected given their resident populations in the three areas studied – parts of Glasgow, Dundee and Edinburgh. No evidence was gathered to suggest people from minority ethnic groups are being targeted for stop search activities.

#### 5.51

Of concern was anecdotal evidence that many young people from minority ethnic and white communities appear alienated from the police, do not trust them, and feel they are being harassed. Poor examples by individual officers are highlighted in the research. There is also little understanding of stop search powers among members of the public generally, and in addition, in the view of police officers (supported by findings in discussion with community members) no real understanding of the operational issues affecting police officers which may lead to misunderstanding.

#### 5.52

There was also the suggestion of a worrying issue that some officers may be avoiding contact with people from minority ethnic communities for fear they will be labelled 'racist'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> *Police Stop Search Among White and Minority Ethnic Young People in Scotland*, Central Research Unit, Scottish Executive (2002)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Op. cit.

#### 5.53

The research is currently being considered by the Scottish Executive and HMIC looks forward to the outcome. Meanwhile, chief constables may wish to consider a number of issues:

- The lack of understanding of police stop search powers and related operational issues by the public may be an appropriate issue to consider as part of the overall review of communications with minority ethnic communities recommended in Chapter Three.
- It is also appropriate for chief constables to consider the method that could best be applied to gather information on stop search, including the ethnicity of the subject, should this emerge as an obligation. Experience in England has shown this to be challenging, with the inherent bureaucracy leading to issues of integrity and assertions of diminished operational effectiveness. There is also the issue of data which may lack accuracy and result in misleading information which may in turn have a negative effect on police race relations. Chief constables should seek a process which is simple, transparent and capable of supervision and audit to ensure full integrity.
- If full monitoring is not applied or if substantial delay is anticipated in creating a suitable system, then chief constables may wish to discuss with the Scottish Executive, a repeat of the research project to examine any trends, including any inference of discrimination.
- It is also appropriate chief constables consider the confidence levels of staff in dealing with members of the minority ethnic community. It was clear during the inspection that minority ethnic people wish, amongst other things, for police staff to be fully confident in their interaction with minority ethnic people and their issues. There was also comment from police staff that in certain circumstances levels of confidence could be improved. Officers were concerned about understanding the different cultures, giving offence, and the implications of complaints against them from minority ethnic people. Offering a practical model to combine with training, Operation Gather outlined earlier in this chapter is an example of good practice where this issue was addressed successfully.

#### Summary

#### 5.54

This chapter identifies strategic issues on race and community relations. Ultimately, police race relations stands or falls on the relationship between the police and the community. It is the critical test of all the policies, procedures and practices which police organisations undertake to strengthen their race relations. HMIC offers the recommendations contained within this chapter, particularly those on community cohesion, as the next steps to be taken.





# Chapter6 Asylum and Immigration

#### Introduction

6.1

While there are many challenges facing the police service in developing positive race relations, the issue of asylum seekers is particularly demanding and current. Throughout the United Kingdom the police service has been tested as world events have seen many people from a huge variety of countries travel to Britain seeking asylum and a better future.

#### 6.2

Scotland has absorbed significant numbers of people seeking asylum through both formal and informal dispersal as a result of UK Government policy to cope with the influx and ease pressure on London and the South East of England. A recent snapshot (January 2003) suggests up to 10,000 people have arrived in Scotland in the last three years to seek asylum. These arrivals have placed significant demands on policing, some of which are shared with other services and some unique. Included in the challenges are:

- Opposition to asylum seekers at numerous levels of society, often reflected in the media.
- The ongoing impact of world events.
- Changing UK Government policy in relation to those seeking asylum.
- Conflict between policies founded on integration and assimilation and the temporary status of people seeking asylum.
- The fact that immigration policy is a reserved issue and not devolved to the Scottish Parliament.
- Developing closer partnership with the United Kingdom Immigration Service.
- Increased immigration activity at ports in Scotland, particularly Stranraer in Galloway.
- Policing of the detention facility (at Dungavel, South Lanarkshire).
- The need for multi-agency working.
- The housing of asylum seekers in areas of existing social deprivation.
- Movement of people seeking or granted asylum throughout both urban and rural Scotland.
- The different size of the challenge between and within police forces in Scotland.
- The varying types of status which immigrants can hold, affecting their residential and employment conditions, including asylum seeker, refugee (granted asylum) and illegal immigrant.
- Appreciating the complexities and implications of the connecting issues, whilst avoiding an over reliance on individual force 'champions'.
- The demands of responding to numerous cultures and languages.
- Asylum seekers' perceptions of the police influenced by negative experience in their country of origin.
- Actual crime and racism experienced by people seeking asylum.
- Criminal activity within the community.
- Disorder and potential disorder arising out of critical incidents.

#### 6.3

HMIC is pleased to record that the asylum seeker challenge has generally been responded to positively by the police service in Scotland. This is true particularly of Strathclyde Police in Glasgow, which as the recipient of the large majority of dispersed asylum seekers to Scotland, is a city of strategic significance. It is estimated that some 8,000 asylum seekers/refugees are currently living in Glasgow, including 67 different nationalities with 40 languages spoken.

#### 6.4

HMIC also notes the preparatory effort expended in other parts of Scotland where strong consideration has been given (and continues to be given) to the possible reception of significant numbers of dispersed asylum seekers. Notable in this category are Fife Constabulary, Dumfries and Galloway Constabulary and 'L' Division of Strathclyde Police which includes West Dunbartonshire Council.

#### 6.5

It is part of the experience of Strathclyde Police that joint consultation with the host Council or other provider, and joint planning and preparation with all partners, are crucial to a proper response. This extends beyond areas of residence to institutions, notably the detention centre at Dungavel in South Lanarkshire, where Strathclyde Police again has sought to build secure contingencies. Asylum remains a very fluid issue and it is appropriate for the police service in Scotland to be aware of considerations, proposals and plans featuring Scotland.

#### 6.6

While asylum is an issue relevant throughout Scotland, it is appropriate to consider in some detail the challenge met by Strathclyde Police.

The recent history of asylum seekers arriving in significant numbers in Scotland begins in 1999 with 390 people arriving in Scotland from Kosova, many of whom were housed in Sighthill in Glasgow. The reception of these displaced people from a war torn area of Europe is widely seen as an exemplary effort of humanitarianism and multi-agency working, with local people playing a commendable part. This well funded initiative instilled confidence that a similar approach could work in the future.

Over a very short timescale this was to be tested, as world events caused hundreds of thousands of people of many nationalities to leave their countries and seek asylum elsewhere. Many travelled to the United Kingdom as a preferred destination. This quickly caused serious pressure on London and the south east of England where many of the asylum seekers alighted. This led to the Government creating legislation to allow for dispersal of asylum seekers to suitable locations throughout the United Kingdom, including Scotland.

As an interim measure, the London Asylum Seekers Consortium was established, aimed at securing and monitoring accommodation for asylum seekers outside London. Glasgow City Council entered into a contract with LASC to provide for 600 houses for families being relocated from London boroughs.

The contract quickly ran into various difficulties. There was an unwillingness by asylum seekers to travel to Glasgow. This meant that targets for filling units were not met and costs incurred. A small number of the arrivals in Glasgow also attracted very negative publicity by begging in the streets and engaging in criminality which received significant coverage in the media and had implications for the police.

The LASC contract with Glasgow City Council was terminated at the end of March 2000 with less than 200 of the houses having been occupied. The London Boroughs initiative was quickly replaced by National Asylum Support Service in March 2000 as part of the Government's response to managing the challenge.



Glasgow City Council responded to representations from the Home Office to supply housing to the newly created NASS and agreed to provide 2,500 houses (2000 for families and 500 for single persons) throughout Glasgow. This contract resulted in around 8,000 asylum seekers and refugees being relocated in the city.

In Glasgow the housing stock allocated to the project was in areas already experiencing considerable social deprivation. Problems followed quickly, many of which impacted on policing. Included in the challenges were considerable tensions between some members of the established communities and the new arrivals, crimes and racist incidents. General policing services were tested as well as there being the need to take into account language and cultural issues. Police responses had to take careful account of the needs and perceptions of host communities and those seeking asylum, as well as political and media opinion.

In Scotland, the policies and practices put in place by Strathclyde Police were tested to the full and had to be constantly updated and resourced.

A number of critical incidents occurred, including high profile serious assaults on asylum seekers which received national media attention. The greatest challenge to date occurred on 5 August 2001 with the murder in Glasgow of Firsat Dag, a Turkish asylum seeker. Subsequent demonstrations took place involving asylum seekers, their supporters and local people who were sensitive to the issue and criticism. The police response and sensitivity (including subsequently detecting the murderer leading to conviction) helped defuse the situation and assisted in a return to normality.

#### 6.7

Despite some progress since that time there is no room for complacency. This remains a very difficult policing challenge, with issues to be addressed at every level in Scotland. Strathclyde Police has complemented its Force Strategy on Asylum Seekers with a best practice guide encompassing the following issues:

Force Liaison Office Multi-Agency Response Force Strategy Document Intelligence Gathering Strategy Interpreting Informal Interpreting Third Party Reporting Translated Material Liaison Refugee Groups Divisional Liaison Officers Force Monitoring Group Training Guide Media Strategy Police Patrols with Interpreters High Profile Patrols Community Events Awareness Training Useful Contacts

#### **6.8**

These headings give a flavour of the comprehensive strategy employed by Strathclyde Police to deal with the challenge. Of particular note is the recognition implicit in the documents that asylum seekers form a multi faceted strategic issue which needs to be afforded the highest priority. Woven into an appreciation of the challenge must be the race relations dimension.

#### 6.9

During the inspection Strathclyde Police and its officers were praised by many of the organisations and people involved in dispersal and integration. This included numerous endorsements from asylum seekers themselves and established residents from the host communities. This is a credit to the force which HMIC would wish to endorse having frequently witnessed the good work, motivation and innovation of police staff during the inspection. The force is also clear that this area remains a very difficult challenge and again this was a universal theme amongst consultees.

#### 6.10

HMIC notes the commitment of Strathclyde Police to keeping both policy and practice under constant review. Elements of this report may assist in this regard. HMIC commends the willingness of Strathclyde Police to share its learning and practice with other forces. Forces have been keen to take up this offer, as they prepare with partners for potentially similar demands.

#### 6.11

There are a number of strategic issues, which if addressed could contribute to the response of Strathclyde Police and other Scottish forces in developing the most positive race relations possible in ongoing challenging circumstances. Some of these can be taken forward by forces themselves while others require substantial input from Government, Councils and other partners.

#### **Reserved issues**

#### 6.12

Immigration is a reserved issue within the portfolio of the Home Secretary and not devolved to the Scottish Parliament. Given this fact, it is appropriate for ACPOS, in liaison with the Scottish Executive and ACPO, to review links with the Home Office on the issue of asylum seekers to ensure they are sufficiently robust. This would allow for full information exchange and enable Scottish policing issues to be considered. ACPO in England and Wales has closer links with the Home Office on immigration, usually factored through the Refugees/Asylum Seekers Portfolio of its Race and Community Relations Committee. ACPOS may wish to consider whether it is prudent to seek greater involvement in this aspect of ACPO business, to ensure appropriate levels of liaison and dialogue at a UK national level on this fast moving and complex issue.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they work to enhance their liaison with appropriate agencies on matters of asylum and immigration to ensure suitable levels of liaison and dialogue at a UK national level on this fast moving and complex issue.



#### **Scottish Executive**

#### 6.13

While immigration and race relations may be constitutionally reserved to the Westminster Parliament, it is clear the promotion of positive race relations is very much part of the fabric of social policy development in Scotland with a strong lead from the Scottish Executive. Members of the Scottish Parliament have shown a significant interest in seeking to ameliorate many problems that have arisen, and a degree of both moral and financial support has been received in improving race relations. Indeed, in response to the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report<sup>48</sup> a Scottish Executive Steering Group had oversight of a wide ranging review of police race relations matters.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they keep the Scottish Executive aware of demands that are being placed on the service as a result of the asylum issue along with details of the police response and its implications.

#### Liaison with councils

#### 6.14

Forces are also encouraged to build on existing liaison arrangements and revisit partnerships with local Councils and the Scottish Asylum Seeker Consortium to ensure that representation is at an appropriate level. During the Inspection some opinion was expressed from both within and outwith the service that links at a strategic level on the issue of asylum seekers could be made more robust by enhancing police input.

#### **United Kingdom Immigration Service**

#### 6.15

A crucial partnership is with the UKIS. In response principally to the arrival in the UK of an increasing number of asylum seekers over the past few years, that service has been granted substantial increases in its establishment throughout the UK. In the financial year 2002/03, the aim is that funded posts in its Scottish region will rise from 106 to 167 with further increases anticipated. The increased staff have been used in pursuit of various elements of the Government White Paper *Secure Borders, Safe Haven*<sup>49</sup> including enhancing activity at ports and boosting after entry enforcement activity.

#### 6.16

Both ACPOS and ACPO have protocols in place setting out arrangements for police assistance to the UKIS. The level of such assistance in Scotland between 1999 and 2002 is set out at Figure Thirteen below. It should be borne in mind that police recording of this activity is still a developing issue and the figures used contain an element of estimation. It is likely that some police assistance to UKIS has gone unrecorded.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Op. cit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Secure Borders, Safe Haven: Home Office (2002)



# Figure Fourteen: Broad summary of known instances of police assisting the UKIS in Scotland





# 6.17

This call on police assistance has been increasing year on year, and with the enhanced enforcement activity by UKIS this may continue to rise with significant resource implications. The UKIS have a plan in place to train their own officials in effecting the arrest/detention of immigration offenders and failed asylum seekers who have no legal basis to remain in the United Kingdom. Contracts have been entered into with police training establishments in the UK, including the Scottish Police College, to provide training in arrest techniques analogous to those used by the police. It is anticipated some thirty-six to forty UKIS staff will have been trained at the Scottish Police College by August 2003. It is intended that UKIS officers will be accompanied for up to six months by police officers in a mentoring role. The long-term objective is that for routine enforcement activity involving the apprehension of small numbers of persons (up to three), this will be carried out by the UKIS staff without police support. For the apprehension of between four and 10 persons, police assistance will be sought, based on a risk assessment. For the apprehension of more than 10 persons, a police presence will be sought.

#### 6.18

Both the police service and UKIS acknowledge the continued need for close liaison regarding operations and for a thorough assessment of community impact before any action is carried out unilaterally or bilaterally. The ACPOS protocol with the UKIS is currently being reviewed by both organisations. HMIC notes the need for this joint liaison and operational activity to be carried out in a way which ensures full regard is paid to community impact and any risk.

#### 6.19

Following a model already used in England and Wales a police inspector has been seconded to UKIS in Scotland on a full-time basis to assist with liaison and joint working. This officer will be supplemented by the secondment of further officers whose duties will include the mentoring role outlined above. HMIC also notes that a limited number of further secondments may be sought from the Scottish Police Service as activity increases. These secondments are fully reimbursed by the UKIS to the secondee's force.

#### 6.20

Plans have also been advanced for joint intelligence work based on the National Intelligence Model involving UKIS, NASS, and the Scottish Police Service, to gain maximum benefit from close partnership working.

#### 6.21

While UKIS develops its enforcement capability and its pool of full-time police mentors, all UKIS operations will require support on the ground from other police officers. It is appropriate to consider the best source of staff for this task. There may be good reasons to exclude community police or other officers who are playing a major part in building relations with asylum seekers. Community police officers consulted during the inspection believe the roles are not easily compatible.

#### 6.22

It may be appropriate for chief constables to build on the protocol and consider further steps to improve understanding and promote joint working on strategy, operations and intelligence.

#### Investigation of racist incidents

#### 6.23

Chapter 3 on Police Service Delivery comments on the importance of encouraging those seeking asylum to report racist incidents, either directly to the police or through a third party. In Strathclyde Police the racist incident recording system is set up to allow 'asylum seeker incidents' to be extracted and evaluated further. This is appropriate best practice for other forces as consideration of the Strathclyde data reveals.

#### 6.24

Racist incidents involving asylum seekers accounted for 14.6% of all racist incidents reported in 2001/02. The detection rate for these incidents was significantly lower than that for all racist incidents (40.4% compared to 60.4%). Asylum seekers were more vulnerable to crimes of violence than other complainers in racist incidents. A simple evaluation suggests issues specific to asylum seekers require to be addressed. This would have been invisible without such separation of data. HMIC acknowledges the benefits to be gained from this approach.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they ensure the ability to extrapolate information on racist incidents involving asylum seekers as victims, to allow analysis and action.

## Third party reporting

#### 6.25

Evidence from Strathclyde Police experience suggests that a key initiative in receiving reports of racist incidents from people seeking asylum is through third party or remote reporting. (See Chapter 3 for a general introduction to this method of reporting.) There is considerable anecdotal evidence that asylum seekers are wary of approaching the police because of negative experience and perceptions of policing in their country of origin. There is too, an unwillingness to take any action which they perceive could influence negatively their claim for asylum (even 'inconveniencing' an authoritative organisation). There is also a widespread lack of knowledge about the roles and responsibilities of UK/Scottish institutions and how to get in touch with them. Third party reporting can make a significant contribution to overcoming these barriers and ensuring enhanced accessibility to police services.

#### Illegal immigrants

#### 6.26

A phenomenon, the scale of which is difficult to assess, is that of illegal immigrants entering and living in the United Kingdom. The very nature of their status means they will seek to avoid contact with any form of authority. Their clandestine existence makes them extremely vulnerable to organised criminals and unscrupulous employers who exploit them in various forms of illegal working ranging from prostitution to low paid labour.

#### 6.27

In carrying out its duty unilaterally or with the UKIS, the police service is bound to provide a quality policing service. This holds for illegal immigrants as it does for all sections of society.

#### 6.28

The best practices of thorough investigation, respect for diversity and a victim centred approach are particularly appropriate given such vulnerable victims.



#### Summary

#### 6.29

Asylum and immigration are key issues for race relations in Scotland, both now and into the future. Public service agencies, particularly the police, are having to ascend a steep learning curve on how best to address the myriad of issues that fall from having asylum seekers in the community.

#### 6.30

HMIC found that Strathclyde Police had earned acknowledgement and praise from the partners and agencies involved with the large influx of asylum seekers to Glasgow City. Where close partnership working had developed, the value of the police input was very highly regarded. Alongside the sense of pride that this force has in its achievements to date, there is equally a strong will to ensure no complacency in an area of policing that remains fragile.

#### 6.31

All police forces in Scotland must maintain an awareness of this volatile issue, know how it may impact on their area, and make necessary contingencies.









#### Introduction

7.1

In providing an assessment of police race relations in Scotland, HMIC felt it judicious to examine its place in the broader context of diversity. The question of whether policy on race relations should move ahead in isolation or alongside other related and mutually beneficial areas of work has been much debated. In terms of development, the focus has undoubtedly been race relations – a consequence of the large work agenda and pressure for reform which there has been in that area.

#### 7.2

However, HMIC found a growing recognition and desire to make the Scottish Police Service better able to respond to the concept of difference in the community. Perhaps the best example of this has been the implementation of diversity awareness training for the whole of the Scottish Police Service (see chapter two). Whilst race relations has arguably been a driving force in the implementation of the training, its content has always been wider, covering the range of minority issues found in the community. Discrimination and prejudice are tackled holistically in the training environment, with racism being an important example alongside others such as disability discrimination.

#### 7.3

The Association of Chief Police Officers in Scotland has recently amended its policy and decision making infrastructure to create a permanent standing committee on race and community relations under the leadership of a chief constable. This is significant in that it will ensure the subjects within its portfolio receive sustained and high level attention. It also provides an opportunity to consolidate and build upon the external links which have been developed in the era following publication of the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report.<sup>50</sup> Its portfolio has race relations as a significant component but also includes other important elements which reflect the emerging work agenda in diversity. The portfolios within the race and community relations agenda are currently:

- Race
- Asylum seekers
- Lesbian, gay, bi-sexual and transgender
- Sectarianism
- Disabled/mental health
- Gypsy/Travellers
- Older Persons' issues

#### Lesbian, Gay, Bi-sexual and Transgender (LGBT)

#### 7.4

HMIC found all forces working hard to strengthen links with the gay community. The ability to prevent and respond effectively to homophobic crime is clearly improved by having established links into that community. Under reporting of homophobic crime is a significant issue to be addressed, as the reasons for not reporting can be strong.

#### 7.5

Historically, the attitude of the police as an organisation towards homosexuality has been perceived to be less than positive. Therefore there is much ground to be made up to increase public confidence in this respect. During the inspection HMIC found clear evidence of positive developments in this area, with numerous good examples of police forums and consultation activity taking place with the gay community. Many forces had LGBT police liaison officers established at a divisional level. Most forces had LGBT policies either published or in the final stages of development. At a national level, a LGBT police liaison forum has been established for some time and has a gay community representative in the position of chair.

#### 7.6

Spokespersons of gay organisations were generally of the view that the police were 'getting better', although examples of bad service and displays of prejudice were still apparent.

#### **7.7**

Positive developments were also evident to HMIC in the recruitment, training and personnel functions of the police. In recruitment there were examples of targeted advertising. In training, local LGBT groups had assisted in developing training packages. For personnel issues there was considerable anecdotal evidence that LGBT issues were being responded to in a professional, sensitive, and individual-led way.

#### Sectarianism

#### 7.8

Sectarianism is another area of significant concern for Scotland which needs to be addressed. Quite how this should be done is the subject of much discussion at present. One notable connected development has been the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 2003 which amongst other things, enables courts to give statutory recognition to religious prejudice as an aggravation of a criminal offence. HMIC is also aware the Terrorism Act 2000 has been used to address aspects of sectarianism.

#### **7.9**

The Scottish Executive has recently taken a lead on this subject and published a report<sup>51</sup> on possible options. The police were one of a number of agencies who contributed to this report.

#### 7.10

What is clear is that the police must be a significant partner in any strategy to deal with sectarianism and HMIC identified a strong desire within the police to be part of that multiagency process. Any strategy will fail however without the full support of all the relevant agencies or if an over reliance is placed upon enforcement without due regard to education and social conditions.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Report of Cross Party Working Group on Religious Hatred, Scottish Executive (2002)

#### **Gypsy/Travellers**

#### 7.11

For all forces in the Scottish Police Service, the development of policy and practice towards Gypsies and Travellers has shifted from a historical perspective of public order to the more modern and less proscriptive dimension of race relations. This reflects the growing acknowledgement of travellers as a minority group that are widely subject to prejudice and discrimination within society.

#### 7.12

All of Scotland's police forces have updated and revised their policies towards Gypsies and Travellers, with stronger links and specified police liaison officers being established and deployed.

#### 7.13

Gypsy/Traveller issues are a key element in the diversity training which all police staff are receiving. One particularly effective training input which HMIC witnessed was in Fife Constabulary, where a member of the Traveller community spoke to participants. This had the immediate effect of reducing barriers, perceptions and stereotypes which may have been held.

#### **Sexism**

#### 7.14

Consistent feedback during the inspection suggested that despite significant improvements over the last twenty years, sexism in the service remains an issue. Many people contended that career progression and development of women in the police service was still weighed down by ill-informed views, speculation and prejudice in the work place.

#### 7.15

HMIC raises the issue as one which chief constables should continue to take cognisance of. There are strong links to the HMIC recommendation in Chapter 2 that positive action, if utilised, needs to be carefully implemented and properly understood by staff. Sexism was seen to be a significant aspect of the diversity training programme in all police forces.

#### **Respecting difference**

#### 7.16

HMIC is keen to support a view of diversity that does not restrict itself to the traditional 'isms' in society. Diversity for the police should be about valuing difference – both in terms of the police service delivered and in terms of respecting difference within the police environment. The world is a complex place and everyone is different. People are often likely to associate themselves with more than one minority group.

#### 7.17

Diversity for the police should be about acknowledging, understanding and challenging racism and sexism and homophobia and disability. It should also be about health, age, families, children, interests, diet, religion, sport, study, travel and any other aspect of human society in Scotland that might create different needs and issues for people when they come into contact with the police or come to work within the policing environment. The police need to be able to accommodate and respond to diversity as far as possible within the parameters of delivering a professional police service. A good example of this is the nature of the lay advisory group developed by Tayside Police. This embraces a range of issues including race, youth, women's issues and LGBT, conjoining them to multiply the benefit.

#### 7.18

That society has been guilty of creating and sustaining stereotypes is not disputed. The police have done so in the past with negative consequences. During the course of its inspection, HMIC found a police service that was increasingly conscious of the importance of neither creating stereotypes nor making ill-informed assumptions.

#### **Summary**

#### 7.19

HMIC endorses the approach taken by ACPOS and individual chief constables to widen its race and community relations strategies to encompass the broad range of minority groups in society. It also notes that police forces remain cognisant of the fact that police race relations has the potential to generate particular and acute issues which need focused and sustained activity to resolve them successfully.

HMIC recommends to chief constables that they take forward race relations as part of the wider diversity agenda whilst sustaining a focus on race relations that its inherent tensions and challenges deserve.



#### Conclusion

#### 8.1

HMIC found the Scottish Police Service to have been as active in developing race relations as in any other aspect of its work in the past few years, if not more so. The challenges thrown up by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry have all been taken on. Many of the issues have been substantially progressed, such as robust recording mechanisms for racist incidents, consulting with communities and ensuring staff are properly trained in issues of race and diversity. Others have been achieved in part and require further commitment to make them happen in full, such as a healthier recruitment profile and a positive staff environment on race issues.

#### 8.2

Significantly, all these challenges, even when fully met, will require lasting commitment and energy to ensure they are sustained and effective over a long period of time.

#### 8.3

Throughout the inspection, HMIC was keen to explore whether police race relations had improved from the point of view of the community. Consequently this point was taken up at the many community meetings and interviews which HMIC undertook. The issue quickly became condensed to the single question '*Are things better?*'. Wherever and of whomever this was asked in Scotland, the answer to the question, to varying degrees of qualification, was always '*Yes*'.

#### 8.4

There was one response received during a discussion on police race relations at a UK level, which argued that the question above was fatuous. It was contended that the word 'better' was only relevant to those people who are interested in history lessons and that issues affecting people in Scotland, particularly relating to race and racism, are about the here and now. The point was well made that daily racist abuse is daily racist abuse, and whether or not the police are proud of themselves on progress achieved over the past few years is of little importance.

#### 8.5

But the strongest message that HMIC would wish to make from this report is that police race relations are dynamic. Things have moved on considerably over the past few years and major new issues for Scotland have emerged, most notably those of community cohesion, international events and asylum seekers. The challenges of yesterday are not the same as the challenges of today or the challenges of tomorrow.

#### 8.6

Chief constables now need to consolidate on progress and look to the future to ensure Scotland remains a peaceful, fair and integrated community. Sound race relations have been a policing priority and must continue to be so. The Scottish Police Service should take a correct sense of pride in areas where achievements have been made and work towards a plural and cohesive community where prejudice is not tolerated.



#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

HMIC is grateful to the many people, community groups and organisations who contributed to this review of police race relations in Scotland. First and foremost, HMIC would acknowledge the police forces of Scotland and their staff who so willingly put themselves up for detailed scrutiny. In addition, police board members and lay advisors from each force provided invaluable information and assistance to HMIC.

HMIC would particularly like to thank the following individuals and organisations for their assistance:

Anderson Mel Milap Centre, Glasgow Association of Indian Organisations **Black Police Association** British Transport Police, Waterloo, London Burnley Police, Pennine Division, Lancashire Constabulary Chhokar Family Justice Campaign Councillor Hanzala Malik, Glasgow City Council Crown Office Mr Dilawer Singh East Pollockshields Multi-cultural Centre, Glasgow (Ismut Choudry) Dr Elinor Kelly The forum of minority ethnic police staff **Glasgow Asylum Seekers Support Project Glasgow Central Mosque Glasgow Council of Voluntary Services** Mr Mike Franklin La Police Aux Frontières, Calais Mr Peter MacLean The people of Sighthill and Red Road, Glasgow Positive Action in Housing Premier Security, Dungavel Burgh Primary School, Rutherglen Scottish Asylum Seekers Consortium Scottish Refugee Council Shanti Bhaban (Hindu Mandir), Glasgow (Mrs Ravinder Kainth) Stonewall Scotland Mr Tony Smikel UNISON **United Kingdom Immigration Service** 

#### **EXAMPLES OF NOTEWORTHY PRACTICE**

Whilst HMIC found numerous instances of noteworthy practice, the following examples illustrate the range and depth of progress in race relations which is being made by forces. It should be borne in mind that other forces often shared the noteworthy practice cited – only one force is mentioned for the sake of example.

#### **Strategic Drivers**

Central Scotland Police displayed a robust project management approach to its race relations. This allowed the numerous influences, recommendations, reports and pressures to be brought together within in a coherent approach. Links were able to be made, objectives set, and policy practitioners held a strong grasp of what was being achieved and why.

#### **Police Staff**

As part of its diversity awareness training programme, Fife Constabulary place considerable investment in the provision of an external input from representatives of minority groups. The engagement and discussion this provided in the classroom environment clearly enthused the participants and created a positive learning experience. It is of note that a key trainer from that force is now assisting the Crown Office Procurator Fiscal Service with its own training programme.

#### **Police Service Delivery**

Grampian Police showed a sophisticated and rigorous system for managing, auditing and overerseeing the police response to racist incidents. Where a crime had been committed, checks were in place to ensure the correct offences were being recorded, with feedback being provided to officers where necessary. In addition, a robust approach for reporting racist crime to the Procurator Fiscal was in place, with such offence reports being fast tracked in their submission.

#### **Monitoring and Performance**

Lothian and Borders Police took the lead in developing preparation and compliance with the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. Early scoping took place when the potential implications of the legislation became known, allowing all police forces in Scotland to have early notice of its impact. The Race Equality Scheme produced as part of the Act was done in close consultation with stakeholders, particularly the Commission for Racial Equality.

## Community

Strathclyde Police has faced very particular issues on its race relations in recent times, strongly influenced by the huge influx of asylum seekers to Glasgow City. The consequences of this have been numerous and varied, with strong community feeling at times creating a real tension for the police to deal with. The response, particularly in the Sighthill area of Glasgow, has been one which encourages and promotes a cohesive community. Initiatives such as the North Glasgow International Festival are clearly of enormous benefit. HMIC found the officers working in the areas most affected to be absolutely committed to the whole community, showing compassion and giving assistance in difficult circumstances.

#### **Asylum and Immigration**

Dumfries and Galloway Constabulary displayed the effectiveness of its telephone interpreting service when a detective officer came across a person who spoke no English, had almost no personal possessions, had no residence or status, and had recently entered the country. Despite the circumstances – in the early hours of the morning and in cold and isolated conditions – that officer was able to communicate very quickly at a basic level in a way that allowed understanding and assistance to be provided by the police.

#### **Diversity**

Tayside Police, in developing a lay advisory group for the force, decided early on to ensure that wider diversity issues would be its remit. In addition, the independence of their lay advisors, together with their ability to constructively challenge, were seen as critical factors. This has meant the group is able to engage productivel on a variety of issues, with particular benefit being brought to those issues which impact on more than one minority group. A sub structure has now developed, allowing specialism and a greater work agenda to flourish.

#### SOME USEFUL WEB ADDRESSES

#### ACPOS

www.scottish.police.uk/main/acpos

Scottish Executive Social Research (for a wide range of related publications and research documents, including stop and search) www.scotland.gov.uk/cru

Commission for Racial Equality (for a wide range of information on race relations, including the use of the RR65 questionnaire) www.cre.gov.uk/

Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service www.crownoffice.gov.uk/

General Register Office for Scotland (for 2001 census information) www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/

Grampian Racial Equality Council www.grec.co.uk/

HMIC (for all HMIC publications and a range of statistical information) www.scotland.gov.uk/hmic

Home Office (for a wide range of information, including community cohesion and immigration)

www.homeoffice.gov.uk/

OXFAM (for reports on particular asylum issues in Glasgow and other topics) www.oxfam.org.uk/policy/papers/asylumscoto1/asylum.htm

Scottish police forces website (for access to the websites of all police forces and related organisations)

www.scottish.police.uk/

Scottish Refugee Council www.scottishrefugeecouncil.org.uk/



#### **GLOSSARY OF TERMS**

- ACPO Association of Chief Police Officers (England and Wales) ACPOS Association of Chief Police Officers in Scotland **BPA Black Police Association** BTP **British Transport Police** Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service COPFS COSLA **Convention of Scottish Local Authorities** CRE Commission for Racial Equality HMCE Her Majesty's Customs and Excise HMIC Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary **HMSO** Her Majesty's Stationery Office ISCJIS Integration of the Scottish Criminal Justice Information Systems LASC London Asylum Seekers Consortium LGBT Lesbian, Gay, Bi-sexual and Transgender MSP Member of the Scottish Parliament NASS National Asylum Support Service NCIS National Criminal Intelligence Service **NEOTS** National Equal Opportunities Training Strategy National Intelligence Model NIM QC Queen's Counsel Scottish Criminal Record Office SCRO SDEA Scottish Drug Enforcement Agency S/PICC Scottish Police Information and Co-ordinating Centre
- UK United Kingdom
- UKIS United Kingdom Immigration Service

Further copies of this report are available from

The Stationery Office Bookshop 71 Lothian Road · Edinburgh EH3 9AZ Tel 0870 606 5566

© Crown Copyright 2003 Astron B27759 6/03 This pages of this document are produced from 100% Elemental Chlorine Free, environmentally preferred material and are 100% recyclable.



