

# Recent Migration into Scotland: the Evidence Base

# **RECENT MIGRATION INTO SCOTLAND: THE EVIDENCE BASE**

**Heather Rolfe and Hilary Metcalf  
National Institute of Economic and Social Research**

**Scottish Government Social Research  
2009**

This report is available on the Scottish Government Social Research website only [www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch).

**The views expressed in this report are those of the researcher and do not necessarily represent those of the Scottish Government or Scottish Ministers.**

© Crown Copyright 2009

Limited extracts from the text may be produced provided the source is acknowledged. For more extensive reproduction, please write to the Chief Researcher at Office of Chief Researcher,  
4<sup>th</sup> Floor West Rear, St Andrew's House, Edinburgh EH1 3DG

## **Acknowledgements**

To produce this report we have relied on the input of a large team of researchers and policy analysts in the Scottish Government and local authorities. We would especially like to thank the Scottish Government and General Registrar of Scotland analysts who managed the research project at the Scottish Government and provided guidance and support at all stages of the research.

We would like to thank Derek Mitchell at COSLA for his input and assistance in contacting local authorities. Within these organisations thanks are due to the following: Andrew Ballingall Fife Council, Tammy Brown Clackmannanshire Council, Sue Bruce East Dunbartonshire Council, Chris Carr Argyll and Bute Council, Dawn Corbett Glasgow City Council, Effie Dickson Aberdeenshire Council, Christopher Doyle South Ayrshire Council, Paula Falconer Aberdeen City Council, Stephen Fraser North Lanarkshire Council, Shelley Hague Perth and Kinross Council, Carron McDiarmid Highland Council Evelyn MacKenzie City of Edinburgh Council, Les McLean Glasgow City Council, Douglas Scott Scottish Borders Council, Grace Scott East Renfrewshire Council, Fiona Simpson the Moray Council and Roger White Aberdeenshire Council.

We would also like to thank Ross Brown at Scottish Enterprise, Susan Hendry at Health Scotland and our colleague at NIESR Amar Dhudwar.

# Contents

Report Summary.....	i
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION: MIGRATION AS A POLICY ISSUE FOR SCOTLAND .....	1
Background: recent migration into Scotland .....	1
The evidence review .....	2
Structure of the report .....	3
CHAPTER 2. MIGRATION: STATISTICAL SOURCES .....	5
Introduction .....	5
Sources of data .....	8
Shortcomings of data .....	10
Moves to improve data .....	10
CHAPTER 3. ECONOMIC AND EMPLOYMENT IMPACTS.....	13
Macro-economic effects of migration.....	13
Employers' use of migrant labour .....	14
The supply of migrants and the migrant experience.....	18
CHAPTER 4. SOCIAL IMPACTS.....	22
Public services: general reviews .....	22
Housing .....	24
Schools and children .....	28
Health.....	31
ESOL.....	34
Community cohesion and equalities.....	36
Crime and justice.....	39
Rural localities .....	40
Higher education and Fresh Talent .....	41
CHAPTER 5. CONCLUSIONS: THE IMPACT OF MIGRATION INTO SCOTLAND .....	44
Limitations of data sources and studies .....	44
Gaps in evidence.....	45
The future.....	48
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	50
Appendix A: Details of datasets identifying migrants .....	64
Appendix B: Key studies included in the review.....	64

# Report Summary

## The review

Migration has a key role to play in meeting Scottish Government targets in its Economic Strategy. Migration can also increase demand for services such as health, housing and education. This report therefore reviews evidence on the impact of migration into Scotland since 2004, when the accession of the A8 countries - Poland, Lithuania, Estonia, Latvia, Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary and Slovenia - to the European Union resulted in increased migration into the UK. The review also includes available evidence in relation to other groups, including asylum seekers and refugees.

The review uses evidence from a range of published and unpublished sources, including datasets, surveys and qualitative studies, across the two main areas of economic and employment impacts and social impacts.

## Findings

**Statistical sources of data on migration into Scotland have a number of limitations:** estimates below UK level are not robust; available sources measure migration flows rather than stocks; and there is little data on characteristics, outcomes, intentions and attitudes of migrants. The Office for National Statistics (ONS) and General Register Office for Scotland (GROS) are taking action to improve data on migrants.

**In relation to economic and employment impacts, employers value migrants for their positive traits of reliability, flexibility and productivity.** At the same time, there is evidence of poor employment practice in relation to migrant workers, for example breach of regulations on working hours. Migrants have been found to have limited awareness of their employment rights. Many migrants are over-qualified for the low-skilled and low paid work in which they are predominantly employed. There is no clear evidence regarding migrants' long term intentions to stay in Scotland and therefore whether employers can continue to rely on this source of labour.

**Demand for services from migrants is not as high as expected.** This may be a result of self-sufficiency in migrant communities, language difficulties and other barriers to access or low levels of need. Few studies have assessed the impact of migration on services so that any additional costs are largely unknown.

**A8 migrants are housed largely in private rented accommodation** and some are provided with accommodation by employers. It is believed that provision of social housing may encourage further migration into Scotland.

**There has been very little research into the impact of migration on education and on children and social care,** although the demand for assistance with English language has increased. **Demand for provision of**

***English for Speakers of Other languages (ESOL) has increased generally and there are reports of unmet demand.***

***Scotland has been successful in attracting international students*** and in encouraging them to stay through the Fresh Talent programme. This scheme has now been extended to the whole of the UK.

***There is little evidence of any increased demand on health services as a result of increased migration into Scotland.*** This is explained with reference to characteristics of the migrant population and their reported use of health services in their home countries.

***There is evidence that the Scottish public is more welcoming of migrants than in other parts of the UK,*** excluding London, and recognises the economic importance of migration. However, migrants are poorly integrated into some communities, particularly in rural areas.

***Migrants report positive experiences of living in Scotland.*** However, it is not unusual for migrants to be victims of hostility and crime. There is little evidence of criminal activity by migrants, although this has been an area of speculation and anecdote.

### **Gaps in evidence**

The review identified a number of gaps in evidence relating to migration into Scotland. There is a general need for improved data and information in areas including health, crime, education, children and social care. There is also a need for specific information in a number of areas to inform future policy in relation to migration and integration. The report highlights a number of these:

- Barriers to migrants in accessing skilled work
- The extent of poor employment practices in relation to migrants
- Migrants' perspectives, experiences and intentions to settle or return
- Self employed migrants
- Barriers to learning English
- Migrants' use of services and reasons for low take up
- Access to housing and issues of quality of housing
- Schools' role in supporting migrant children
- The experiences of children of migrants
- Hostility and abuse towards migrants
- Barriers and facilitators to community integration
- The involvement of migrants in criminal and civil law-breaking

# CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION: MIGRATION AS A POLICY ISSUE FOR SCOTLAND

## **Background: recent migration into Scotland**

1.1. This report reviews current evidence on the impact of recent migration into Scotland. It was commissioned in view of the important role played by migration in Scotland's economic prosperity. The country has an ageing and, in the long-term, decreasing population. The Government Economic Strategy (2007) includes a target to match average European population growth over the period from 2007 to 2017. Migration has a key role to play in helping to ensure that this target and other performance indicators are met. Migrants have the potential to meet labour shortages experienced across a range of sectors and to ensure that GDP growth rate targets are met. The accession of the A8 countries - Poland, Lithuania, Hungary, Estonia, Latvia, Czech Republic, Slovakia and Slovenia - to the EU in 2004 has resulted in an increase in migration to Scotland, with particularly large in-migration from Poland. In January 2007 Bulgaria and Romania became the latest members of the EU with their nationals having restricted access to the UK labour market, for the time-being.

1.2. Scotland has attracted migrants from many parts of the world in the past, notably from Pakistan, India, Italy, Poland and China. It also has one of the largest populations of asylum seekers under the dispersal programme operated by the National Asylum Support Service (NASS). However, A8 migration differs from previous patterns in being both substantial and coinciding with an increase in labour demand. A8 migrants are largely seen as meeting needs for low skilled and semi-skilled labour which have been difficult to meet as a result of low unemployment. Scotland has also experienced population decline, particularly among younger age groups, although population levels have increased slightly in the last five years. Scotland also aims to attract highly skilled labour and has in place a number of interventions aimed at attracting and retaining such individuals under the Fresh Talent initiative. Much policy interest has therefore centred on how migrants can be assisted to settle and make a longer-term contribution to the Scottish economy and society (Scottish Government, 2007b).

1.3. The Scottish Government does not have control over the flow of non-EEA migrants into Scotland independently from the UK. Following devolution, Section 5 of the 1998 Scotland Act reserved 11 key policy areas to Westminster, among them immigration, employment and social security, while devolving most services to the Scottish Parliament. As a result of this division, decisions about levels of migration and access to benefits are made by the UK government, while key services affected by migration, including health care, education, housing, children's services and policing are the responsibility of the devolved government (Scottish Government, 2007d).

1.4. As well as having a positive impact on economic prosperity, migration presents challenges, nationally and at local level. It can place pressure on services such as health, housing and education and increase demand for



support such as language tuition. Meeting these demands requires reasonably accurate data and information on the migrant population, including numbers, age profile, marital status, family size, experiences and long term intentions. However, for a number of reasons, data in many of these areas is incomplete or inaccurate. It has been necessary for policy makers and researchers to access a range of different sources, impute and interpret data and to carry out further quantitative and qualitative investigations. As a result, there are numerous sources of data and research on migration into Scotland. The aim of this report is to place some order on these, to clarify what data and information are available and what it can say about the impact of migration into Scotland.

### **The evidence review**

1.5. The aim of the report is to provide an overview of evidence relating to the impacts of migration into Scotland since 2004. The purpose of the review is not to draw conclusions on the impact of migration, but to assess the available evidence on this key issue for Scottish Government policy. The report looks specifically at the impact of the recent migrant population in Scotland: migrants from the A8 new European Union member states, asylum seekers and refugees. It does not include research on settled communities or on UK-wide impacts of migration.

1.6. The research uses evidence from a range of published and unpublished sources to explore evidence about the impact of recent migration into Scotland. The research looks at two main aspects, which include a number of strands:

- **Economic and employment impacts**
  - Macro economic effects
  - Employers' use of migrant labour
  - Skills and progression
  - Migrants' experiences and future intentions<sup>1</sup>
  
- **Social impacts**
  - Public services generally
  - Housing
  - Schools, children and social care
  - Health
  - ESOL provision
  - Community Cohesion and equalities
  - Crime and Justice
  - Higher Education

---

<sup>1</sup> Research looking at migrants' experiences and future intentions is included, where these are likely to affect the impact of migration.

1.7. The emphasis of the review is on impacts on employment and public services rather than on the economic effects of migration. This is because the Scottish Government plans to carry out a separate piece of research into the economic impact of migration. Therefore, more detailed analyses will form part of this separate study. The review assesses data sources in the following way:

- Data sources on migrant numbers (stocks and flows) are described but the data itself is not presented
- The evidence produced by research is summarised, with references to sources

1.8. A distinction is made between categories of migrants where appropriate. In most cases this is between A8 migrants and asylum seekers and refugees as the two main groups of recent migrants. These groups are treated differently by research on migration into Scotland because A8 nationals form the majority of migrants entering the country to work and live; asylum seekers are largely confined to National Asylum Support Service (NASS) dispersal areas and are not able to work, while refugees are not a substantial group<sup>2</sup>.

1.9. The review includes a wide range of evidence in the form of published and unpublished data, reports, papers and other documents. They include a wide variety of methods, including surveys, qualitative research and consultation. The emphasis is on research-based studies rather than reports about projects involving migrants, except where these are the subject of an evaluation. By focusing on impact, the review excludes research on aspects of migration which are largely unrelated to impact, for example the development of services for migrant groups.

### **Structure of the report**

1.10. The report has the following structure:

- Chapter 2 examines the data sources which can be used to assess the impact of recent migration describing the limited datasets available and their strengths and weaknesses.
- Chapter 3 explores the economic and employment impact of migration, focusing on evidence relating to demand and supply and evidence from local and sectoral studies.
- Chapter 4 examines what might be termed 'social' impacts, looking first at evidence of the impact on public services generally and then at specific areas of social impact, including health, community cohesion and housing in turn. This chapter forms a substantial part of the report.

---

<sup>2</sup> In 2007 for the UK as a whole, 3,540 individuals were granted refugee status, with a further 2210 not recognised as refugees but granted humanitarian protection or granted discretionary leave (Home Office figures).

- Chapter 5 is the concluding chapter of the report, focusing on the main impacts of migration into Scotland, discussion of the main gaps in evidence and the implications of future developments.

1.11 Each chapter of the report includes selected key points. The report includes a bibliography covering research on the impact of migration into Scotland. Summary tables presenting key studies, with a brief description of their methods, are included in Appendix B of the report.

## **CHAPTER 2. MIGRATION: STATISTICAL SOURCES**

### **Introduction**

2.1 Difficulties of making an accurate assessment of the scale and patterns of migration to and from the UK have been widely noted (House of Lords Select Committee, 2008). Establishing a clear picture of migration into Scotland is even more problematic since evidence is often presented as UK wide. To assess the impact of migration on public services and other issues, such as social cohesion, a number of data sources must be used, each of which has its limitations. This chapter describes the sources of data available to assess changes in Scotland's population and the characteristics of migrants.

Details of datasets are given in Appendix A and a summary of their coverage is given in Table 2.1.



<b>Attitudes to immigrants</b>	range of funders																			
Scottish Social Attitudes Survey		na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na

<sup>a</sup> Availability from 2001 recorded. Some datasets were available prior to 2001. <sup>b</sup> Areas vary with datasets. <sup>c</sup> The WRS will be discontinued from 1st May 2009.

<sup>d</sup> DWP Department of Work and Pensions; GROS General Register Office for Scotland; HESA Higher Education Statistics Agency; Head Office Home Office; NHS National Health Service; ONS Office for National Statistics; SFC Scottish Funding Council; SG Scottish Government.

Table adapted from Rees and Boden (2006).

## Sources of data

### *Migration*

2.2 Most data which identifies migrants tends to provide information on the extent of migration (e.g. the International Passenger Survey (IPS), National Insurance Number (NINo) applications (as shown in Table 2.1 and Appendix A). Such datasets tend to provide information related to the migration process, for example nationality, country of origin, legal status, date of entry, together with very limited personal information such as gender and age. Each dataset has its limitations (see Appendix A).

2.3 A key issue for estimation of the size of migration is the lack of information on out-migration in most datasets, for example the Worker Registration Scheme (WRS) and the NHS Central Register (NHSCR). Only the International Passenger Survey (IPS) provides emigration data. This, together with Home Office immigration control data and the Irish CSO estimates on migration flows between the UK and Ireland are used to estimate Total International Migration (TIM). This is available for Scotland as a whole.

Other key issues include:

- data does not adequately distinguish between migrants and visitors (e.g. the International Passenger Survey);
- the data is not representative of migrants, but of a self-selecting subset of migrants (e.g. the NHSCR only covers those who register with GPs);
- data relates to situation on initial entry/registration and does not capture subsequent changes and movement (e.g. NINo, WRS, Audit Commission, 2007)
- the WRS, which applies to nationals of the A8 countries which joined the European Union in April 2004, will be discontinued on 1 May 2009.

2.4 Given these various limitations, it is not surprising that counts of migrant inflows differ depending on the dataset used. The Office for National Statistics (ONS, 2007) compared the Workers Registration Scheme (WRS), the Patient Register Data System (PRDS) and National Insurance Number (NINo) registrations. This exercise found key reasons for differences in counts to be:

- differences in the populations between the sources (e.g. students excluded from WRS and NINo and included in PRDS);
- differences in the registration requirements (e.g. non-compulsory registration for PRDS, compulsory registration for WRS);
- the loss of the international migration marker if there is an internal migration move shortly after the initial move (PRDS);
- different length of stay criterion;
- referencing to place of work (WRS) rather than place of residence (NINo)

2.5 Rendall *et al.* (2003) compared the 2001 Census, IPS and the Labour Force Survey (LFS). They found the LFS underestimated immigration by 15 to 25 per cent, largely due to underestimation of non-EU migrants. However, the LFS provided better estimates of the geographical distribution of migrant flows compared to the IPS.

### ***Education***

2.6 The most thorough information on migrants' activities relates to education. The Pupil Census/ Independent School Census, Students in Higher Education Institutions and Students in Further Education Institutions data provide complete administrative data on school, further education and higher education students. However, none report on all migrants. Only migrants who were domiciled abroad immediately prior to their entry for education are identified in the higher and further education data (i.e. those who had already lived for a period in the UK would not be identified). For school students, migrants can only be identified by whether they receive English as an Additional Language support. Therefore migrants from English speaking countries, those with English speaking parents and those who have learnt English will not be identified as migrants.

### ***Employment***

2.7 Employment data on migrants is provided by the Labour Force Survey, which identifies migrants, together with their date of entry. The LFS provides extensive information on economic activity, including earnings and income, along with other data such as education and qualifications, household characteristics and housing tenure. However, the usefulness of the LFS is reduced by its small sample size. Employment information on A8 migrants is also provided by the Workers Registration Scheme (WRS) data.

### ***Crime***

2.8 The police Language Line Services provides some indirect information on migrants and crime, in relation to victimisation. It is obviously only relevant to non-English speakers. Another source of information about crime is the UK Central Authority for the Exchange of Criminal Records (UKCA-ECR) which passes and receives records of convictions between jurisdictions. Available data from this source gives the total number of annual notifications and the countries to which these were sent. However, separate data is not given for Scotland. With regard to criminal activity directed towards migrants, the Scottish Crime and Victimisation Survey and Scottish Crime and Justice Survey include questions on experience of insults and intimidation. Victims of crime are asked why they think they were a victim, including reasons of race and religious motivation. However, the survey does not include respondents' migrant status.

### ***Migrants' other activities and characteristics***

2.9 Many major datasets which would provide useful information on migrants' characteristics and needs do not identify migrants (e.g. the Family Resources Survey<sup>3</sup>, the Scottish Health Survey<sup>4</sup>, the Scottish Household

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.statistics.gov.uk/StatBase/Source.asp?vlnk=227&More=Y>



Survey) or have sample sizes too small to enable adequate analysis of migrants (e.g. the Scottish Social Attitudes Survey).

2.10 The recently launched Integrated Household Survey (combining the Labour Force Survey and associated boosts, the General Household Survey, the Expenditure and Food Survey, the Omnibus Survey and the English Housing Survey) should increase the availability of data on migrants, as migrants are identified in the core questionnaire. However, its usefulness will be limited by the small sample size.

### ***Attitudes towards immigrants***

2.11 The Scottish Social Attitudes Survey (SSA) is conducted annually and collects different types of information each year. In 2006, it had a question on attitudes towards Eastern European migrants.

### **Shortcomings of data**

2.12 It is clear that there is a lack of adequate data on migrants:

- Administrative data provides information on flows onto various registers. Flows out are not identified and so administrative data cannot be used to assess the stock of migrants.
- Administrative data only records information on sub-populations of migrants (e.g. WRS covers EU Eastern European employees) and these are not always representative of a useful sub-population (e.g. NHSCR is representative of migrants who, at some stage, decided to register with a GP).
- There is little information on migrants' characteristics and activities: administrative data collects minimal information on these and few existing major datasets both identify migrants and have adequate sample sizes to enable disaggregated analysis of migrants in Scotland.
- Most non-migration datasets which do identify migrants do so indirectly and thus mis-identify some migrants/non-migrants and do not indicate the period of time spent in the UK (e.g. the Pupil Census based on main language spoken at home and higher and further education data based on last country of domicile).

2.13 Consequently, there is little evidence on who stays where or for how long, and limited information on the intentions of migrant workers, especially those from the accession states (Audit Commission, 2007).

### **Moves to improve data**

2.14 An inter-Departmental Task Force on Migration Statistics was established to make recommendations for improving migration data. It is examining both data for migration estimates and data on migrants in the UK. The Office for National Statistics are taking forward its recommendations

---

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2005/11/25145024/50278>

(ONS, 2006) through the Improvements to Migration and Population Statistics (IMPS)<sup>5</sup>.

2.15 IMPS has established five UK-wide working groups which cover:

- improving the data on migration flows;
- making effective use of new and existing administrative and survey data sources;
- improving local population estimates and projections used in allocating resources and developing services;
- improving the public reporting of population and migration statistics;
- establishing a wider range of timely indicators and analysis to inform the evidence base on migration and its impacts on policy and public services.

2.16 The General Register Office for Scotland is involved in this programme with the aim of incorporating the research into their outputs (ONS, 2008). This work includes the investigation and development of administrative sources not currently used in the production of population estimates, such as data on students from HESA, the School Census, DWP and HMRC data on benefits and employment. Improvements in the quality and efficiency of the system for using data from GP registrations are also being made.

2.17 Other areas of joint working include the estimation of short term migrant numbers for Scotland, a review of the method of allocation of international migrants to council areas, the development of indicators of migration at local authority level and early indications of changes in population trends.

2.18 Through the IMPS working groups the General Register Office for Scotland (GROS) believes Scotland's migration information will benefit in the following ways:

- Improvements to the International Passenger Survey in terms of design and sample size will increase the accuracy of the estimates of migration.
- The e-Borders programme will allow access to better quality and more comprehensive information of passenger numbers and movements to and from the UK, although it will not include the destination within the UK. Data linked in the form of personal travel histories will be of much more value than unlinked bulk entry and exit data. The Points Based System will provide information on non-EEA nationals intending to work or study in the UK. Further information has been requested to allow this data to be linked to accurate flow data.
- The work on access to alternative sources will contribute to a better access and use for Scotland of UK-wide sources such as DWP and HMRC data on benefits and employment. GROS is developing separately the use

---

<sup>5</sup> More detail on the IMPS programme is available at:

<http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/data/methodology/specific/population/future/imps/updates/default.asp>

of Scotland-based sources such as the School Census and the NHS Central Register.

- GROS will benefit from more coherent reporting of migration data, as this has increased the profile of the publication of migration data for Scotland (e.g. quarterly publication of internal migration estimates and six monthly estimates of international migration) and resulted in new data sources becoming available (e.g. population estimates by country of birth and a tabulation tool for National Insurance registrations).
- The working group on local population estimates will provide benefits to Scotland in improvements to the methodology used to allocate international migrants, the development of a methodology to use HESA data to improve the estimation of internal migration of students, and the development of an estimate of short term migration in Scotland.
- GROS are working with ONS to identify which migration indicators could be made available in a more timely fashion for Scotland. Also, they are working with ONS to develop the evidence base on migration at a local level, which is currently being piloted with Tayside.

### ***Key points***

- Estimates are provided of total international migration for Scotland. However, there is a lack of robust sub-national data.
- There is little data on the characteristics, activities, attitudes and intentions of migrants.
- Limited information on migrants' economic activity is provided by the Labour Force Survey and by the Workers Registration Scheme, but both sources have major limitations: these are small sample size, the inclusion of A8 migrants only and of migrant flows rather than stocks.
- Education data is available for a subset of migrants: for those coming to the UK to study in Further Education and Higher Education and, for school pupils, those who receive English as an Additional Language support.
- The Office for National Statistics has been taking action to improve the data on migrants, through the Improvements to Migration and Population Statistics (IMPS) and constituent working parties. The General Register Office for Scotland is involved in this programme. However, improvements will take time.

## **CHAPTER 3. ECONOMIC AND EMPLOYMENT IMPACTS**

3.1 This chapter of the report summarises research on the economic impact of migration into Scotland, focusing on the employment of migrant workers. As we described in Chapter 2, a number of data sources have been used to try to capture this impact. Measuring the impact of migration on the economy and labour market is a complex process and the Scottish Government is planning additional work to look at this subject in more detail. This report therefore focuses on research into the impact of migration, which has used various methods: secondary analysis of datasets, quantitative surveys and qualitative research. The focus of much of this research is local, rather than Scotland-wide, although there are some studies with a stronger sector focus. Studies also differ in their emphasis on the supply or demand for migrant labour, with most studies focusing on employer demand for and use of migrant labour and fewer looking at issues of supply and migrants' experiences.

3.2 This chapter presents the main messages of research on migrant employment. The research took an inclusive approach in which studies were not excluded on grounds of quality. However, the assessment of findings takes account of quality, in presenting evidence from studies with the strongest evidence base,<sup>6</sup> but does not assess the rigour of particular studies. The reports and papers included in this chapter are listed in Appendix A with a brief summary of their methods.

### **Macro-economic effects of migration**

3.3 Research on the macro-economic effects of migration is UK-wide. Studies which focus on the economic impact of migration into Scotland address concerns at demographic change and the tightening of the labour market which is projected to follow population decline. Research has identified in-migration as the demographic variable with the biggest economic impact. However, to counteract shrinkage of the labour force, it has been estimated that an annual rate of 20,000 new migrants will be needed (Lisenkova et al, 2007).

3.4 A comprehensive summary of available evidence on the economic impact of migration has been produced by the House of Lords, as a result of an enquiry conducted by the Select Committee on Economic Affairs (House of Lords, 2008). This brings together much of the evidence relating to the macro-economic effects of migration. Here we consider some of the possible macro-economic effects of migration. Evidence relating to issues such as labour

---

<sup>6</sup> Three main criteria were used to assess quality:

Does the research design adopted address clearly defined research questions?

Is there an explicit account of the research process, including design and methods and analysis of data?

Are the findings credible and clearly related to evidence? (see Spencer *et al*, 2003; Becker *et al*, 2006).

quantity and quality are discussed later in this chapter in relation to findings from research in Scotland.

3.5 At the macro-economic level, an increase in net immigration may affect output, inflation, unemployment, wages and the return to capital. Recent increases in net immigration, from A8 countries and more widely, has been found to increase output and employment (Riley and Weale, 2006). There is also evidence that consumers may have benefited through reduced prices (House of Lords, 2008).

3.6 With regard to the effects of migration on levels of employment and unemployment at a more local level, the evidence is more mixed. A review of general migration research and research on recent A8 migrants into the UK, found that there was *'little or no evidence that immigrants have had a major impact on native labour market outcomes such as wages and unemployment'* (Blanchflower *et al* 2007). Other investigations suggest that the impact may be confined to younger workers (Riley and Weale, 2006). Moreover, it is thought that any impact of migration on employment is likely to be small in the long-term (House of Lords, 2008).

3.7 There has been some speculation concerning the impact of migration on wages. The House of Lords (2008) concluded that migration overall had had a small depressing effect on low wages, resulting from the concentration of migrants in low skilled jobs. Other research found downward pressure on nominal wages in some sectors associated with particularly large influxes of A8 migrants such as agriculture and fishing and no impact on other sectors (Portes and French, 2005). It has also been suggested that any wage effect may be limited to the pay of migrants rather than the existing labour force (Manacorda *et al.*, 2006).

### **Employers' use of migrant labour**

3.8 Studies of employers' use of migrant labour focus largely on the recruitment and deployment of A8 migrants rather than other migrant job-seekers. A number of studies, across sectors and regions of Scotland convey the same messages from employers:

- Migrants are valued for the positive traits they bring to the workplace, including punctuality, reliability and flexibility.
- Migrants are found to be more productive than local workers and to have a stronger work ethic.
- Agencies and migrants' networks make it easy to recruit from the migrant pool by word of mouth and recruitment methods are largely supply-led.
- Migrants are active in seeking work using speculative methods, which benefit employers in reduced advertising costs.
- Migrant workers integrate well with the existing, local, workforce.

3.1 Many of the benefits of employing migrants reflect their acceptance of low pay, poor conditions and fluctuating hours. Because they fill vacancies in essential production and service roles, research studies frequently report

employers as stating that they could not function without migrant labour, or would not have been able to grow (de Lima *et al*, 2005; Metcalf *et al*, 2008). A survey of 700 Tayside employers found that no business had suffered as a result of recruiting migrant workers: 19 per cent of businesses reported a significant improvement in business and a further 47 per cent said it had improved (Scottish Economic Research, 2006). The key advantages reported were added flexibility, access to skills and improved product and service quality.

3.2 A number of studies have found employers comparing the positive qualities of migrants with the characteristics of available local workers. These are described by employers as unreliable, unwilling to work and difficult to manage. Studies have acknowledged that this reflects two main factors: the first of these is the nature of the work, which is of low skill and pay, involving irregular hours or unpleasant surroundings. Employers report migrants as accepting these conditions, while local workers are less willing or able to cut or extend their hours when needed; secondly, low unemployment which reduces the quality of the unemployed (de Lima *et al*, 2005; Metcalf *et al*, 2008). Research also finds employers who say they simply cannot recruit local workers, regardless of quality considerations (Sim *et al*, 2007).

3.3 Some studies show employers using practices which target migrant workers, for example recruiting through agencies in Eastern Europe. However, they also suggest that some employers do not actively aim to recruit migrant workers, but do so because they apply and are suitable for the work (Sim *et al*, 2007; Metcalf *et al*, 2008). Recent studies report a change in practice among employers from use of agencies to direct recruitment and from advertising to supply-led methods such as speculative applications and word of mouth (de Lima *et al*, 2007; Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

3.4 At the same time, studies have found that some employers prefer to employ local workers because recruiting migrants is seen as a 'failure' (de Lima *et al*, 2007), viewed negatively locally or seen as bad for the organisation's image (Metcalf *et al*, 2008). Language issues and lack of suitable experience are raised by some employers (AB Associates, 2007). Many employers recruiting volumes of migrant workers therefore say they do so from necessity rather than by choice (Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

### **Sector studies**

3.5 A small number of studies have looked at the impact of migration on particular industry sectors. One study commissioned by Scottish Enterprise combines a sectoral and regional perspective in its five case studies: the hospitality sector in Glasgow; the energy sector in Grampian; food processing in the south of Scotland; the construction industry in the Highlands and Islands; and financial services in Edinburgh. The research looks at labour demand and deployment of migrants in each sector, focusing on the progression opportunities for migrants (Hall Aitken, 2007). Research by NIESR for the Scottish Government sampled employers in sectors of high and lower use of migrant labour. As a qualitative study, it did not aim to compare practices by industry. However, some broad differences in employer practices

were found between sectors. By including employers with no or few migrant workers, the research identified reasons for not employing migrants (Metcalf *et al*, 2008). Research on social services in Scotland also included employers with little experience of employing migrants and reports a range of practice in relation to their recruitment and development (GEN, 2008).

3.6 A number of studies have looked specifically at the agriculture sector as a major user of migrant labour, particularly for seasonal work. Research commissioned by the Scottish Executive Environment and Rural Affairs Department (SEERAD) concludes that parts of the sector are highly dependent on migrant labour, particularly students, and experience difficulties recruiting outside of the main student holiday period (Vergunst, 2007). This study exemplifies the dependency of some employers on migrants, resulting from the unattractiveness of the work to local labour.

### ***Employment practices***

3.7 Employers report that they employ migrants in largely low paid work. They explain this with reference to a) the type of work available, b) the need for English language in more highly skilled work and c) absence of qualifications recognised in the UK (Sim *et al*, 2007). Studies report most employers as saying they employ migrants on the same terms and conditions as local workers. However, it is reasonably common for migrants to be employed by an agency while local workers are employed directly (AB Associates, 2007). Studies have found evidence of non-compliance with employment law: for example employers who purposefully recruit only particular nationalities are in breach of race discrimination legislation, and those who allocate men and women to different jobs are practising sex discrimination (Metcalf *et al*, 2008). Other practices found by NIESR in research include breach of regulations in relation to working time and health and safety.

3.8 Training opportunities have also been found to be different where migrants are employed by agencies. Migrants with poor English language are also less likely to be offered skills training, although some employers are developing DVD packages which do not require good English (AB Associates, 2007; Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

### ***Skills and progression***

3.9 Migration has generally been found to impact most on sectors and occupations of low wage and low skill. Research in the Highlands and Islands found the majority of migrants employed in semi-skilled or unskilled jobs (de Lima *et al*, 2005). Similarly, research in Tayside found migrant workers largely in low level occupations (Scottish Economic Research, 2006). NIESR research for the Scottish Government and Welsh Assembly Government found the same concentration of migrants in jobs of low skill and minimum wage rates (Metcalf *et al*, 2009). These studies note that many migrants in these jobs have higher level qualifications, including university degrees, and that employers are aware of this under-utilisation. Research has identified particular issues in relation to recognition of qualifications in some sectors. These include health, where overseas qualifications are not necessarily

accepted, and where migrants can find themselves working at a more junior level as a result (de Lima *et al*, 2005; Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

3.10 There is evidence that other recent migrant groups are well-qualified, notably asylum seekers and refugees. Since 2002, asylum seekers have not been entitled to take up paid employment, although those granted this right before 2002 have been allowed to work. In general, therefore, only those granted indefinite leave to remain as a refugee or exceptional leave to remain are automatically entitled to work in the UK. An audit of the skills and aspirations of refugees and asylum seekers found that many refugees and asylum seekers living in Scotland are well qualified and possess a broad range of technical and professional skills, including in such areas as medicine and nursing, law and engineering (Charlaff *et al*, 2004). A similar picture of migrants as possessing a range of skills and qualifications which they are not using in the UK is found in other research (Sim *et al*, 2007).

3.11 Progression of migrant workers to more highly skilled work is likely to increase the economic benefit of migration to the economy and also encourage settlement rather than short-term stays. Research commissioned by Scottish Enterprise (Hall Aitken, 2008) found three main barriers to progression of migrant workers: English language ability; problems with transfer and recognition of qualifications; and employer attitudes. The research also identified some sector specific barriers, for example credit checks for some jobs in financial services. The issue of English language skills is raised by a number of studies and some research points out that many migrants are prevented from applying or being selected for more skilled work because of weak spoken and written English language skills. A proportion may be students with little intention of developing a career in Scotland, but looking for temporary work where they can maximise earnings by working long hours (Brown and Danson, 2008; Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

3.12 It has been noted that many workers from accession states have found employment in rural areas, while previous migration has centred on cities (Jentsch *et al*, 2007). Under-utilisation of migrants' skills may have particular implications for rural areas which are keen to repopulate following the departure of young people for towns and cities. Lack of prospects in rural areas may lead migrants to see their future prospects as brighter elsewhere. As Jentsch and colleagues observe, they may adopt the motto of rural youth that 'in order to get on, you have to get out' (2007:51).

### ***Barriers and costs of employing migrants***

3.13 Studies report a number of barriers to employing migrants. These include language and UK-equivalent qualifications. In some areas of Scotland, employers report problems with accommodation which make it difficult for migrants to take up jobs and to settle (AB Associates, 2007). It is not uncommon for employers to provide accommodation, either on a temporary basis or in certain sectors such as hospitality or agriculture (de Lima *et al*, 2005). Use of agencies to recruit migrants is also reported by employers to add to the costs of their recruitment (AB Associates, 2007).



3.14 Some studies identify costs which employers may experience and which may impact on profitability. These include costs associated with language, in vetting and in settling in (Metcalf *et al*, 2008). Poor language skills are reported to increase the costs of induction training and put in question its effectiveness (de Lima *et al*, 2005; Metcalf *et al*, 2008). However, employers also report being able to overcome many of the difficulties of poor English (Scottish Economic Research, 2006). Studies report heavy reliance by employers on migrants with good English to interpret for other workers and to translate materials (de Lima *et al*, 2007; Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

3.15 Employers say they assist migrants with aspects of employment and with settling in Scotland. Such help includes setting up bank accounts and transferring money. While this undoubtedly impacts on employers' time and resources, they do not always regard it as a cost and seem happy to assist in this way (Metcalf *et al*, 2008). The role of many employers in assisting migrants to settle into the UK is verified by research on migrants' experiences (de Lima *et al*, 2007).

3.16 Studies have found employers providing English language classes, through local colleges or adult education organisations (de Lima *et al*, 2005; Metcalf *et al*, 2008). However, employers are also reported to be reluctant to assist in this way, believing that it is not their responsibility (Sim *et al*, 2007; Metcalf *et al* 2008).

### **The supply of migrants and the migrant experience**

3.17 There has been little research from the perspective of migrant workers. The review identified ten main studies which have included migrants, either as the main target research group or along with employers, service providers and other stakeholders. These are all local studies conducted in locations including Grampian, Glasgow, Tayside, Lanarkshire and the Highlands and Islands, focusing on A8 migrants. These studies vary in quality, according to criteria listed earlier. However, a number of general findings in relation to employment are apparent from these studies.

#### ***Migrants' work backgrounds and plans***

3.18 The economic situation in a number of countries and high unemployment in Poland, combined with higher pay in the UK are the main reasons why A8 migrants have come to Scotland (de Lima *et al*, 2005; Scottish Economic Research, 2006). Further factors include the quality of life in the UK and the opportunity to learn or improve English language skills (Scottish Economic Research, 2006; Sim *et al*, 2007). Migrants frequently head for locations where they have friends or family (Sim *et al*, 2007).

3.19 Studies present a mixed picture with regard to migrants' intentions to stay in the UK, sometimes reflecting the precise wording of questions. In general it appears that many A8 migrants plan to stay in Scotland, but are unsure about for how long. A survey of 262 A8 migrants in Glasgow found that 12 percent indicated that they intend to bring their family to Scotland (Blake Stevenson, 2007a).

3.20 Migrants are employed predominantly in low skilled, low paid work. Studies report pay at the minimum wage to be common (de Lima *et al*, 2007). Many have experience of more skilled work and some are highly qualified (de Lima *et al*, 2005 & 2007; Blake Stevenson 2007a; Kociolek, 2007); Many migrants aspire to work at a more senior level than which they were currently employed. Other studies have found migrants to have a range of unused skills and qualifications (Sim *et al*, 2007).

3.21 Migrants believe that learning English is critical to achieving their goal of gaining more skilled and better paid work (Sim *et al*, 2007). However, there are indications migrants face additional barriers which limit this progression, such as access to information and recognition of their skills. Some research suggests that confidence may also be a reason why migrants seek out and remain in low skilled work (Kociolek, 2007). Some recent research suggests that migrants are beginning to look for work which better matches their qualifications and experiences, and that this is associated with plans to settle (Sim *et al*, 2007).

### ***Finding work***

3.22 Earlier studies of migrants suggest that agencies initially played an important role in recruiting A8 migrants to jobs in the UK (de Lima *et al*, 2005). In the period immediately following A8 accession, studies find agencies in Eastern Europe as accounting for a substantial proportion of recruitment but later studies find most migrants are recruited within the UK (Sim *et al*, 2007). Agencies continue to play an important role in recruitment, but other methods of job search and recruitment are also widely used. Word of mouth is commonly used to find work and migrants commonly make speculative applications (Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

### ***Types of Employment***

3.23 Most recent migrants are in full-time work with some working part-time, while the rest are in education. Few are unemployed or otherwise not active in the labour market. Many migrants in employment are working long hours (Hall Aitken, 2007a). Migrants are concentrated in a relatively small number of sectors of the economy, including hospitality and catering, food processing, construction and agriculture (Sim *et al*, 2007). There are concentrations in low skilled, low paid work which is rarely related to work they carried out in their home country. WRS identifies a larger percentage employed in admin., business and management services, i.e. a higher paid sector. However, it is thought that migrant employment in this industry is over-estimated by the inclusion of temp agency workers, who actually work in the low paid sectors listed above.

### ***Terms, conditions and opportunities***

3.24 Migrants report not having contracts of employment and feel they are expected to work shorter or longer hours as required. Temporary or short term contracts are common, with studies reporting use of contracts of up to one year (Scottish Economic Research, 2006; de Lima *et al*, 2007). Other practices found by research include use of 'temp to perm' arrangements and

employment through a third party such as an agency. Some migrants work very long hours and holding more than one job is not unusual. (de Lima *et al*, 2007; Hall Aitken, 2007a). Research which asks migrants about their length of service has found this to be generally short, but this may indicate flow of new migrants rather than turnover of migrant workers (Sim *et al*, 2007).

3.25 Training opportunities are largely confined to essential instruction in areas such as fire safety and food hygiene (de Lima *et al*, 2005 & 2007; Hall Aitken, 2008; Sim *et al*, 2007). This is consistent with findings from employer studies reported above.

### ***Fairness and equality***

3.26 There is evidence of low awareness among migrants about employment rights and some employment issues, for example pensions (Hall Aitken, 2007a; de Lima *et al*, 2007). Some migrants feel they are unfairly rejected for jobs in favour of UK applicants or are treated differently by employers than their British colleagues (Hall Aitken, 2007a; de Lima *et al*, 2007). There is some evidence of gender discrimination and disadvantage, with women reporting lower levels of satisfaction, fewer training opportunities and less opportunity to make use of qualifications. NIESR research has found evidence of allocation of migrants to jobs according to gender, although the research did not include migrants' own experiences (Metcalf *et al*, 2008). With regard to broader satisfaction at work, relations with work colleagues, including local workers, are reported to be good (Hall Aitken, 2007a). Migrant workers also report good relationships with their employers, and often call upon them when in need of advice or help (de Lima *et al*, 2007).

### ***Key points***

- Research on the macro-economic effects of migration is UK-wide with research on the Scottish economy focused on population decline and the role of migration in counteracting this. Across the UK, recent increases in net migration have increased output and employment and there is little evidence of any major impact on wages and unemployment.
- Employers value migrants for their positive traits of reliability, flexibility and productivity. All studies involving employer interviews have found available local labour compares poorly, but acknowledge that this is because migrants have been recruited to the least attractive jobs and because low unemployment has reduced the quality of the local labour supply.
- Barriers to the employment of migrants include poor English and lack of UK equivalent qualifications. Some employers still prefer to recruit local workers, where they can.
- There is evidence of poor employment practice in relation to migrant workers, including temporary contracts, exploitation by agencies, breach of regulations on working hours and sex discrimination. Migrants have low levels of awareness of their employment rights.
- Factors including the economic situation in Poland and higher pay in the UK are behind the decision of many migrants to come to the UK. There is no clear evidence regarding migrants' intentions to stay in Scotland.
- Many migrants are over-qualified for the low skilled and low paid work they do, yet are restricted by language, by lack of training opportunities and

possibly confidence. Migrants are beginning to look for work which better matches their skills and qualifications, as part of their plans to settle.

- A particular feature of migration from A8 countries is its recruitment to jobs in rural areas, in agriculture and hospitality. These sectors may face particular challenges offering migrants incentives to develop their skills and to stay, yet this will be key to resolving rural skills shortages and declining population levels.

## **CHAPTER 4. SOCIAL IMPACTS**

4.1 Any increase in population has implications for public services, but migration is likely to have particular impacts because of the nature of migrant populations. These include their social characteristics such as age and family structure, their English language skills and their expectations of public services. Migration impacts are also dependent on length of stay, with temporary stays placing different demands on services than long-term settlement. Much research focuses on the impact of A8 migration because of its volume and spread across Scottish regions. Some research also examines the impact of asylum seekers, refugees and the Roma community on Glasgow where these groups are housed. Individual studies of these groups show how the impact of different migrant groups may differ according to factors such as labour market participation, family size and structure.

### **Public services: general reviews**

4.2 In this chapter we look at the impact of migration on a wide range of services, including the key services of housing, health and education. The evidence relating to each public service area is presented in successive sections. In addition to studies which look at one or two service areas, there are a number which have looked more broadly at the impact of migration on public services. We begin by providing a brief overview of these more general studies, and what they can tell us about the impact of migration, before looking at particular areas of service provision.

4.3 Our review included about a dozen studies which have looked at the impact of migration across services. Much of this research has been carried out at local level, commissioned by local authorities and carried out by research consultants. These studies include small-scale investigations and consultation approaches as well as systematic research studies. They address issues relating to service demand, including migrants' needs for service provision, changing levels of demand for services, the capacity of organisations and staff to deal with this demand and the experiences and needs of migrants themselves. The main studies included in the review, their methods and sample sizes, are listed in Appendix B. In addition the review took account of reports from local authorities produced for internal purposes.

4.4 A number of general observations can be made about these studies. First, a number of studies have looked at demand across services and are by nature very broad in scope, aimed at establishing the impact of migration on a local area and on understanding the needs and intentions of migrant communities. The strength of these studies is therefore their broad focus on the general impact of migration on an area and its services. In addition to their broad subject focus, these studies tend to include a number of respondent groups, including employers, migrant workers and service providers. This allows for a range of perspectives to be presented. Sample sizes are generally small and, in some studies, low response rates raise the possibility of bias towards services in contact with migrants (parallel56, 2005). The methods used in some studies are unclear, particularly in relation to actual

and achieved samples and in the detail of methods used. Therefore, some studies do not meet the quality criteria listed earlier in this report.

4.5 In some of the literature, services are not adequately described and there is a lack of clarity between access to advice on services, and access to services themselves. Surveys of service providers frequently include both types of services and there is a lack of clarity about reasons why migrants do not access services: whether they do not access advice and perhaps do not know their entitlements or whether there is little demand from migrants for particular services.

4.6 Despite the methodological shortcomings, these studies report some interesting findings with useful implications for policy. A number of locally based studies have found that the record systems of many service providers do not allow for analysis of use by nationality or migrant/non-migrant status. Some studies have found some service providers carry out no monitoring of enquiries and are therefore only able to provide estimates of migrant use, based on providers' personal impressions (Orchard *et al*, 2007). Therefore, record keeping needs to be improved in some service areas if the impact of migration is to be properly assessed.

4.7 Research reports suggest some increase in enquiries or demand for advice services as a result of inward migration from A8 countries (parallel56, 2005). This is as one would expect, given the increase in migration into Scotland in recent years. However, evidence of an increase in demand is not strong, partly because of small sample sizes. Studies which have included migrants suggest low levels of use of services, particularly those offering advice and information, and a high degree of 'self-sufficiency' (Blake Stevenson, 2007a:6). A survey of 904 migrants in Fife, almost all A8 migrants, found limited use of health, housing or other advice services, although higher levels of use where advice is combined with service provision, for example banking and English language support (Fife Partnership, 2007). Reports of difficulties experienced by migrants in accessing services involve service provision rather than access to advice. Therefore, some locally based research suggests problems among a small minority of migrants in accessing childcare, debt advice, business start up assistance and language services (see Blake Stevenson, 2007a:39).

4.8 Research involving service providers also suggests lack of clarity among service providers on the rights and entitlement of migrants (*de Lima et al*, 2007; Orchard *et al*, 2007). Studies have therefore identified a need for improved provision of information to service providers on migrants' rights, for example in access to housing services (parallel56, 2005). There has been little research on migrants' knowledge of services, with research focusing on their needs and service use. There are indications that, within the A8 migrant population, the Roma community have a low level of awareness of their rights and of how to access services (Poole and Adamson, 2008; Blake Stevenson, 2007a:38). This is of concern because of evidence of barriers to use of services including health and education among the Roma community (Poole and Adamson, 2008).

4.9 The language needs of migrants is an issue raised in a number of research studies involving service providers (Orchard *et al*, 2007; *de Lima et al*, 2007). This issue is raised particularly in relation to access to education and school services but is also reported to be a major barrier to accessing services more generally (Perth and Kinross 2008). Research by Edinburgh City Council on the cost of inward migration concludes that there are particular demands for English language tuition and interpretation and translation functions and that it is here that extra investment is required to meet higher levels of demand (Edinburgh City Council, 2008).

4.10 Finally, there have been few studies on overall impact of migration on services and in particular to costs of migration at local level. One internal report by a local authority states that *'Most Council services acknowledge pressures on their services, however very few have quantified the costs but rather have focused on dealing with the impacts'*. One notable exception to this is Edinburgh City Council's internal study of the impact of migration on council services which estimates the cost of services to migrants in areas including advice and information services, interpretation and translation and English as an Additional Language in schools (Edinburgh City Council, 2008). This recent exercise resulted in an estimate of the costs of migration across services and, in addition, included an assessment of some of the economic benefits to the city of inward migration.

### **Key points**

- There is some evidence of an increase in enquiries about services as a result of migration. However, this is not as high as expected and suggests a high degree of 'self-sufficiency' in migrant communities. Language may be a factor in low take-up of advice services.
- There is a lack of clarity among some service providers surrounding migrants' rights and entitlements.
- There have been few studies assessing overall impact of migration on services so that any additional costs of providing services to migrants is largely unknown.

### **Housing**

4.11 There is limited data on migrants' access to housing. The Labour Force Survey provides data on housing tenure, including use of social housing by people living in the UK who were born abroad. However, it is not possible to distinguish recent migrants from others who migrated to the UK at some stage of their lives. Therefore, studies of migrants and housing, or access to services more generally are the most useful source of data on this issue. Some studies which look at a range of services have identified housing as a key area in terms of migrants' needs (Orchard *et al*, 2007). Others have a specific focus on housing, usually within a defined geographical area. Some research has looked at the needs and impact of particular groups, including A8 migrant workers (Tribal, 2008) and the Roma community in Glasgow (Poole and Adamson, 2008).

### ***Access to housing***

4.12 A wide range of studies observe that A8 migrants are housed largely in private rented accommodation (Collins, 2007; Orchard *et al*, 2007; Blake Stevenson, 2007a; Hall Aitken, 2007a; Tribal, 2008). The main reason for this appears to be the relatively easy access to such accommodation (Tribal, 2008) combined with more limited access to other forms of housing. There is some evidence that migrant workers find difficulty in accessing accommodation in specific locations where there is already a relatively pressurised housing market. For example, research on migrant workers in the Highlands and Islands found accommodation problematic because of a shortage of affordable housing (de Lima *et al*, 2005). Research on migrants' use of services in Edinburgh found migrants had experienced difficulties in accessing accommodation because of high rental prices, deposits and lack of references (Orchard *et al*, 2007). Employers recruiting migrant workers have identified housing as a major need of this workforce: local housing shortages are reported as a reason why employers in some sectors, for example agriculture and tourism, provide tied accommodation (de Lima *et al*, 2007).

### ***Types of housing accessed by migrants***

4.13 As stated above, studies report a concentration of migrants in the private rented sector. There is also some provision of accommodation through employers or employment agencies. In comparison, migrants have achieved limited access to social housing, including local authority accommodation and have very low rates of owner occupation.

4.14 The limited impact of migration on the public rented housing sector is generally explained by local authorities' interpretation of their obligations in relation to providing accommodation. It is widely understood that access to social rented housing is restricted to individuals who have worked continuously in the UK for at least 12 months and who are therefore entitled to benefits, including housing benefit (Coote, 2006; Blake Stevenson, 2007a). However, this is not altogether clear. Inconsistencies have been found between local authorities' interpretation of homelessness legislation in relation to migrants (Collins, 2007) and it is reported that local authorities would like clearer guidance on their obligations towards migrants who are not yet eligible for benefits (Coote, 2006). This confusion is, unsurprisingly, found among migrants themselves (see below). This situation has been recently clarified by the Scottish Government which has confirmed the same housing entitlements for all European citizens, including A8 migrants, effectively removing the requirement to have worked in the UK for 12 months. However, A8 migrants in public housing who become unemployed or are otherwise unable to pay rent may become homeless because they cannot claim benefits within the first 12 months of arrival (Poole and Adamson, 2008).

4.15 Despite the lack of clarity in migrant entitlements, there are reports that some local authorities, for example Edinburgh, are offering types of social housing to migrants with less than 12 months' residence (Blake Stevenson, 2007a:51). There is also evidence that migrants have accessed social housing in areas of low demand in some cities, for example Aberdeen (de Lima *et al*, 2007). In addition to local authority accommodation, social housing



is provided by housing associations. There is greater clarity concerning the right of migrants to access housing association accommodation and in some areas of Scotland, for example Glasgow, A8 migrants have accessed this type of accommodation, although in fairly small numbers (Blake Stevenson, 2007a). Some research indicates that, where migrants have accessed social housing, this has led to other family and friends joining them from their home country (Tribal, 2008). This suggests that access to social housing may have an impact on levels of migration by encouraging settlement and further movement into Scotland. There is also some evidence that migrants are deterred from accepting social housing by perceptions that it is located in undesirable or dangerous localities and of poor quality (Collins, 2007; de Lima *et al*, 2007).

4.16 There is some evidence of variation in housing of migrants between areas of Scotland. One variation is apparent between urban and rural areas in the type of housing accessed by migrant workers, with A8 migrants in rural areas more likely to be offered accommodation by an employer than those in urban areas (Blake Stevenson, 2007a; de Lima *et al*, 2007). Research in Dumfries and Galloway found more than a third of A8 migrants had accommodation organised for them by their employer or by a recruitment agency (Hall Aitken, 2007a). There is evidence that employers in particular sectors are more likely to offer accommodation. These include agriculture, hospitality and tourism and construction (de Lima *et al*, 2007; Metcalf *et al*, 2008).

### ***Housing pathways and homelessness***

4.17 With regard to A8 migrants, there is widespread agreement that it is common practice among this group to search for accommodation independently, rather than make use of housing services. Word of mouth and newspaper advertisements are reported to be the main methods used by migrants to find accommodation (de Lima *et al*, 2007). A number of studies report low rates of use of housing services, sometimes combined with fairly low levels of awareness of this provision (Blake Stevenson, 2007a). Research suggests that while many migrants experience homelessness, this is only temporary and takes the form of living with friends or family and sometimes in bed and breakfast accommodation. A survey of 262 A8 migrants in Glasgow found that 55 per cent had experienced some form of homelessness, but in most cases this was for up to three weeks and was rarely more than a month (Blake Stevenson, 2007a). A number of studies describe the typical pathway for A8 migrants as initial accommodation with friends or family and then into private rented accommodation (Tribal, 2008). Clearly, this pathway is more feasible for single migrants or couples, and reflects the predominance of this pattern of migration.

4.18 Some regionally based studies report difficulties experienced by migrants in finding accommodation (Scottish Economic Research, 2006; Blake Stevenson, 2007a; de Lima *et al*, 2007). This does not appear to result in increased pressure on housing or advice services. Studies report low rates of use of housing services and housing advice as well as low levels of awareness of rights (Hall Aitken, 2007a; Tribal, 2008). Available evidence

suggests that migrants who report problems in finding accommodation do not look for help but rely on assistance from within the migrant community or word of mouth (ODS Consulting, 2007). This is believed to be for reasons including not knowing where to look, not understanding entitlements and language barriers (Coote, 2006; Orchard *et al*, 2007:35; Tribal, 2008). However, there are suggestions that migrants are becoming more aware of how to access social housing and that this may reduce accommodation problems, where such housing is available (Sim *et al*, 2007; Tribal, 2008).

4.19 There are some reports of homelessness among migrants, although where numbers are given, these are small (Tribal, 2008). There are indications that much homelessness among migrants is temporary, experienced on arrival and soon resolved (Blake Stevenson, 2007a), although homelessness has also been reported to result from loss of employment (Collins, 2007; de Lima *et al*, 2007). A survey of local authorities for the Scottish Council for Single Homeless in 2006 found authorities experiencing rising levels of homelessness among A8 migrants, with rates varying between regions (Coote, 2006). This research suggests that migration is having some impact on housing demands through homelessness among migrants. The report's authors identify a need for greater awareness of the needs of migrants and the development of more formal policy in relation to services for this group (Coote, 2006:5).

#### ***Quality of housing accessed by migrants***

4.20 A number of studies refer to the poor quality of accommodation accessed by migrants. Reported problems include high rents and affording deposits, the standard of accommodation, including poor condition and furnishings, cleanliness and hygiene and over-crowding (ODS Consulting, 2006; Orchard *et al*, 2007; Hall Aitken 2007a; Sim *et al*, 2007; de Lima *et al*, 2007). While the cost of accommodation is generally reported to be high, particularly in comparison to wages, some studies also refer to relatively low rents in some areas of the country as attracting migrants, deterred by higher rental prices elsewhere in the UK (ODS Consulting, 2007). With regard to issues of quality, particular concerns have been expressed at overcrowding, which is thought to be more prevalent in accommodation rented by migrants (Coote, 2006). There are indications that these problems may be particularly pronounced in accommodation provided by employers (Citizens Advice Scotland, 2006).

4.21 A number of studies note the role of employers in providing accommodation for migrants when they first arrive in the country. While this is seen as assisting migrants (Sim *et al*, 2007), the quality of accommodation provided by employers has been reported to be generally low. This accommodation includes caravans and out-houses, is often of poor quality, over-crowded and charged at varying, sometimes unclear, rates (de Lima *et al*, 2007; Metcalf *et al*, 2008). This is in addition to the major limitation of tied accommodation being available only while the individual continues to work for that particular employer.

4.22 The quality of housing has also been raised specifically in relation to groups such as the Roma population in the Govanhill area of Glasgow and asylum seekers and refugees in the city. The Slovakian Roma population is concentrated in private rental property of very poor quality because of low wages, high levels of unemployment and low levels of WRS registration which restricts their access to social housing (Poole and Adamson, 2008).

### ***Implications***

4.23 What then are the implications for housing supply of recent migration into Scotland? There is currently little impact on demand for social housing, although this may change as migrants settle in the UK, become eligible and require family sized accommodation. Currently, any pressure on housing is likely to be largely in the private rented sector and in rural communities. There is some evidence of additional pressure on the supply of affordable housing and on housing costs (Blake Stevenson, 2007a and 2007b). However, supply at this end of the housing market appears to be strong, so that the impact on rentals and on availability of accommodation is likely to be minimal. There are concerns about the quality of housing accessed by migrants and increased over-crowding and poor conditions generally may increase pressures on local authorities for inspection and action.

### ***Key points***

- A8 migrants are housed largely in private rented accommodation. A typical pathway is for new migrants to stay initially with friends or relatives and then into their own private rented housing. Any pressure on housing supply is likely to be found in this sector, yet there is little evidence of a shortage.
- The limited impact of migration on the public rented housing sector is explained by local authorities' interpretation of their obligation in relation to housing migrants. Despite being technically ineligible, migrants with less than 12 months' residence are being offered types of social housing by some authorities. There are suggestions that provision of social housing may encourage further migration into Scotland.
- Some studies report that migrants experience difficulties in finding accommodation but do not seek formal advice. Employers in some industry sectors, including agriculture and hospitality play a role in providing accommodation. The poor quality of housing has been raised in relation to this accommodation and in relation to housing made available through the NASS scheme to asylum seekers and refugees.

### **Schools and children**

4.24 Little research has been carried out on the impact of migration on education and schools services in Scotland and even less has been published on children and social care. The publications used for this review are listed in Appendix B. With regard to education, analyses of impact have relied on statistical data, while recognising its problems and limitations. As Chapter 2 explained, the main issue in relation to education data is that migrant children can only be identified indirectly, through the main language spoken at home. This means that:

- migrants whose main language is English are not identified;
- some children will erroneously be identified as migrants, for example where three generations live together and it was the first generation who were migrants;
- British-born children of migrants and migrant children cannot be distinguished; and
- there is no information on date of entry to the UK.

4.25 Education statistics compiled by the Scottish Government show that between 2006 and 2007 the number of children enrolled in Scottish schools whose main home language is neither English nor Gaelic increased by around 3,000 (Scottish Government, 2008e). At the same time, the overall number of pupils in publicly funded schools has been falling, alongside general population decline. Therefore the rise in the number of migrant pupils has not resulted in an overall increase in pupil numbers although given that migration is unevenly spread across Scotland, increases may have occurred in localities and individual schools. Asylum seekers and refugees, for example, are highly concentrated in Glasgow schools because the city is a refugee dispersal region: over 1500 asylum seeking children attend school in Glasgow, and two thirds of these are in primary school (COSLA, 2007). Pupils from A8 countries, largely Poland, are more widely distributed. However, in sixteen local authorities, Polish is the most common non-English language (Scottish Government, 2008e).

4.26 Available evidence suggests that migration may be increasing demands on schools to provide English language tuition to enable pupils to access the curriculum. The number of pupils assessed as having English as an Additional Language (EAL), or being 'new to English' has increased as a result of A8 migration (Scottish Government, 2008).

### ***Local area studies***

4.27 A small number of local studies of migration and its impacts have looked at education as one of a number of service areas. Studies refer to increased pressures on schools and local authorities, particularly in demand for places and for English language support services. A number of local authorities report significant increases in demand for EAL support for pupils at primary and secondary schools. Unpublished research in one local authority area concludes that *'The increasing number of children from migrant worker families has put a strain on the current EAL staffing levels which need urgent review'*. The cost of providing EAL support to 50 pupils has been estimated by Edinburgh City Council at roughly £33,000 a year, based on the cost of employing an EAL teacher (Edinburgh City Council, 2008). These costs are met by local authorities from within their education budget.

4.28 Research on the Slovakian Roma community in Govanhill, Glasgow reports a number of impacts on schools attended by Roma pupils. These include poor or fluctuating levels of attendance and pupil retention resulting from the practice within this community of returning to Slovakia to attend family events. The Roma community is also seen as requiring resources to build levels of trust, which have been lacking as a result of experiences of

racism and exclusion within the Slovakian education system (Blake Stevenson, 2007a; Poole and Adamson, 2008).

### ***Schools' responses to diversity***

4.29 There are indications from research that teachers and schools have not sufficiently adapted to migration and an increase in pupils from Black or Ethnic Minority (BME) groups. According to research commissioned by the Scottish Government, a common approach is to ignore differences between pupils rather than openly appreciating and acknowledging diversity, or dealing with issues of identity, discrimination and inclusion (Arshad *et al*, 2005). This has the effect of ignoring the contribution of diverse cultures to school life. The study found parents having to work hard to assert ethnic, cultural and linguistic identities for their children to counteract ethnocentricity. It is not known whether white migrant pupils have similar experiences in Scottish schools and this is an area in need of research. Other research, more specifically on migrants and based on in-depth research in two UK schools, similarly concludes that

4.30 *'A recognition of students as 'migrants', in particular, and the provision of support on this basis could significantly improve inclusion, with important resonances for wider community cohesion'* (Reynolds, 2008:27).

4.31 Other research, focused specifically on Scotland, has identified a number of features of good practice in schools in relation to migrants who arrive as asylum seekers and refugees (Candappa *et al*, 2007). A number of these relate to the impact of migration on schools and include training mainstream teachers to provide support to pupils new to English, and practices to promote cohesion and reduce racism and bullying.

### ***Children and social care***

4.32 Most research and data in relation to children relates to education, and there is little data or research on children and social care. The exception to this is research covering refugee and asylum seeking children in Glasgow, published by the Scottish Refugee Council (2006) and Save the Children (2002; 2004; 2006). This research looks largely at the needs of this group rather than its impact on services. This impact is largely confined to Glasgow, because the City Council has a contract to support and accommodate asylum seekers under contract to the National Asylum Support Service (NASS). Glasgow is the only dispersal site in Scotland and is among the largest in the UK. Because of asylum seeker numbers and needs, services for asylum seekers and refugees are concentrated in the city.

4.33 The Save the Children research (2002) confirms the need for sustained resources for services to assist refugee families with settlement and integration. It conveys the extent of racial harassment experienced by asylum seekers and refugees in Glasgow and the need for initiatives and resources to deal with this problem. The research also emphasises the need for new efforts and approaches for providing information and advice to asylum seekers, including to young people, and for building good relations and rapport with authorities such as the police (2004).

4.34 Save the Children has also drawn attention to the lack of entitlement of asylum seekers to under-five provision (2004; 2006). Children from asylum seeking families are allocated places only after the needs of all other 3-4 year olds in the city have been met. Those who do not obtain places are likely to be less prepared than others for primary school and may be in more need of support. Where children from asylum seeking families are in nursery education, additional demands are placed on providers because there is no formalised provision, for example translation and interpretation (Save the Children, 2006).

4.35 Particular issues surround the needs of unaccompanied asylum-seeking children. There is a difficulty in making such assessments of levels of need and of impact because of the absence of data on numbers in this group. Statistics are available for the UK as a whole so that the number settling in Scotland is not recorded. However, research by the Scottish Refugee Council conveys the multiple needs of young people and their need for intensive and quality support services, particularly in relation to education (Scottish Refugee Council, 2006).

### **Key points**

- There has been very little research into the impact of migration on education, and on children and social care. There is evidence of increased demand for English language tuition to enable pupils to access the curriculum, but little evidence of increased demands for education services more generally. This may be explained by falling school rolls resulting from population decline in Scotland. However, the distribution of migrants is not even, resulting in clusters in some areas and schools.
- Research in relation to black and minority ethnic (BME) pupils suggests that schools may not sufficiently acknowledge different cultural, ethnic and linguistic identities. There is a need for research to look at whether approaches have changed as a result of recent migration and to identify good practice.
- Research has highlighted the circumstances and needs of child asylum seekers and refugees and their needs for continuing support.

### **Health**

4.36 The two main areas of interest in relation to migrants and health are first, the effect of migration on levels of demand for health services; and secondly, any public health impacts arising from migration, for example different health behaviours such as alcohol consumption. A third area of research of potential interest to migration and health are epidemiological studies relating to the health of minority groups. For example, research has been carried out on rates of heart disease and diabetes in the South Asian community in Glasgow (NHS Scotland, 2008). These studies do not distinguish between migrants and non-migrants within these populations, since this is not a concern of their research.

4.37 In Chapter 2 we described the NHS Central Register (NHSCR) from which information on the impacts of migration on health services might be obtained. This can be used to measure migration flows at the local authority and sub-authority level. These data sources have major limitations if used to calculate the *number* of migrants, since they depend on the migrant registering with a GP and also include short-term visitors. They also give little indication of migrants' demands and needs for health care services, since they record GP registrations only and do not cover GP use or access to other health care services. Research on migrants and health has therefore largely consisted of surveys or qualitative studies involving migrants. Studies referred to in this chapter are listed in Appendix B.

### ***Migrants' demands for health services***

4.38 Research suggests that migrants regard themselves as healthy (Orchard *et al*, 2007). This is to be expected because migrants are, on average, younger, more likely to be in employment and without children. This applies particularly to migrants from Eastern Europe who come to the UK for largely economic reasons. Research suggests that migrants regard themselves as healthy (Orchard *et al*, 2007). However, there are indications that migrants' needs for health services change as they decide to settle and to raise children in Scotland (Sim *et al*, 2007).

4.39 Local studies show low rates of registration and use of primary care services among A8 migrants. For example, research on A8 migrants in Glasgow found that only 58 per cent of respondents had registered with a GP and that only 32 per cent had used health services in the city (Blake Stevenson, 2007a). Research on migrant workers in Grampian found even lower rates of use with only a quarter of migrants reporting any contact with health services (de Lima *et al*, 2007). Local studies suggest that most migrants know how to access NHS services and only a minority are in need of more information on how to do this. It therefore seems likely that low rates of use reflect low levels of need, and possibly continued use of health services in migrants' home country during return visits. This practice is likely to change as migrants become more settled in the UK. Rates of registration with dental services are significantly lower than for primary health care. Research involving migrant workers in Dumfries and Galloway found that few had registered with a local dentist (Hall Aitken, 2007a). Again, it is likely that migrants continue to access dental services on home visits. As with primary care provision, greater permanent settlement of migrants may change this practice.

### ***Health risks of in-migration***

4.40 In addition to the impact on demand for health services, migration may also impact on particular services and specialties because of migrants' circumstances and behaviour. There has been little research on this issue and there appears to be no documented evidence that migrants engage in more hazardous behaviour, such as alcohol or drug misuse. With regard to communicable disease, research by Health Protection Scotland (2008) presents the range of risk factors for both migrants and the host population associated with migration. These include country of origin, the journey, the

arrival location and susceptibility (e.g. vaccine status). Particular health concerns are raised in the case of migrants experiencing trafficking or detention, for example. Health Protection Scotland notes that no assessment has been made of the health of the Scottish migrant population (2008:4). Surveillance data for TB and HIV has found these infections within the migrant populations of Scotland, although the risk of transfer of infections between migrants and the wider population has not been assessed (HPS, 2008:6)

### ***Asylum seekers and refugees***

4.41 Research by Naasra Roshan for NHS Glasgow (2005) brings together some of the evidence in relation to health and asylum seekers and refugees, drawing on wider evidence from the UK as a whole rather than Scotland. This review suggests that the health of this group is generally good and that mental health is a bigger issue than physical problems. This is also found in the Glasgow GoWell study (GoWell, 2008) and in other research reviewed by NHS Health Scotland (2008). Studies on the health of asylum seekers and refugees explain this with reference to the traumatic experiences of these migrants prior to arrival in the UK (Roshan, 2005) Roshan's view reports evidence that the health status of new migrants may deteriorate in the initial years following entry to the UK, primarily as a result of unfavourable socio-economic and environmental circumstances, including poverty, poor living conditions and social isolation (Roshan, 2005:3). Particular health problems may be experienced by women seeking asylum in the UK resulting from their previous experiences (Burnett et al, 2002) and by children, particularly unaccompanied minors who are at risk of various physical and mental health problems through displacement and lack of care (BMA, 2002). In relation to addiction, the review found that, while some groups of migrants may be vulnerable to developing drug problems as a result of their experiences and situation, there is no evidence of higher incidence of alcohol or drug use in migrant communities. The review also draws attention to language barriers and information gaps in migrant communities which can affect access to health care (Roshan, 2005).

4.42 Research with asylum seekers and refugees in North Glasgow, conducted as part of the NHS Glasgow study, found difficulties among migrants in accessing health services because of problems including language and registration. The research also identifies a range of health needs, many of which are unmet or require involvement of other support, for example from social services, as well as the health service. Research commissioned by the 'GoWell' partnership, also in Glasgow, while covering a sample of all households, has some particular observations in relation to asylum seekers and refugees. These largely concern well-being in relation to mental health, for example feelings of safety and satisfaction with housing (GoWell, 2006). These issues are explored in more depth in Chapter 4.6. Research specifically on the Roma community in Glasgow identifies particular barriers to health service use as a result of language and cultural issues (Poole and Adamson, 2008).



### **Key points**

- There is little evidence of any increased demand on health services resulting from in-migration. Research suggests that migrants make few demands on health services because they are, on average, younger, in employment and without children. It is generally agreed that this will change as migrants begin to settle but precisely how is currently not known.
- Studies suggest that migrants are aware of health service provision so that lack of information about services is unlikely to be a barrier to take-up. There is some evidence that migrants access health and dental services on return visits to their country of origin.
- There is little in-depth research on the health behaviour of migrants, including hazardous behaviour such as alcohol and drug misuse. It is thought that asylum seekers and refugees will be vulnerable to mental health problems, as a result of their experiences. However, there is little firm evidence relating to the prevalence of such problems in these and other migrant groups within Scotland.

### **ESOL**

4.43 Provision of English for Speakers of Other languages (ESOL) tuition is regarded by the Scottish Government as central to achieving key policy goals relating to migration. In particular, language skills assist individuals to settle, integrate, progress in work and to become active citizens (Scottish Government, 2007a). Studies looking at the employment of migrant workers have found lack of English language skills as a major factor in their concentration in unskilled jobs in low-paid sectors (see above). Therefore ESOL has a key role to play in increasing the supply of higher-level skills and in facilitating settlement. We identified a small number of studies of ESOL provision in Scotland which are listed in Appendix B.

4.44 Developments considered to potentially increase the demand for ESOL provision have included migration from the A8 countries of Eastern Europe and the accommodation of asylum seekers and refugees in Glasgow under the National Asylum Support Service (NASS). It has also been suggested that changes to the UK naturalisation regulations which require proof of English language competence might also increase demand, although there is little evidence for this.

4.45 The relative pressures of each of these developments on ESOL provision is not known. One of the largest studies of supply and demand for ESOL was carried out in 2004 and pre-dates much migration into Scotland from the A8 countries. This research found a number of gaps in supply, including a shortage of classes focussing on work and study, long waiting lists and variable supply outside of the main cities. The research also found that students rely on word of mouth to access provision and that coordination between providers is sometimes poor. Possibly as a result of increased demand for ESOL, volunteers make up a significant proportion of the teaching force and ESOL tutors are not always qualified (Rice *et al*, 2005). Some more

recent research, including local studies, reports long waiting lists for ESOL classes (Blake Stevenson, 2007b).

4.46 Additional Government funding since the 2005 research has resulted in an expansion of ESOL provision. This is accounted for by delivery through Community Learning and Development services (CLD) and Adult Literacy and Numeracy (ALN) (Scottish Government, 2007c). However, the voluntary sector and Further Education remain important providers of ESOL. The role of the voluntary sector in meeting demand for ESOL, arising from EU enlargement and citizenship requirements, is also evidenced by research carried out by Learning Link Scotland (2007). This research also highlights the role of word of mouth in recruitment of students and poor coordination of ESOL provision within regions.

4.47 More recent research, designed to examine the impact of A8 migration and citizenship requirements on ESOL demand and supply, confirms that despite overall growth ESOL provision remains variable. Long waiting lists in some areas suggest a level of unmet demand for ESOL among migrants (Scottish Government, 2007c; Beadle and Silverman, 2007). Research for Learning Link Scotland reports that, outside of the central belt, provision is centred on particular communities, including A8 migrants (Learning Link Scotland, 2007)., Research has also found an increase in provision in areas which had little ESOL provision in the past, for example the Highlands and Western Isles, the South West and the South East. This change is largely accounted for by the FE sector (Beadle and Silverman, 2007). An increase is also reported in courses offering accreditation and qualifications.

4.48 Research which looks at employment of migrants also refers to ESOL provision and some studies have noted the involvement of employers in facilitating access to courses (see above). At the same time, the demands of employment, including long hours and shift work have been cited as barriers to participation of migrant workers in ESOL classes (Beadle and Silverman, 2007). These studies suggest there is unmet demand for ESOL from migrant workers.

4.49 There is also evidence of unmet demand resulting from work commitments, distance from classes and transport difficulties (Scottish Government, 2007a). Research with asylum seekers and refugees has found childcare commitments and lack of crèche facilities restrict attendance at ESOL classes (Save the Children, 2006). Findings suggest a need for a range of provision, in terms of time of day and location, as well as level.

4.50 Gaps in data on ESOL provision are now being addressed by a National ESOL panel<sup>7</sup>. The Panel's mission is to...

*'lead the coordination of all aspects of the ESOL strategy across sectors, regions and interests. We will monitor the quantity and quality*

---

<sup>7</sup> The website of the national ESOL panel is <http://www.esolscotland.com/index.cfm>

*of ESOL provision in Scotland; and will seek to provide effective direction, representation and support for ESOL learners, providers and practitioners.'*

The panel aims to address inconsistencies in planning, coordination and provision across Scotland which have arisen through rapid growth in demand for ESOL.

### **Key points**

- Acquiring English language skills is widely recognised as key to settlement and integration of new migrants into Scotland. The demand for ESOL is reported to have increased in recent years through increased migration.
- There is evidence that, despite overall growth, ESOL provision remains patchy and there are waiting lists for classes. Some employers assist in providing access to ESOL classes, but migrants cannot always attend because of long and inflexible working hours.
- Gaps in data on ESOL provision are being addressed by a new National ESOL panel.

### **Community cohesion and equalities**

4.51 Migration can impact on the composition of communities in a number of ways. The lives of existing residents can be affected by changes in the population, and their attitudes and behaviours can impact on the integration of new arrivals. The UK Department for Communities and Local Government has defined community cohesion and integration in a way which emphasises the role of both migrants and locals in this process:

*4.52 Community cohesion is what must happen to all communities to enable different groups of people to get on well together. A key contributor to community cohesion is integration which is what must happen to enable new residents and existing residents to adjust to one another' (CLG, 2008:10).*

4.53 The experiences of migrants, and the ease or difficulty with which they can integrate into local communities, can be key to whether they stay or leave. This chapter looks at evidence from both sides: at the views of locals and the experiences of migrants. The studies referred to in this chapter are listed in Appendix B.

### **Attitudes towards migration**

4.54 Evidence from a number of surveys suggests that the Scottish public is more welcoming of migrants than in other parts of the UK. For example, data from the British Social Attitudes Surveys suggest that outside London, the Scottish public are the least opposed to immigration (Bromley et al, 2007).

4.55 The Scottish Social Attitudes Survey found some concern among respondents about the impact of migration on jobs, with nearly a third agreeing that Eastern European migration makes it more difficult for others to find a job (Bromley et al, 2007). However, other research shows a more mixed picture, particularly when attitudes are compared with the rest of the UK.

Research by IPPR covering 6 locations, including 2 in Scotland, found that respondents in Scotland were more assertive about the economic benefit of migration, and in particular migrants' willingness to take jobs which locals reject. More generally, the research explains the more positive attitude of the Scottish public to migration, in comparison to the rest of the UK, with reference to a number of factors: the relatively small scale of migration into Scotland, the strong sense of national identity, political leadership on migration and more balanced media coverage (Pillai, 2007).

4.56 Local studies show a varied picture, with a 45 per cent of respondents to a survey in Argyll and Bute agreeing that migration is a good thing for the local economy, but with almost equal numbers agreeing and disagreeing to the statement that 'local services have been capable of accommodating incoming workers and families (IBP Strategy and Research, 2008). Other local studies refer to the importance of service providers working closely with local communities to ensure they understand the benefits of migration and the contribution they can make to economic and social life.

4.57 Some research has looked specifically at attitudes towards asylum seekers and refugees who, because the Government policy on dispersal are located largely in Glasgow. A Mori poll of 1,000 Scottish adults conducted in 2005 found that 46 per cent agree with the statement that 'the number of asylum seekers living in Scotland is a problem, with 26 per cent disagreeing with this view (Crawley, 2005). IPPR research conducted with residents of Dundee, Glasgow and Edinburgh, found many people to support the principle of asylum. However, open hostility to asylum seekers, and migrants more generally, was also found. They were seen as a threat to jobs and as a drain on public services, particularly housing. The research found evidence of confusion between asylum seekers and other migrants and minority groups, particularly migrants from A8 countries. The term 'asylum seeker' was found to be sometimes used as a catch-all term for anyone who is not white. Despite these negative findings, the research also found an awareness of some of the main policy messages in relation to migration, in particular that Scotland is under-populated. The research therefore concludes that more work should be done to put across such messages, to increase the flow of accurate information about asylum seekers and other migrants and to target work on challenging hostile attitudes at young people and children (Lewis, 2006).

### ***Migrants' experiences***

4.58 Chapter 3 looked at migrants' experiences of employment and there is some evidence that many have positive experiences of working in Scotland, despite working in jobs with low pay and limited prospects. The positive aspects of employment relate largely to relations with other workers. Just as there is limited evidence in relation to migrants' experiences at work, little research has been carried out on migrants' experiences of living in Scotland more generally. This applies particularly in relation to integration, rather than housing and employment. Available evidence on migrants' experiences has covered negative rather than positive experiences, focusing for example on crime and hostility rather than social networks and relationships.

4.59 A number of local studies have found a substantial minority of migrants have experience of hostility and crime: 17 per cent of A8 migrants in a Glasgow study said they had received verbal threats and 7 per cent had been physically attacked (Blake Stevenson, 2007a). Similarly, almost one in four of 904 migrant workers in Fife said they had experienced verbal abuse and 5 per cent had experienced physical abuse because of their ethnicity or nationality (Fife Partnership, 2007).

4.60 Research on the experiences of young people and children from families seeking asylum in Glasgow has found experiences of racism and violence to be common, both in local communities and sometimes in schools. Research by Save the Children found that young people of secondary school age rate 'feeling safe' as the hardest aspect of life in Glasgow and parents expressed concern about their children's safety because of racism in the local community (Save the Children, 2002). Asylum seekers and refugee families were found to be concerned at the extent of drug and alcohol addiction and associated problems in their local area. Other issues concern the quality of housing and generally poor condition of the neighbourhoods in which asylum seekers and refugees have been housed. Later research confirmed these findings and noted that statutory agencies were not always aware of the extent and impact of racism experienced by refugees and asylum seekers (Save the Children, 2004).

4.61 There is believed to be significant under-reporting of such crimes for reasons which include fear and distrust of the police (Blake Stevenson, 2007a: 28). Other local research, looking more widely at integration from the perspective of migrants, identified a number of barriers, including language, information about services, the attitude of the media and attitude of locals (Wilson, 2007). There is some evidence that migrants in rural areas experience feelings of isolation (Kociolek, 2007). Other research suggests that migrants find Scotland a pleasant and friendly place to live in. However, migrants report being prevented from taking part in activities which would enable them to integrate better by their long working hours (de Lima *et al*, 2007). The absence of robust data on migrants' experiences of living in Scotland represents a serious gap in knowledge. Greater understanding of the positive features of life in Scotland, and problems faced by new arrivals in integrating, is essential to inform policy aimed at attracting and retaining migrant workers.

### **Key points**

- There is evidence that the Scottish public is more welcoming of migrants than in other parts of the UK, excluding London, and recognises the economic importance of migration. At the same time there is evidence that migrants, and asylum seekers in particular, are seen as a threat to jobs.
- Migrants report positive experiences of living and working in Scotland. However, it is not usual for migrants to be victims of hostility and crime. Asylum seekers and refugees have been targets of racism, including violence.

- There is evidence that some migrants feel isolated. Possibilities to integrate may be limited in rural communities and where migrants work long hours.

### **Crime and justice**

4.62 The relationship between migration and crime/justice can be looked at in two ways: the contribution of migrants to criminal activity; and criminal activity perpetrated against migrants. As we explain in Chapter 2, there is little robust evidence concerning the impact of migration on crime, particularly in relation to migrants as offenders.

4.63 One potential source of data is the number of foreign nationals in UK or Scottish jails. However, many such prisoners could not be accurately described as migrants: a relatively high proportion have been convicted of smuggling drugs into the UK or use the UK as a criminal base rather than a place of residence.

4.64 Lack of information on the criminal history of migrants is a serious issue for employers recruiting to jobs involving contact with vulnerable groups. Disclosure Scotland, the service responsible for vetting and barring as provided for in the Protection of Vulnerable Groups (Scotland) Act 2007, works under UK legislation and has no jurisdiction to obtain criminal history information from other countries. Moreover, not all foreign countries have a system of recording information. Poland, for example, has no equivalent of Disclosure Scotland.

4.65 There is little firm evidence in relation to criminal activity by migrants, although this has been an area of much speculation and anecdote. There are reports from police services in England, concerning the involvement of migrants in drink-driving and knife crime (Daily Mail, November 4, 2008). However, there is little firm evidence, both UK wide and in Scotland on the contribution of migrants to levels of criminal activity.

4.66 Crime involving migrants, either as suspects or victims, can lead to increased demand for translation and interpretation services. Under the 1998 Human Rights Act Police forces have a legal obligation to provide an interpreter in cases where foreign nationals are arrested and charged or act as witnesses. This is reported to have led to a substantial increase in demand for translation services and therefore the cost of this provision. Between 2003/4 and 2007/8 the cost of providing court translators for people accused of crimes in Scotland more than trebled. Particularly large increases are reported for Aberdeen, while Glasgow and Strathkelvin sheriff courts have the highest interpreter costs (Press and Journal, 5<sup>th</sup> January 2009).

4.67 Knowledge about criminal activity perpetrated against migrants is even more limited than information about involvement of migrants in crime. Research on employment of migrant workers reports breaches of employment protection legislation and of health and safety at work and in housing of migrant workers (CAB Scotland, 2006). There are also media reports of

employment of illegal migrants (BBC on-line, 10 July, 2008). There is evidence of increased levels of hate crime, such as verbal abuse and forms of discrimination, against migrants (ACPOS). Police forces have stated that increases in hate crime may not be due to increases in offences but to improved reporting mechanisms now in place. However, local studies which have asked about migrants' experiences of hostility and crime suggest that these experiences are not unusual: 17 per cent of A8 migrants in a Glasgow study said they had received verbal threats and 7 per cent had been physically attacked (Blake Stevenson, 2007a). Strathclyde police are reported as stating that such crimes are under-reported because of fear and distrust of the police or because of reluctance among unregistered workers to make contact with law enforcement agencies (Ibid: 28).

4.68 With regard to criminal activity, human trafficking is an issue of some concern, particularly because it is non-consensual in nature. UK wide research conducted by the Home Office reports that victims are found in a wide variety of UK geographical areas, with high concentrations in industries employing migrant workers (Dowling *et al*, 2007). Research specifically on child trafficking into Scotland by Save the Children comments on the lack of structure to collect, collate or analyse information on child trafficking in the UK. This leads to difficulties in measuring its extent and impact. The research findings suggest an increase in cases of trafficking, reported by solicitors acting for trafficked individuals, housing workers, social workers and other stakeholders (Save the Children, 2006).

4.69 With regard to illegal migration more generally, increases have been reported in detentions of foreign nationals at Scottish ports and airports (BBC News, 25 April, 2008<sup>8</sup>): According to figures provided to the BBC by Dumfries and Galloway Constabulary, numbers of foreign nationals detained at the ports of Stranraer and Cairnryan increased from 117 in 2004 to 259 in 2007.

### **Key points**

- There is little evidence in relation to criminal activity by migrants, although this has been an area of speculation and anecdote.
- Knowledge of criminal activity perpetrated against migrants is even more limited, although research suggests they are victims of hate crime, breaches of employment law and human trafficking.

### **Rural localities**

4.70 It has been noted that many A8 migrants have found employment in rural areas, while earlier migration centred on cities (Jentsch *et al*, 2007). The principal reason for this is the high demand for labour in the agriculture and hospitality sectors and seasonal fluctuations in this demand which make local recruitment difficult. Further factors in the employment in migrant labour are the low pay and undesirable conditions of some of this work and the out-migration of local people from isolated rural areas (de Lima *et al*, 2005). A

---

<sup>8</sup> [http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/scotland/south\\_of\\_scotland/7362589.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/scotland/south_of_scotland/7362589.stm)

number of issues arising from migration into rural areas have been raised in this report, and some key findings are summarised here.

4.71 A number of local area studies report some of the experiences of migrants living in isolated rural communities. In relation to access to services, a study, which included interviews with 25 A8 migrants in the Highlands and Islands, reports problems in accessing affordable housing. Other studies have found A8 migrants are more likely to be offered accommodation by their employer than those working in urban areas (Blake Stevenson, 2007a; de Lima *et al*, 2007). Other services, for example ESOL provision have also been found to be more limited in rural areas (Beadle and Silverman, 2007).

4.72 Research looking at migrants' experiences of living in rural areas of Scotland report that some migrants feel isolated (Kociolek, 2007). They experience difficulties in making visits to cities and to their home country, particularly from the Islands. They are poorly integrated into local communities and mix largely with fellow migrants (de Lima *et al*, 2005). In some cases this is because their long working hours allow little time for other activity (de Lima *et al*, 2007). Other factors include weak English skills and childcare responsibilities (de Lima *et al*, 2005). de Lima and colleagues also report a reluctance to socialise arising from a concern not to experience hostility fuelled by drunkenness. In a later piece of research, de Lima and colleagues report evidence relating to mental health problems among migrant workers resulting from factors including rural isolation (de Lima *et al*, 2007). However, this later research, involving interviews with 87 migrant workers gives examples of migrants taking part in local leisure activities and social events organised by their employers.

### **Key points**

- Rural economies may have most to gain from migration because it helps to counteract out-migration and to meet local labour demands
- There is evidence that migrants have more difficulty accessing provision and services such as housing and ESOL in rural areas.
- Studies have found evidence that migrants are poorly integrated into some rural communities and that some may be largely reliant on fellow migrants and employers for social contact and activity.

## **Higher education and Fresh Talent**

### ***International students at Scottish universities***

4.73 In the academic year 2006-7 there were 33,740 overseas students enrolled at Scottish Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), 21,990 of whom were from outside of the EU (HESA, 2008). Overseas students account for almost one in six of all students at Scottish HEIs. Additional numbers are studying at Scottish colleges: in 2006-7 4,035 students on vocational courses at Scottish Further Education Colleges were domiciled overseas. Enrolment data for Higher Education suggests an upward trend in overseas students registrations, with increases of almost 100 per cent in numbers of non-EU registrations and of 50 per cent in EU registrations in the past five years



(HESA, 2008). This development is regarded as having a positive impact on the institutions in which they study, through payment of fees, and also as benefiting the economy, through supply of graduates. Universities Scotland estimates the fee contribution of overseas students at £181m in 2007-8 and the wider economic benefit at £172m. This has a positive impact on employment across the UK (Kelly *et al*, 2006).

4.74 Universities Scotland also draw attention to the role played by international students and staff in developing international research links and enhancing Scotland's standing in the education field. The economic benefits of overseas students are likely to be greatest in the major cities. Research commissioned by Aberdeen City Council estimates that the international student population of 5,000 makes an annual contribution of £67 million to the economy in fees and living expenses (Aberdeen City Council, 2008).

### ***Fresh Talent***

4.75 The Fresh Talent Initiative (FTI) programme was launched in 2003 to encourage in-ward migration. Among its main objectives were to promote Scotland as a place to live and work and to encourage international students to stay on after graduating through the Fresh Talent Working in Scotland scheme (FT:WISS). The emphasis of FTI is therefore on attracting skilled people to live and work in Scotland to help meet the current and future skill needs of the economy. FTI includes a wide range of projects and services, including a Relocation Advisory Service (RAS) and international scholarship programme (Rogerson *et al*, 2006).

4.76 FT:WISS was established to attract overseas students to stay in Scotland on graduation by allowing them to work for two years without the need for work permits. The scheme forms part of the wider Fresh Talent initiative aimed at attracting and retaining international talent in Scotland. Target groups include entrepreneurs, businesses looking to recruit migrants and Scots looking to return after a period working outside Scotland (Scottish Government, 2006b). It is viewed as an evolving policy, designed to respond to the changing needs of the Scottish economy.

4.77 An early review of Fresh Talent by the Scottish Government found the initiative to be working well in relation to number of participants in the scheme, but that graduates needed more support in staying on in Scotland and gaining permanent residency (Rogerson *et al*, 2006:9). The review also identified a need for closer employer involvement and development of work to attract returnee Scots. The FT:WISS is regarded as a success because of the number of students applying to stay in Scotland through enrolling in the scheme (Rogerson *et al*, 2006; Cavanagh *et al*, 2008). Over 8,000 have joined the scheme between 2005 and 2008 and universities have used FT:WISS to promote their institutions and courses (Cavanagh *et al*, 2008). However, features of the scheme are seen as in need of further work: there are concerns that graduates on FT:WISS may be working below their levels of skill and expectations, that they are in need of more support and that employer awareness needs to be raised.

4.78 The Fresh Talent initiative is supported by the Relocation Advisory Service (RAS) which offers free information and advice to individuals interested in studying, living and working in Scotland. RAS also provides a service to employers in Scotland looking to recruit staff from overseas. Recent evaluation of the advisory service concludes that there is scope for greater awareness of both RAS and of FT:WISS among Scottish businesses and recruitment agencies (MacLardie and Murray, 2008).

4.79 The new points-based system for migration into the UK has changed the status of FT:WISS, effectively extending it UK-wide<sup>9</sup>. FT:WISS and the new International Graduates Scheme are now included under Tier 1 of the new system, relating to post-study (see Chapter 5.3). Students graduating from all UK universities, and in addition HND students in Scotland, will be entitled to work for two years in the UK without a work permit. FT:WISS has therefore lost its competitive edge and other means of attracting highly skilled labour may need to be considered (Cavanagh *et al*, 2008).

### **Key points**

- Scotland has been successful in attracting international students who are seen as having a positive impact on the institutions in which they study, on the reputation of Scotland for study and research and on the economy more generally.
- The Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme (FT:WISS) has been found to be working well, with large numbers signing up to the scheme.
- Graduates on FT:WISS have been found to need more support to enable them to settle in Scotland in the long term and to ensure that they access jobs at their level of skill and expectations.
- Research has also identified a need for closer employer involvement and development work to attract returnee Scots.
- With the extension of FT:WISS to the whole of the UK, Scotland has lost its competitive edge and may need to consider other means of attracting talent.

---

<sup>9</sup> The system has 5 tiers covering workers at varying skill levels, students and temporary worker (see Home Office, 2006).

## **CHAPTER 5. CONCLUSIONS: THE IMPACT OF MIGRATION INTO SCOTLAND**

5.1 The scope of this review has been wide, covering economic impact and social impacts across a range of areas, including health, housing and education. The review has drawn on evidence from a range of different sources: administrative and population survey data, surveys of migrants, employers and service providers, qualitative studies using a variety of methods and consultative and exploratory work. Much research on recent migration has aimed at improving knowledge of the impact of migration rather than on other aspects, such as services to migrants. The need for such knowledge is widely recognised: accurate and detailed data on migration is necessary to ensure that public services are funded adequately and that expansion of provision can be planned to meet demand. It is also needed to ensure that the economy and existing population are not adversely affected, but can benefit from migration.

5.2 Despite considerable research activity on migration issues, there are significant gaps in knowledge about the impact of migration on Scotland's economy and society. In this final chapter of the report we identify those which are of most immediate importance for policy development. The chapter also looks at what further work might be needed to inform future policy developments regarding migration into Scotland.

### **Limitations of data sources and studies**

5.3 The problems associated with calculating the number of migrants living and working in Scotland, and in the UK generally, are well recognised. They include administrative datasets recording in-flows only, datasets covering sub-populations of migrants and poor identification of migrants (as opposed to visitors or returning Scots). Such datasets provide minimal information about duration of stay. Data on the characteristics and activities of migrants is highly limited: administrative data is restricted to education and few national surveys both identify migrants and have adequate sample sizes for analysis.

5.4 Recognition of the economic and social impact of migration has led to a growth in primary research in this area in recent years. There is now a sizeable body of research on migration into Scotland, which offers valuable insights in a number of key areas. Studies into migration and its impact vary considerably in scope, depth and use of methods. While some studies either look at employers, service providers or migrants, many tend to include either two or three of these groups as respondents. This is explained largely by the focus of much research, which is on local area impacts rather than on services. By including several respondent groups, this research can incorporate a range of perspectives. The disadvantage of this approach is that it has led to resources being spread thinly so that findings are broad rather than detailed.

5.5 Surveys intending to quantify responses often involve small sample sizes and, in some studies, low response rates raise the possibility of bias.

Some studies using qualitative methods lack the detailed analysis that one would expect of this method, and findings from small-scale investigations are sometimes presented quantitatively. The methods used in some studies are unclear, particularly in relation to actual and achieved samples and in the detail of methods used.

5.6 Some of the shortcomings of studies on migration are explained by inherent difficulties in research in this area. Investigation into the impact of migration has been impeded by poor monitoring systems among service providers. In the absence of recording and monitoring systems, research has relied on service providers' estimates of migrants' use of services.

### **Gaps in evidence**

5.7 There are many gaps in evidence relating to migration, and a number of these relate to its impact on employment, services and society. There are some areas where evidence is very limited and where general evidence of impact is required. These include the areas of health, crime, education, children and social care. In other areas, information needs are more specific, for example the intentions of migrants to stay and their aspirations in relation to movement into more skilled work.

5.8 The main gaps in knowledge identified in the review are grouped into six areas with key points highlighted in bold. This is not an exhaustive list of gaps and research needs, but an indication of key areas in which improved knowledge could be used to assist policy development on migration impacts. Some of these can be addressed within Scotland, while others fall into the wider remit of UK policy on migration and cohesion.

### **Employment**

5.9 Numerous data sources and studies show the concentration of migrants into low skilled and low paid work. There is evidence that many migrants have unused skills and qualifications. As Brown and Danson point out, '....using people with high skills in low wage occupations is a huge waste of very valuable human capital. In order to maximise this resource a much more pro-active approach is required to embed and harness this valuable source of "talent" (2008:50). **The question of why migrants are concentrated in low skilled and low paid work has not been adequately addressed by research. More research is needed on migrants' aspirations and the barriers they face to gaining work which matches their skills and qualifications.**

5.10 There is a particular need to ensure that graduates staying in Scotland under the Fresh Talent initiative are able to make use of their skills and qualifications. **The employment experiences and progress made by graduates in the Fresh Talent programme should be monitored to ensure they are benefiting fully from the scheme.**

5.11 Some employers' concerns to meet immediate production needs result in poor employment practices in relation to migrant workers. There is

evidence of widespread use of short-term contracts, breaches of employment regulations and gender discrimination. **The extent of poor employment practices is not known, and it is important for research to establish because it may reduce the positive impact of migration, by resulting in high turnover, wastage of skills and return of migrants to their home countries.**

5. 12 We found no research in Scotland on self-employed migrants. This group of migrants may bring particular benefits to the local economies in which they trade. They may also have more opportunity to use their skills than migrants working for employers or through agencies. **Research is needed on self employed migrants. Among other benefits, this might identify any particular support needs to enable self employed migrants and small businesses to prosper in Scotland.**

### ***Migrants' perspectives and experiences***

5. 13 There is little detailed research involving migrants. As Jamieson and Davidson note, 'Migrants' lived experience is more often touched on than explored in depth' (2007:7). Where research has explored migrants' experiences this has usually been in relation to employment or service use rather than their experience of living in Scotland more generally. Consequently, there is a significant gap in knowledge about migrants' experiences of living and working in Scotland. **Gaining a greater understanding of migrants' perspectives and experiences of living in different areas of the country is important to inform Scottish Government policy aimed at attracting and retaining migrants. Therefore, research is needed on migrants' intentions and aspirations.**

5. 14 **Further research is needed on migrants' use of services because the reasons for the low impact in areas such as health and housing are not known.** In particular, while there is evidence of low take-up among migrants, it is unclear whether migrants do not know about their entitlements, or are knowledgeable yet choose not to take them up. A number of studies comment on the 'self sufficiency' of migrants, but the effectiveness of networks is not known. There are also particular needs for knowledge on migrants' experiences in the areas of settling and integrating, as described below.

### ***ESOL***

5. 15 English language provision is regarded as central to achieving goals relating to migration and gaps in provision are being addressed. While there are reports of long waiting lists for ESOL, employers report poor English language among job applicants and employees. **The barriers to learning English need to be examined further, including how migrants can be assisted to improve language skills.** The barriers may vary between areas of the country. They may be practical to do with work and other responsibilities; motivational, reflecting plans for short-term stay; or reflect migrants' lack of integration into their local communities.

### ***Education***

5. 16 Little is known about the impact of migration on education, although there are reports of the costs involved in language support and of over-stretched translating and interpreting services. Education is an area where the effects of migration are potentially very positive, boosting falling rolls and increasing cultural, ethnic and linguistic diversity. **There is scope for research into whether schools are acknowledging the contribution of migrant children and to identify good practice in inclusion and diversity.** Such research would help to raise awareness of the positive impact of migration across different regions of Scotland.

5. 17 The focus of research on migrants has been on adults and there is very little information about the experiences of children and young people. Research on the experiences of asylum seekers suggests that they have problems adjusting to life in Scotland. **Further research involving children and young people from a range of migrant communities would help to build a more complete picture of their experiences and needs.** At a local level, this research could help local authorities to develop and enhance their services for children and young people.

### ***Housing***

5. 18 The impact of migration on housing is an area in need of regular review and monitoring as migrants become eligible for social housing and as local authorities interpret eligibility in different ways. Research suggests that the main impact of migration has been, and continues to be, on the private rented sector. However, impacts on housing are likely to change as migrants settle in the UK and require family sized accommodation. This may add to the costs of housing services in local authorities. **Research is needed in order to review evidence of additional pressure on the supply of affordable housing and on housing costs.**

5. 19 The poor standard of housing is an issue raised by some research. **The quality of housing is in need of further exploration, because of the dangers associated with over-crowding and poor living conditions, and the possible influence of housing quality and costs on migrants' decisions to stay or leave.**

### ***Community impacts and cohesion***

5. 20 There is evidence that Scottish Government's positive approach to migration has influenced attitudes, and raised awareness of the economic contribution of migrants. However, migrants experience hostility and abuse and are not integrated into local communities. This is likely to increase costs of policing, as well as affecting the health and well-being of migrants. **The circumstances in which hostility and abuse occur need to be better understood so that this problem can be addressed through policy and practice within Scotland and the UK as a whole.** Clearly, such experiences can directly affect migrants' decisions to settle in Scotland or to leave.

5. 21 Reasons for poor integration of migrants into some communities, for example in more isolated rural areas, are not known. They may include lack of

free time resulting from long working hours, lack of opportunities to mix with local people and different age profiles in migrant and local communities. A potential benefit of migration is in invigorating small and declining communities, and this requires integration of host and migrant populations. **More research is need on barriers and facilitators to community integration, with good practice examples.**

5. 22 The issue of law breaking among migrant communities is an area of considerable anecdote and speculation, fuelled by reports from police services and media coverage reports based on police reports. Misinformation of this type has the potential to influence public feeling towards migrants, undermine cohesion and may lead to hostility and abuse. **There is a need for clearer evidence on the contribution of migrants to criminal and civil law-breaking.**

### **The future**

5. 23 Much research points to the positive impact of migration into Scotland, particularly in relation to economic and employment benefits. However, a degree of uncertainty surrounds the continuation of current trends in migration. This results from developments within the UK and elsewhere in Europe. On the first of these, changes in UK immigration policy are likely to have a particular impact on the flow of migrants from outside of the EU. The newly implemented points system replaces more than 80 different routes of entry to work or study with five tiers:

- 1: Highly skilled people;
- 2: Skilled workers with a job offer in areas of work identified as having skills gaps;
- 3: Low skilled workers in small numbers to meet temporary labour shortages
- 4: Students;
- 5: Young people and temporary workers admitted for a limited period to meet non-economic objectives.

5. 24 Scotland may have some flexibility with regard to meeting temporary labour shortages, but the emphasis of the new system is purposefully on facilitating entry of skilled individuals. Labour market research suggests strongly that current migration into Scotland is largely meeting needs of low skilled labour. Unless flexibility enables Scotland to source low skilled migrants from outside the EU, these needs will have to be met through migration within the EU, including UK workers. This may result in problems for some sectors, particularly if current migrants succeed in gaining work which matches their skills and qualifications. The supply of labour may be increased when nationals from and Romania have free movement, although this may not be until 2011. Further EU enlargement offers some possibilities but, with the exception of Turkey, prospective accession states generally have small populations and large-scale migration is not considered likely (Wright, 2008).

5. 25 Research suggests that many A8 migrants leave their home countries because of unemployment and low standards of living. As the economies of A8 countries and the UK change, wages and job opportunities in A8 countries

may improve, attracting migrants to return and others to stay. If this process gains momentum, policy aimed at attracting and retaining migrants will need to be more informed by quantitative and qualitative research data.

5.26 A further factor which may reduce the supply of current migrants to Scotland is the action of other EU member states, where entry restrictions currently apply to A8 nationals. By 2011 nationals from the A8 accession countries will have free movement across all EU member states, offering them a wider choice of locations in which to live and work. Given the relatively long distance between Eastern Europe and Scotland, A8 nationals may choose to travel shorter distances to live and work. Scotland may therefore need to consider offering incentives to attract migrants who have a wide choice of destinations.

5.27 These developments, along with the current global economic conditions, bring some uncertainty to future patterns of migration into Scotland. The review has highlighted what is known about current migration and identified a number of gaps. These are likely to change and new ones will emerge, as a result of economic and political developments across Europe and further afield. This requires research and data sources to be continually updated and developed to inform the range of policy agendas associated with migration.



## BIBLIOGRAPHY

AB Associates Ltd (2007). *Employer Study into the Impact of Migrant Workers in Orkney*. Orkney: Orkney Council.

[http://www.orkney.gov.uk/media/development%20services/orkneymigrantworkers\\_-\\_final\\_report.pdf](http://www.orkney.gov.uk/media/development%20services/orkneymigrantworkers_-_final_report.pdf)

Aberdeen City Council (2007). *Migrant Workers in Aberdeen City and Shire. Aberdeen*. Briefing Paper 2007/04. Aberdeen: Aberdeen City Council.

<http://www.aberdeencity.gov.uk/ACCI/nmsruntime/saveasdialog.asp?IID=12658&sID=3365>

Aberdeen City Council (2008). *The economic impact of international students in Aberdeen City*. Briefing Paper 2008/03. Aberdeen: Aberdeen City Council.

<http://www.aberdeencity.gov.uk/ACCI/nmsruntime/saveasdialog.asp?IID=16524&sID=3365>

Anderson, B., Rhus, M., Rogaly, B., and Spencer, S. (2006). *Fair enough? Central and East European migrants in low-wage employment in the UK*. York: JRF.

<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/1617-migrants-low-wage-employment.pdf>

Arai, L. (2005). *Migrants & public services in the UK: a review of the recent literature*. Oxford: Compas.

[http://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/publications/papers/Migrants\\_%20and\\_public\\_services.pdf](http://www.compas.ox.ac.uk/publications/papers/Migrants_%20and_public_services.pdf)

Argyll and Bute Council (2007a). *Migrant Workers (I) The Situation in Argyll and Bute*. Lochgilphead: Argyll and Bute Council.

[www.argyll-bute.gov.uk](http://www.argyll-bute.gov.uk)

Argyll and Bute Council (2007b). *Migration and Migrant Workers (II): Sources of Information*. Lochgilphead: Argyll and Bute Council.

[www.argyll-bute.gov.uk](http://www.argyll-bute.gov.uk)

Ayrshire Race Equality Partnership. (2005). *Assessing the Needs of Black and Minority Ethnic Residents of Ayrshire*. Ayr: Ayrshire Race Equality Partnership.

Audit Commission (2007). *Crossing borders: Responding to the local challenges of migrant workers*. London: Audit Commission.

<http://www.audit-commission.gov.uk/Products/NATIONAL-REPORT/05CA5CAD-C551-4b66-825E-ABFA8C8E4717/CrossingBorders.pdf>

Becker, S., Bryman, A. and Sempik, J. (2006) Defining 'Quality' in Social Policy Research. Social Policy Association.

Bellis, A. (2008). *Employer and education views on the new points-based system for managed migration*. Employment Studies Newsletter July 2008 No. 8: 5-6. Sussex: Employment Studies Institute.

<http://www.employment-studies.co.uk/news/es8art3.php>

Bhopal, R., Fischbacher, C.M., Steiner, M., Chalmers, J., Povey, C., Jamieson, J., and Knowles, D. (2007). *Ethnicity and health in Scotland: can we fill the information gap? A demonstration project focusing on coronary*

*heart disease and linkage of census and health records*. Edinburgh: The University of Edinburgh.

<http://www.chs.med.ed.ac.uk/phs/research/Retrocoding%20final%20report.pdf>

Blake Stevenson (2007a). *A8 Nationals in Glasgow*. Glasgow: Glasgow City Council

<http://www.asylumscotland.org.uk/assets/downloads/research/A8NationalsinGlasgowMay2007.pdf>

Blake Stevenson (2007b). *A8 Nationals in East Renfrewshire*. Giffnock: East Renfrewshire Council.

[www.eastrenfrewshire.gov.uk](http://www.eastrenfrewshire.gov.uk)

Blanchflower, D., Saleheen, J., and Shadforth, C. (2007). *The Impact of the Recent Migration from Eastern Europe on the UK Economy*. London: The Bank of England.

<http://www.bankofengland.co.uk/publications/speeches/2007/speech297.pdf>

Bonner, J., Baird, D., and Buchanan, D. (2007). *Review of the Population Basis of the Arbuthnott Formula*. Edinburgh: NRAC

[http://www.nrac.scot.nhs.uk/docs/docs/10th%20Meeting/NRAC\(2006\)5%20Review%20of%20Population%20Basis.doc](http://www.nrac.scot.nhs.uk/docs/docs/10th%20Meeting/NRAC(2006)5%20Review%20of%20Population%20Basis.doc)

Boyes, L. (2006). *Settling into Scotland? A review of existing data on Accession State migration to Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Council Foundation.

[http://www.scottishcouncilfoundation.org/u/settling\\_in\\_scotland.pdf](http://www.scottishcouncilfoundation.org/u/settling_in_scotland.pdf)

Brown, R., and Danson, M. (2008). *Fresh Talent or Cheap Labour? Accession State Migrant Labour in the Scottish Economy*. *Scottish Affairs*(64): 37 - 52.

British Medical Association, Board of Science and Education (2002), *Asylum Seekers: Meeting their Healthcare Needs*, London: BMA

Bromley, C., Curtice, J and Given, L (2007) *Attitudes To Discrimination In Scotland: 2006 Scottish Social Attitudes Survey*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government Social Research

Burnett, A., Peel, M. (2001) *Health Needs of Asylum Seekers and Refugees*, *British Medical Journal*. 322 (7285), 544-547

Candappa, M., Ahmad, M., Balata, B., Dekhinet, R., and Gocman, D. (2007). *Education and Schooling for Asylum Seeking and Refugee Students in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/198224/0052995.pdf>

Cavanagh, L., Eirich, F. and McLaren, J-G (2008) *Fresh Talent: Working In Scotland Scheme: An Evidence Review*. Scottish Government Social Research <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/235857/0064664.pdf>

Charlaff, L., Ibrani, K., Lowe, M., Marsden R. and Turney, L (2004) *Refugees and Asylum Seekers in Scotland: A Skills and Aspirations Audit*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government

<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2004/03/19165/35247>

Chase, E., Knight, A., and Statham, J. (2008). *Promoting the emotional wellbeing and mental health of unaccompanied young people seeking asylum in the UK*. London, Thomas Coram Research Unit.

[http://eprints.ioe.ac.uk/62/1/Asylum\\_research\\_summary.pdf](http://eprints.ioe.ac.uk/62/1/Asylum_research_summary.pdf)

Citizens Advice Scotland (2006) *Migrant Workers: Briefing Paper*. Edinburgh: Citizens Advice Scotland.

<http://www.cas.org.uk/FileAccess.aspx?id=2895>

City of Edinburgh Council. (2008). *Inward Migration: Policy and Strategy Committee*. Edinburgh: City of Edinburgh Council.

<http://www.edinburgh.gov.uk>

Coats, D. (2008). *Migration Myths: Employment, Wages and Labour Market Performance*. London: Work Foundation

[http://www.theworkfoundation.com/assets/docs/publications/33\\_migration%20myths.pdf](http://www.theworkfoundation.com/assets/docs/publications/33_migration%20myths.pdf)

Collins, M. (2007). *Housing, work and welfare experiences of new migrants in Scotland*. Glasgow: Door Step Equal Access.

[http://communityinfosource.files.wordpress.com/2007/03/doorstep\\_report\\_23march07.pdf](http://communityinfosource.files.wordpress.com/2007/03/doorstep_report_23march07.pdf)

Coote, D. (2006). *Homeless A8 migrants - the Scottish experience*. Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Single Homeless

<http://www.scsch.co.uk/>

COSLA (2007). *Strategic Plan 2007 - 2010. Strategic Migration Partnership*. Edinburgh: COSLA.

<http://www.asylumscotland.org.uk/>

COSLA and the Scottish Government (2007). *Concordat between The Scottish Government and COSLA*. Edinburgh, Scottish Government.

<http://www.cosla.gov.uk/attachments/aboutcosla/concordatnov07.pdf>

COSLA (2008). *Impact of Migration on Key Local Government Services*. Edinburgh: COSLA

<http://www.cosla.gov.uk/attachments/execgroups/cw/cw080416item08.doc>

Crawley, H. (2005) *Evidence on Attitudes to Asylum and Immigration: What We Know, Don't Know and Need to Know*, University of Oxford: Centre on Migration, Policy and Society Working Paper No. 23.

Danson, M. (2007) *Fresh or Refreshed Talent: Exploring Population Change in Europe and Some Policy Changes*. *International Journal on Multicultural Societies*. Vol 9 (1): 13-34.

de Lima, P Jentsch, B. and Whelton, R. (2005). *Migrant workers in the Highlands and Islands*. Inverness: Highlands and Islands Enterprise.

<http://www.hie.co.uk/HIE-economic-reports-2005/migrant-workers-in-the-highlands-and-islands-report-2005.pdf>

de Lima, P., Chaudhry, M., Whelton, R., and Arshad, R. (2007). *A study of migrant workers in Grampian*. Edinburgh: UHI Policy Web.

[www.communitiesscotland.gov.uk/stellent/groups/public/documents/webpages/pubcs\\_019731.pdf](http://www.communitiesscotland.gov.uk/stellent/groups/public/documents/webpages/pubcs_019731.pdf)

Department for Communities and Local Government (2008a) *The Government's Response to the Commission on Integration and Cohesion*, London: HMSO.

<http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/communities/pdf/681624.pdf>

Department for Communities and Local Government. (2008b). *Managing the Impacts of Migration: A Cross-Government Approach*. London: HSMO

<http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/communities/pdf/838935.pdf>

Department for Communities and Local Government (2008c). *Review of Migrant Integration Policy in the UK (including a feasibility study of the proposal for an Integration Agency)*. London: HSMO

<http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/communities/pdf/838994.pdf>

Donohoe, T. (2008). *Migrant Workers Research: Final Report*. Edinburgh: Glasgow Housing Association

<http://www.gha.org.uk>

Dowling, S., Moreton, K., and Wright, L (2007). *Trafficking for the purposes of labour exploitation: a literature review*. London: Home Office.

<http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/pdfs07/rdsolr1007.pdf>

DWP (2008) National Insurance Number Allocations to Adult Overseas Nationals Entering the UK 2007/08. <http://www.dwp.gov.uk/asd/tabtool.asp>

East Dunbartonshire Council (2008). *Research on the Impact of Migration into Scotland: East Dunbartonshire Council Response*. Kirkintilloch: East Dunbartonshire Council.

[www.eastdunbarton.gov.uk](http://www.eastdunbarton.gov.uk)

ESOL Scotland (2008). *Initial ESOL Assessment in Scotland*. Edinburgh: ESOL Scotland

<http://www.esolscotland.com/documents/Executive%20Summary%20Initial%20ESOL%20Assessment%20in%20Scotland.pdf>

European Migration Network (2007). *Conditions of entry and residence of third country highly-skilled workers in the EU*. Brussels: European Migration Network.

[http://www.ind.nl/nl/Images/EMN\\_HighlySkilled%20Workers%20study\\_defi\\_tcm5-164540.pdf](http://www.ind.nl/nl/Images/EMN_HighlySkilled%20Workers%20study_defi_tcm5-164540.pdf)

Farrant, M., Grieve, C., and Sriskandarajah, D. (2006). *Irregular migration in the UK*. London: Ippr

<http://www.ippr.org/publicationsandreports/publication.asp?id=446>

Fife Research Co-ordination Group (2007). *Migrant Workers in Fife - Survey 2007*. Fife: Fife Council.

[http://www.fifedirect.org.uk/uploadfiles/publications/c64\\_MigrantWorkersSurveyKnowFifeFindingsV1\\_2.pdf](http://www.fifedirect.org.uk/uploadfiles/publications/c64_MigrantWorkersSurveyKnowFifeFindingsV1_2.pdf)

Findlay, A., Fyfe, N., and Stewart, E. (2007) Changing Places: Voluntary Sector Work with Refugees and Asylum Seekers in core and Peripheral Regions of the UK. *International Journal on Multicultural Societies*. Vol. 9(1): 54-74.

GEN (2008) Migrant Workers Research, Dundee: Scottish Social Services Council.

General Register Office for Scotland (2008) Mid-2007 Population Estimates Scotland. Edinburgh: GROS

Glasgow Anti-Racist Alliance (2008). *The State of the Nation: Race and Racism in Scotland*. Glasgow: GARA.

<http://www.gara.org.uk>

Gordon, I., Travers, T. and Whitehead, C. (2007). *The Impact of Recent Immigration on the London Economy*. London, LSE.

<http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/LSELondon/pdf/theImpactofRecentImmigrationOnTheLondonEconomy.pdf>

GoWell. (2007). *GoWell Community Health and Wellbeing Survey: baseline findings 2006*. Glasgow: University of Glasgow and MRC Social and Public Health Sciences Unit

<http://www.gowellonline.com>

GoWell. (2008). *GoWell Community Health and Wellbeing Survey: Progress Report 2007/08*. Glasgow: University of Glasgow and MRC Social and Public Health Sciences Unit

<http://www.gowellonline.com>

Green, M. (2006). *They Think We Are Nothing. A survey of destitute asylum seekers and refugees in Scotland*. Glasgow: Scottish Refugee Council.

[http://www.scottishrefugeecouncil.org.uk/pub/Dest\\_Exec\\_Summ](http://www.scottishrefugeecouncil.org.uk/pub/Dest_Exec_Summ)

Hall Aitken and National Centre for Migration Studies. (2007a). *Migrant Workers in Dumfries & Galloway: Final Report*. Inverness: UHI Policy Web

<http://www.ini.smo.uhi.ac.uk/projects/Final%20report-Dumfries.pdf>

Hall Aitken and National Centre for Migration Studies. (2007b). *Outer Hebrides Migration Study: Final Report*. Isle of Lewis: Western Isles Enterprise and Communities Scotland.

[http://www.cne-](http://www.cne-siar.gov.uk/factfile/population/Final%20Report%20OHMS%20150107%20FINAL.pdf)

[siar.gov.uk/factfile/population/Final%20Report%20OHMS%20150107%20FINAL.pdf](http://www.cne-siar.gov.uk/factfile/population/Final%20Report%20OHMS%20150107%20FINAL.pdf)

Hall Aitken (2007c). *Shetland Population Study - Briefing Paper*. Glasgow: Hall Aitken Associates.

[www.shetland.gov.uk/coins/ViewSelectedDocument.asp?DocumentID=12292](http://www.shetland.gov.uk/coins/ViewSelectedDocument.asp?DocumentID=12292)

Hall Aitken (2008). *Progression of migrant workers*. Inverness: UHI Policy Web

[http://www.ini.smo.uhi.ac.uk/projects/Final%20report\\_Scottis#10F242.pdf](http://www.ini.smo.uhi.ac.uk/projects/Final%20report_Scottis#10F242.pdf)

Health Protection Agency. (2007). *Tuberculosis in the U.K.* London: HPA.

<http://www.hpa.org.uk>

Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) (2008) On-line statistics

[http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/component/option,com\\_datatables/Itemid,121/](http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/component/option,com_datatables/Itemid,121/)

Highland Council (2006). *Overseas migrant workers in Highland*. Inverness: The Highland Council.

<http://www.highland.gov.uk/NR/rdonlyres/CC6020DD-6233-4A90-9373-E95058E6F023/0/BriefingNote15.pdf>

Highland Well-Being Alliance (2005). *Inward Migration and Returners Access to Services in the Highlands*. Inverness: Highland Well-Being Alliance

Home Office (2006) A Points-Based System: Making Migration Work for Britain. HMSO: Cm 6741

Home Office (2007a). *The Economic and Fiscal Impact of Immigration. Cross-Departmental Submission to the House of Lords Select Committee on Economic Affairs on The Economic and Fiscal Impact of Migration*. London: HSMO

<http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/documents/economic-impact-of-immigration?view=Binary>

Home Office (2007b) *Evidence for the social and wider impacts strands of the A2 stock take*. London: HSMO

<http://www.ukba.homeoffice.gov.uk/managingborders/managingmigration/migrationimpactsforum>

Home Office (2008) Control of Immigration: Statistics United Kingdom 2007.

London: HMSO. <http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/immigration-asylum-stats.html>

Hope, S., Murray, L., and Martin, C (2004). *In-Migration to the Highlands and Islands*. Inverness: Highlands and Islands Enterprise.

<http://www.hie.co.uk/in-migration-survey-2003.pdf>

House of Lords (2008) *The Economic Impact of Immigration Volume I: Report, Select Committee on Economic Affairs, 1st Report of Session 2007–08*. London: The Stationery Office Limited.

Hudson, M., Phillips, J., Ray, Kathryn., and Barnes, H. (2007). *Social cohesion in diverse communities*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/2036-social-cohesion-communities.pdf>

IBP Strategy and Research (2008). *Findings of the Citizens' Panel Survey on Vibrant Communities*. Lochgilphead: Argyll and Bute Community Planning Partnership

Jamieson, L. and Davidson, S. (2007) *CRFR Migration Research Scoping Review – Lived Experience of Migrants in Scotland*, Edinburgh University Centre for Research on Families and Relationships.

Jarvis, L. (2008) *Alcohol Consumption in Black and Minority Ethnic Groups and recent immigrants in Scotland: current situation on information available*. Scottish Alcohol Research Framework, unpublished

Jentsch, B. E. (2007). Migration Integration in Rural Areas: Evidence from New Countries of Immigration. *International Journal on Multicultural Societies*. Vol. 9 (1): 1-12.

Jentsch, B.E., de Lima, P., and MacDonald, B. (2007) Migrant Workers in Rural Scotland: 'Going to the Middle of Nowhere'. *International Journal on Multicultural Societies*. Vol. 9 (1): 35-53

Johnes, G. (2004). *The Global Value of Education and Training Exports to the UK Economy*. London: British Council.

Johnson, M. (2003). *Asylum Seekers in Dispersal - Healthcare Issues*. London: Home Office.  
[www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/pdfs2/rdsolr1303.pdf](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/pdfs2/rdsolr1303.pdf)

Kate, M.A. (2006). *Knowledge Transfer: Research Findings No.3/2006: Exploring the Impact of Migration Within the European Union (EU): How Can We Harness Our Talents Conference Summary*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government Social Research <http://cci.scot.nhs.uk/Resource/Doc/153738/0041375.pdf>

Kelly, U., McNicoll, I. and Kelly, D. (2006) *Higher education means business: A summary of the economic impact of Scottish higher education institutions*, University of Strathclyde.

Kociolek, A. (2007). *Polish Newcomers Experiences in the Highlands and Islands of Scotland*. Inverness: Highlands and Islands Enterprise.

Laurence, J. and Heath, A. (2008). *Predictors of community cohesion: multi-level modelling of the 2005 Citizenship Survey*. London: Department for Communities and Local Government.  
<http://www.communities.gov.uk/documents/communities/pdf/681539.pdf>

Learning Link Scotland (2007). *ESOL in Scotland's Voluntary Sector*. Edinburgh: Learning Link Scotland.  
[www.learninglinkscotland.org.uk/ESOL Scotlands Voluntary Sector Report.pdf](http://www.learninglinkscotland.org.uk/ESOL_Scotlands_Voluntary_Sector_Report.pdf)

Lewis, M. (2006). *Warm Welcome? Understanding public attitudes to asylum seekers in Scotland*. London: Institute for Public Policy Research.  
<http://www.ippr.org>

Lisenkova, K., P. McGregor, N. Pappas, K. Swales, K. Turner and R.E. Wright, (2007), *Macroeconomic Impacts of Demographic Change in Scotland*:

A Computable General Equilibrium Analysis, IZA Discussion Paper no. 2623, Bonn, Institute for the Study of Labour.  
<http://www.ersa.org/ersaconfs/ersa06/papers/432.pdf>

Macaskill, S. (2002). *Starting Again: Young Asylum-Seekers Views on Life in Glasgow*. Glasgow: Save the Children.  
<http://www.savethechildren.org.uk>

Manacorda, M., Manning, A., and Wadsworth, J. (2006) '*The Impact of Immigration on the Structure of Male Wages: Theory and Evidence from Britain*' Centre for Economic Performance Discussion Paper No 754, October.  
<http://cep.lse.ac.uk/pubs/download/dp0754.pdf>

Markova, E. and Rogaly, B. (2007). *East European immigration and community cohesion*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.  
<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/2053-immigration-community-cohesion.pdf>

McNaughton, C. C. (2008). *Homelessness among A8 Nationals in the UK*. York: University of York.  
<http://www.york.ac.uk/inst/chp/hsa/spring08/presentations/McNaughton.doc>

Metcalfe, H., Rolfe, H., and Dhudwar, A. (2009). *Employment of Migrant Workers: Case studies of selected firms in England and Wales*. Edinburgh, Scottish Government and Welsh Government

Mortimer, J. (2008). *Assessing the real impact of migration*. London: IPF Statistical Research Bulletin.

National Centre for Social Research (2007) Destinations of leavers from Higher Education Institutions Longitudinal Survey of the 2002/03 cohort. Key Findings Report Published 2007. London: HESA  
[http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php?option=com\\_pubs&Itemid=122&task=show\\_year&pubId=1714&versionId=23&yearId=161](http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php?option=com_pubs&Itemid=122&task=show_year&pubId=1714&versionId=23&yearId=161)

NHS Scotland (2008) Future Research Priorities for Ethnicity and Health in Scotland: A Draft Consultation Report and proposed Strategic Research Programme, The Scottish Ethnicity and Health Research Strategy Working Group.

National Institute Adult Continuing Education (2006) '*More than a language...': NIACE Committee of Inquiry on English for Speakers of Other Languages*. Leicester: NIACE  
<http://www.niace.org.uk/projects/esol-enquiry/documents/ESOL-Inquiry-ExecutiveSummary.pdf>

National Offender Management Service. (2007). *Population in Custody - England and Wales*. London: Ministry of Justice.  
[www.justice.gov.uk/docs/population-in-custody-april07.pdf](http://www.justice.gov.uk/docs/population-in-custody-april07.pdf)

Nicol, C. and McMurray, S. (2007). *Foreign Migrants in Edinburgh*. Capital City Partnership Working Paper Series. Edinburgh: Capital City Partnership.  
[http://www.joinedorforjobs.org.uk/employment/uploads/WP5\\_-\\_FM.pdf](http://www.joinedorforjobs.org.uk/employment/uploads/WP5_-_FM.pdf)



ONS (undated) Methodology to estimate Total International Migration since 1991

[http://www.statistics.gov.uk/downloads/theme\\_population/Methodology\\_for\\_Revised\\_International\\_Migration\\_Estimates.doc](http://www.statistics.gov.uk/downloads/theme_population/Methodology_for_Revised_International_Migration_Estimates.doc)

ONS (2003) International Migration Statistics National Statistics Quality Review Series Report No. 23.

<http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/data/methodology/quality/reviews/downloads/Int-Mig.doc>

ONS (2006a) National Statistics Quality Review On International Migration: Progress Report To August 2006 Against Implementation Plan.

ONS (2006b) *Report of the Inter-departmental Task Force on Migration Statistics*. London: ONS.

<http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/data/methodology/specific/population/future/imps/updates/downloads/TaskForceReport151206.pdf>

ONS (2007) A Review of the Potential Use of Administrative Sources in the Estimation of Population Statistics.

<http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/data/methodology/specific/population/future/imps/updates/default.asp>

ONS (2008) Improvement to Migration and Population Statistics: Progress Report, May 2008

<http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/files1/stats/pams-08-05-IMPS-Progress.pdf>

ODS Consulting. (2007). *Assessing the housing needs of minority ethnic communities in Clackmannanshire*. Glasgow: Communities Scotland

Orchard, P., Szymanski, A., and Vlahova, N. (2007). *A Community Profile of EU8 Migrants in Edinburgh and an Evaluation of their Access to Key Services*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government

<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/207638/0055078.pdf>

Pillai, R. (2007). *The reception and integration of new migrant communities*. London, Institute for Public Policy Research

<http://www.ippr.org>

Pillai, R. (2008). *What are the impacts of economic migration to the UK?* Employment Studies Newsletter (July 2008 No. 8): 1-2.

<http://www.employment-studies.co.uk/news/es8art1.php>

Pollard, N., Latorre, M. and Sriskandarajah, D. (2008). *Floodgates or turnstiles? Post-EU enlargement migration flows to (and from) the UK*. London: Institute for Public Policy Research.

<http://www.ippr.org>

Poole, L. and Adamson, K. (2008). *Report on the situation of the Roma community in Govanhill, Glasgow*. Glasgow: Oxfam.

[http://www.oxfam.org.uk/resources/ukpoverty/downloads/roma\\_report.pdf](http://www.oxfam.org.uk/resources/ukpoverty/downloads/roma_report.pdf)

Population and Migration Statistics Committee (Scotland) (2001). *Pre-school population estimates - Education Requirements*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

<http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/files/pams09.pdf>

Portes, J. and French, S. (2005) The impact of free movement of workers from central and eastern Europe on the UK labour market: early evidence. DWP Working Paper No 18. Leeds: Corporate Document Services.

Poverty Alliance (2007). *Migration: Exploitation and Integration*. Glasgow: The Poverty Alliance.

<http://www.povertyalliance.org/html/publications/publications/MigrationReportFinal.pdf>

Press and Journal (2009) Taxpayers' £3m lost in courtroom translation, January 5<sup>th</sup>

<http://www.pressandjournal.co.uk/Article.aspx/1011188?UserKey=>

Quickfall, J. (2004). Developing a model for culturally competent primary care nursing for asylum applicants and refugees in Scotland: a review of the literature. *Diversity in Health and Social Care* 1: 53 - 64.

Redman, C., Genasi, F., and Smith, K. (2008). *Health Protection and Migrants: Assessing Risk Around Communicable Diseases*. Glasgow: Health Protection Scotland

<http://www.hps.scot.nhs.uk>

Rees and Boden (2006) Estimating London's New Migrant Population.

[www.london.gov.uk/mayor/refugees/docs/nm-pop.pdf](http://www.london.gov.uk/mayor/refugees/docs/nm-pop.pdf)

Refugee Survival Trust. (2005). *'What's going on?': A study into destitution and poverty faced by asylum seekers and refugees in Scotland*. Edinburgh: The Refugee Survival Trust

<http://www.asylumscotland.org.uk/assets/downloads/research/Report%20by%20refugee%20survival%20trust%20into%20destitution.pdf>

Rendall M.S., Tomassini C., Elliot D.J. (2003) 'Estimation of Annual International Migration from the Labour Force Surveys of the United Kingdom and the Continental European Union.' *Statistical Journal of the United Nations* ECE 20 219-234.

<http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/data/methodology/quality/reviews/downloads/sju00560.pdf>

Reynolds, G. (2008). *The Impacts and Experiences of Migrant Children in UK Secondary Schools*. University of Sussex: Sussex Centre for Migration Research.

<http://www.sussex.ac.uk/migration/documents/mwp47.pdf>

Riley, R. and Weale, M. (2006) 'Immigration and its effects' National Institute Economic Review, No. 198, October.

Roberts, K. a. H., J. (2002). *Working with Disabled Refugees and Asylum Seekers. Information Workshop for Refugee and Social Care Practitioners -*

*Information Workshop for Refugee and Social Care Practitioners*. University of York: Social Policy Unit. <http://www.york.ac.uk/inst/spru/research/pdf/nl-jrf1867.pdf>

Robinson, D and Reeve, K. (2006). *Neighbourhood experiences of new immigration*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation  
<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/9781859354421.pdf>

Robinson, D., Reeve, K. and Casey, R. (2007). *The housing pathways of new immigrants*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.  
<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/2103-housing-immigration-asylum.pdf>

Rogerson, R., Boyle, M. and Mason, C. (2006) *Progress Report on the Fresh Talent Initiative*, Edinburgh: Scottish Government Social Research,  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/152086/0040945.pdf>

Roney, J. (2008). *Housing Report to the Migration Impacts Forum*. London: Home Office.  
<http://www.ukba.homeoffice.gov.uk/sitecontent/documents/managingourborders/mif/papersandagendas/thirdmeeting/housingreport.pdf?view=Binary>

Roshan, N. (2005). *Supporting New Communities: A qualitative study of health needs among asylum seeker and refugee communities in North Glasgow*. Glasgow: NHS Greater Glasgow

Rudiger, K. (2008). *Towards a Global Labour Market*. London: The Work Foundation  
[http://www.indsoc.co.uk/assets/docs/publications/30\\_globalisation.pdf](http://www.indsoc.co.uk/assets/docs/publications/30_globalisation.pdf)

Rutter, J. (2003). *Working with Refugee Children*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation  
<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/1859351395.pdf>

Sachdev, D. and Harries, B. (2006). *Learning and skills planning and provision for migrants from the Accession States: an exploratory study*. London: Learning and Skills Development Agency.  
<http://www.lseducation.org.uk>

Save the Children (2004). *My mum is now my best friend - Asylum-seeker and Refugee Families in Glasgow*. Glasgow: Save the Children  
<http://www.savethechildren.org.uk>

Save the Children (2005). *A Hidden Trade: Child Trafficking Research in Scotland 2005/06*. Glasgow: Save the Children.  
<http://www.savethechildren.org.uk>

Save the Children, (2006). *Future Scots: Pre-Five Services for Asylum Seekers and Refugees in Glasgow*. Glasgow: Save the Children.  
<http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/en/docs/future-scots.pdf>

Scottish Borders Council (2007). *Welcome to the Scottish Borders: A guide to help people from overseas who want to live and work in the Scottish Borders*. Melrose: Scottish Borders Council.

<http://www.scotborders.gov.uk/pdf/21342.pdf>

Scottish Economic Research (2006). *The Tayside migrant labour population: scale, impacts and experiences*. Edinburgh: Communities Scotland  
[www.communitiesscotland.gov.uk/stellent/groups/public/documents/webpages/pubcs\\_012476.pdf](http://www.communitiesscotland.gov.uk/stellent/groups/public/documents/webpages/pubcs_012476.pdf)

Scottish Government (2006a). *Attitudes to Discrimination in Scotland: 2006*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/205755/0054714.pdf>

Scottish Government (2006b). *Scottish Ministers response to the inquiry into the Fresh Talent initiative*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/01/fresh-talent-response>

Scottish Government. (2007a). *Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/176977/0050036.pdf>

Scottish Government (2007b). *Choosing Scotland's Future: A National Conversation*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/194791/0052321.pdf>

Scottish Government (2007c). *Examining the Impact of EU Enlargement and the Introduction of the UK Citizenship Test on Provision of English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) in Scotland*, Edinburgh: The Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/202773/0054072.pdf>

Scottish Government (2007d). *The Government Economic Strategy*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/202993/0054092.pdf>

Scottish Government (2007e). *Pupils in Scotland 2006*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/167568/0046177.pdf>

Scottish Government (2008a). *Equally Well - Report of the Ministerial Task Force on Health Inequalities*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/226607/0061266.pdf>

Scottish Government (2008b). *Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme an evidence review*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/235857/0064664.pdf>

Scottish Government (2008c). *Impacts of migration on public service delivery in Scotland: Response to the Migration Impacts Forum*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

Scottish Government (2008d). *Taking Forward The Government Economic Strategy: A Discussion Paper on Tackling Poverty, Inequality and Deprivation in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government  
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/210936/0055757>

Scottish Government (2008e). *Pupils in Scotland 2007*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government

<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2008/07/28100032/0>

Scottish Refugee Council (2006). *This is a good place to live and think about the future: The needs and experiences of unaccompanied asylum-seeking children in Scotland*. Glasgow: The Glasgow Centre for the Child and Society.

[http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/departments/glasgowschoolofsocialwork/gccs/media\\_42668\\_en.pdf](http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/departments/glasgowschoolofsocialwork/gccs/media_42668_en.pdf)

Select Committee on Economic Affairs (2008). *The Economic Impact of Immigration*. London. 1st Report of Session 2007-08: Authority of the House of Lords.

<http://www.official-documents.gov.uk/document/cm72/7237/7237.pdf>

Serious Organised Crime Agency (2006). *The United Kingdom Threat Assessment of Serious Organised Crime*. London: SOCA.

[http://www.soca.gov.uk/assessPublications/downloads/threat\\_assess\\_unclass\\_250706.pdf](http://www.soca.gov.uk/assessPublications/downloads/threat_assess_unclass_250706.pdf)

Sharp, C., and Bitel, M. (2008). *Migrants in the Highlands: the implications for action by the Highland Wellbeing Alliance and other partner agencies*. Inverness: Highland Wellbeing Alliance.

Sim, D., Barclay, A., and Anderson, I. (2007). *Achieving a Better Understanding of 'A8' Migrant Labour Needs in Lanarkshire*. Hamilton: South Lanarkshire Council

[http://www.southlanarkshire.gov.uk/portal/page/portal/SLC\\_PUBLICDOCUMENTS/HOUSING\\_TECH\\_DOCUMENTS/Research%20papers%20-%20Achieving%20a%20Better%20Understanding%20of%20A8.pdf](http://www.southlanarkshire.gov.uk/portal/page/portal/SLC_PUBLICDOCUMENTS/HOUSING_TECH_DOCUMENTS/Research%20papers%20-%20Achieving%20a%20Better%20Understanding%20of%20A8.pdf)

Sime, R (2007). *Labour market issues - Skills shortages and gaps, recruitment issues and underemployment of migrant workers*. Inverness: Highlands and Islands Enterprise.

Spencer, L., Ritchie, J., Lewis, J. and Dillon, J. (2003) *Quality in Qualitative Evaluation: A framework for assessing research evidence*, Cabinet Office.

Spencer, S., Ruhs, M., Anderson, B., and Rogaly, B. (2007). *Migrants' lives beyond the workplace: The experiences of Central and East Europeans in the UK*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

<http://www.jrf.org.uk/bookshop/eBooks/2045-migrants-experiences-UK.pdf>

Sriskandarajah, D., Cooley, L. and Kornblatt, T. (2007). *Britain's Immigrants: An economic profile*. London. Institute for Public Policy Research.

<http://www.ippr.org>

University of Strathclyde (2005). *The Impact of Asylum Seekers on the Glasgow Economy*. Glasgow: University of Strathclyde.

<http://www.asylumscotland.org.uk/assets/downloads/research/Impact%20of%20A.S.%20on%20Glasgow%20Economy.pdf>

Vergunst, P. (2007) Seasonal agricultural migrant labour in Scotland - the need for improved understanding. AA211 Special Study Report to SEERAD. Aberdeen: Scottish Agricultural College.

Wilson, M. (2007). *Barriers to Integration: Issues Facing A8 Communities in Scotland*. Glasgow: West of Scotland Racial Equality Council.

<http://www.wsrec.co.uk/newsite/images/ResearchReports/a8%20report%20pdf.pdf>

Wren, K. (2004). *Building Bridges: Local responses to the resettlement of asylum seekers in Glasgow*. Glasgow: Scottish Centre for Research on Social Justice.

[www.scrsj.ac.uk/media/media\\_69608\\_en.pdf](http://www.scrsj.ac.uk/media/media_69608_en.pdf)

Wright, R. E. (2008). *The Economics of New Immigration to Scotland*. Edinburgh: The David Hume Institute.

<http://www.davidhumeinstitute.com/DHI%20Website/Events.%20transcripts%20&%20presentations/Events%202008/The%20Economics%20of%20New%20Immigration%20to%20Scotland.pdf>

## Appendix A: Details of datasets identifying migrants

Main use	Dataset	Description
<p><b>Migration, Activities, Characteristics</b></p>	<p>Census, ONS</p>	<p>The Census is decennial, with the latest in April 2001. It identifies migrants, through country of birth, and those who migrated in within the previous year (through place of residence one year previous to the Census).</p> <p>It collects personal data (age, health, ethnicity, marital status, religion), as well as information on qualifications, economic activity (including hours, industry and occupation), whether they are an unpaid carer, housing and household composition.</p> <p><a href="http://www.statistics.gov.uk/census2001/topics.asp">http://www.statistics.gov.uk/census2001/topics.asp</a>  <a href="http://www.ccsr.ac.uk/sars/guide/introduction/">http://www.ccsr.ac.uk/sars/guide/introduction/</a></p>
<p><b>Migration</b></p>	<p>Home Office Immigration and Work permit data</p>	<p>The Home Office holds administrative data on those subject to immigration control. The main categories of relevance<sup>10</sup> are: asylum seekers, work permits and the Workers Registration Scheme (see below).</p> <p>Asylum seekers are recorded on application for asylum (nationality, gender and age). The National Asylum Support service records data on those awaiting decision who qualify for support (number of asylum applicants in receipt of support, nationality, gender, age and location). However, not all asylum seekers take up support (Rees and Boden, 2006; Home Office, 2008; <a href="http://scienceandresearch.homeoffice.gov.uk/">http://scienceandresearch.homeoffice.gov.uk/</a> (Asylum Statistics for the UK))</p> <p>Work permit data records location of employment and not residence. It is unclear what data will be produced following changes in the work permit regime.</p>

<sup>10</sup> Other immigration control data is not available at a sub-UK level (e.g. Grants of settlement, entry control) (Rees and Boden, 2006; ONS, 2003).

Main use	Dataset	Description
<b>Migration</b>	International Passenger Survey (IPS)	<p>These data exclude European Economic Area citizens who are not subject to immigration control (i.e. all citizens of Norway, Iceland and Switzerland and of pre-2004 EU member states. Citizens of post-2004 EU member states are not subject to immigration control, and so are excluded, unless they are employees).</p> <p>The IPS is a survey of passengers arriving and leaving the UK. The IPS is the only dataset which measures out migration as well as in migration (Rees and Boden, 2006). In-migrants (as opposed to visitors) are identified by their stated intended length of stay. Bands identified include less than three months, three to six months, six to twelve months and more than twelve months.</p> <p>The data collected includes country of previous residence, country of birth, nationality, destination in the UK (town), expenditure, purpose of visit (including work, study, joining a partner or family), intended length of stay, age group, gender, occupation, dependents, year and quarter of visit. Not all variables are reported for Scotland. (<a href="http://www.statistics.gov.uk/STATBASE/Source.asp?vlnk=348&amp;More=Y">http://www.statistics.gov.uk/STATBASE/Source.asp?vlnk=348&amp;More=Y</a>; Rees and Boden, 2006)</p>
<b>Migration</b>	Mid-year population estimates	<p>The migrant sample size exceeds 2,000 pa (ONS, 2003). However, for Scotland, the IPS sample is small, particularly for Scottish migrants (approximately 100 survey contacts during 2004) and estimates derived from the IPS are therefore less reliable than UK-level estimates — particularly as regards country of origin/destination and age of migrants. <a href="http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/files1/stats/high-level-summary-of-statistics-population-and-migration/j926014.htm">http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/files1/stats/high-level-summary-of-statistics-population-and-migration/j926014.htm</a> Some flows between the UK and Ireland are omitted. Passengers who, on entry, intend to stay for a short period and then decide to stay longer are not captured as migrants.</p> <p>Mid-year population estimates and estimates of migration are estimated annually by GROS. Migration is derived from three key sources of data: the National Health Service Central Register, the Community Health Index and Total International</p>



Main use	Dataset	Description
	(GROS)	<p>Migration (TIM, see below).  <a href="http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/press/2006-news/scotlands-population-rises-for-third-year-in-a-row.html">http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/press/2006-news/scotlands-population-rises-for-third-year-in-a-row.html</a>  <a href="http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/files1/stats/05mype-cahb-booklet-revised.pdf">http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/files1/stats/05mype-cahb-booklet-revised.pdf</a></p>
<b>Migration</b>	National Insurance Number (NINo) registrations	<p>To work legally in the UK (both as an employee or self-employed) and to claim benefits/tax credits a person requires a National Insurance Number (NINo) issued by the DWP).</p> <p>Data records the flow of registrations (not the stock), providing country of origin, gender, age, location of residence (local authority) and receipt of out-of-work benefits (DWP, 2008). Figures reported are the registration date on the National Insurance Recording System (NIRS). This may take several weeks from applying for the NINo.</p> <p>The data captures all migrants who work legally, irrespective of length of stay in the UK. It therefore includes migrants staying less than one month. However, also captures those who claim benefits and any others who apply for a NINo but do not work (e.g. people intending to work). Thus some national insurance numbers are allocated but never used. It also excludes many migrants, i.e. those who do not apply for a NINo. These include students who do not take paid employment, dependents of NINo applicants who do not intend to work and returning UK nationals who already have a NINo (ONS, 2007).</p>
<b>Migration</b>	NHS Central Register (NHSCR)	<p>The NHS Central Register (NHSCR) holds data on all people registered with a GP in Scotland. Migrants from outside the UK are identified through information collected at the time of registration with a GP. As part of a recent upgrade to the system, place of birth is included but this is only routinely collected for new births, although there are plans to populate for patients born in Scotland (as identified through the NHS birth number).</p>

Main use	Dataset	Description
		<p>The sample only includes migrants who register with a GP, i.e. those requiring access to the NHS through a GP and those choosing to register with a GP, irrespective of medical needs. Registration is available for those staying in the UK for longer than 3 months and so the dataset includes some visitors. Out-migration overseas is not captured other than in situations when patients inform their GP. Out migration to the rest of the UK is identified when the patient registers with a GP in their country of destination within the UK. Because registration varies across groups, the data is not representative of migrants, e.g. young men are less likely to register with a doctor.</p> <p>The data collected is very limited (e.g. date of birth, gender, health board of residence with history of moves between health boards, date of registration with health board). The dataset has recently been improved through the addition of place of birth, mother's surname, postcode of residence. The dataset does not identify date of entry to Scotland (or the UK) as opposed to date of registration with a GP. However, through the inclusion of previous Health Board (or Health Authority in the rest of the UK) it can provide information on the mobility of migrants within Scotland and between Scotland and the rest of the UK.</p> <p><a href="http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/national-health-service-central-register/about-the-register/what-information-is-held-on-the-register.html">http://www.gro-scotland.gov.uk/national-health-service-central-register/about-the-register/what-information-is-held-on-the-register.html</a></p>
<b>Migration</b>	Community Health Index (CHI)	<p>The Community Health Index records new registrations with a GP. This is managed by the Practitioner Services Division of the NHS in Scotland and transfers information to and from NHSCR, so it includes similar populations. An extract from the CHI is currently used as the source of migration within Scotland at the postcode level, and is combined with information on health board moves provided by NHSCR.</p> <p>The CHI suffers from the same bias as the NHSCR (see above), due to capturing only those who register with a GP and not recording out-migration. In addition, returning</p>

Main use	Dataset	Description
		<p>Scots and other British who have resided outside the UK for three months or more will be identified as migrants, although the latter will only occur if the patient has registered with their GP as an embarkation when they leave the UK.</p> <p>The data relevant to migration which is held on the CHI is very limited (e.g. age, gender, address and full postcode; health authority for migrants from England and Wales; migrant flag for patients moving in from overseas). Country of origin is not routinely collected.</p>
<b>Migration</b>	Total International Migration (TIM)	<p>Total International Migration (TIM), i.e. immigration and emigration flows, estimates are published annually for Scotland as a whole. Both mid-year and calendar year estimates are provided. Data includes: age, gender, marital status, citizenship, country of birth, last/next country of residence, reason for visit, usual occupation, whether an asylum seeker and length of stay.</p> <p>Estimates are calculated by ONS using a range of data: IPS, including those who switch from visitor to migrant; Home Office data on asylum seekers and their dependents; Home Office data on non-EEA citizens (to estimate those switching from migrant to visitor status); and Irish CSO estimates on migration flows between the UK and Ireland (using the LFS) (Rees and Boden, 2006). TIM</p> <p><a href="http://www.statistics.gov.uk/STATBASE/Analysis.asp?vlnk=61&amp;More=Y">http://www.statistics.gov.uk/STATBASE/Analysis.asp?vlnk=61&amp;More=Y</a></p>
<b>Migration Employment</b>	Worker Registration Scheme (WRS) administrative data	<p>Until May 2009, individuals from the A8 countries (those which joined the EU in May 2004, excluding Cyprus and Malta) who work in the UK for more than one month as employees are required to register under the Workers Registration Scheme (WRS) for their first year of employment (ONS, 2007). From 1 May 2009, the scheme will be discontinued and so will no longer provide a source of data on A8 migrants.</p> <p>The WRS excludes A8 migrants who are self-employed (who are exempt from</p>

Main use	Dataset	Description
		<p>registration). For employees, it overestimates the stock, as out-migrants are not recorded. In addition, dependents of those registering are also recorded and so may be double counted if they are employees and so register in respect of their own employment.</p> <p>Data includes gender, age, place of work and of residence, industry and occupation, nationality. However, date of migration (as opposed to registration) is not recorded. Moreover, work location and industry may be misleading as many WRS migrants are registered to work with employment agencies (ONS, 2007). The DWP and WRS figures do not record when any individual moves around the country or leaves it, so arrival figures cannot be treated as cumulative, even within one year (Audit Commission, 2007).</p> <p>The Home Office produces the quarterly 'Accession Monitoring Report': <a href="http://www.ukba.homeoffice.gov.uk/sitecontent/documents/aboutus/reports/accession_monitoring_report/">http://www.ukba.homeoffice.gov.uk/sitecontent/documents/aboutus/reports/accession_monitoring_report/</a></p>
<b>Employment</b>	Labour Force Survey	<p>The Labour Force Survey collects a very wide range of information on individuals and their employment, including personal and household data, extensive economic activity data and qualifications. Migrants may be identified, including their country of birth, date of entry to the UK, nationality and national identity. The LFS has a longitudinal element, covering five consecutive quarters.</p> <p>The LFS's immigrant sample size for Scotland is around 500, about half of whom entered the UK in the previous ten years (based on our analysis). Sub-national analysis is thus highly restricted due to sample size. Aggregation of data over several years can be used to increase the sample size. However, this reduces timeliness and the ability to identify change.</p>
<b>Education</b>	Further	The Scottish Funding Council (SFC) collects administrative data on all students in

Main use	Dataset	Description
	Education Statistics (Scottish Funding Council)	Further Education Institutions in Scotland. 'Migrants' are identified in terms of country of domicile prior to their course, i.e. students who migrated to the UK prior to becoming a student may not be identified as migrants. Collects data on personal characteristics, course, including subject, level and institution. <a href="http://www.sfc.ac.uk/statistics/stats_fe_info.htm">http://www.sfc.ac.uk/statistics/stats_fe_info.htm</a>
<b>Education</b>	Higher Education Student Records (HESA)	The Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) collects administrative data on all students in Higher Education Institutions in the UK. 'Migrants' are identified in terms of nationality and country of permanent domicile, i.e. students who migrated to the UK prior to becoming a student may not be identified. Data collected includes personal characteristics, course, (including subject, level and institution) and destination six months after graduation. <a href="http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/component/option,com_studrec/task,show_file/itemid,233/mn1,07051/href,a/index.html/">http://www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/component/option,com_studrec/task,show_file/itemid,233/mn1,07051/href,a/index.html/</a>
<b>Education</b>	Pupil Census/ Independent School Census	In addition, HESA has conducted a longitudinal survey of Higher Education leavers' destinations (the Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education (DLHE) Longitudinal Survey), which covers EU students. However, the total number of non-UK domiciled students was 835, resulting in too small a sample for Scottish analysis. (National Centre for Social Research, 2007) There are two censuses for school pupils: the Pupil Census for publicly funded schools and Independent School Census for other schools.  The Pupil Census data used to identify the pupil's main language spoken at home and this was used as a proxy for pupils coming from a migrant family (Scottish Government, 2008e). However, this is now only collected at a school (and not individual) level. Migrants can now only be identified by whether they receive English as an Additional Language support, which is liable to underestimate migrant status. Asylum seekers and refugees are also identified. Other data collected includes

Main use	Dataset	Description
		<p>national identity, ethnicity, age, gender, and school attended.  <a href="http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2007/02/27083941/2">http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2007/02/27083941/2</a></p> <p>The Independent School Census is more limited, but also identifies whether a pupil receives English as an Additional Language support.</p> <p>However, the usefulness of English as an Additional Language support is questionable: no instances were reported in the Independent School Census and it will not identify migrants from English-speaking countries. GROS is currently investigating other ways the Schools Census may identify migrants.  <a href="http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2008/04/29101007/0">http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2008/04/29101007/0</a></p>
<b>Characteristics</b>	Integrated Household Survey	<p>The Integrated Household Survey integrates the Labour Force Survey and associated boosts, the General Household Survey, the Expenditure and Food Survey, the Omnibus Survey and the English Housing Survey. It is being introduced in phases and started in January 2008.</p> <p>Migrants are identified by country of birth. Their date of first entry to the UK, whether they have lived continuously in the UK since first entry and, if not, their most recent date of entry are collected. The core questionnaire also includes: nationality, national identity, ethnicity, religion, mobility in previous year, health, income, economic activity, qualifications.  <a href="http://www.esds.ac.uk/Government/cps/">http://www.esds.ac.uk/Government/cps/</a></p>
<b>Crime</b>	Language Line services	<p>Few crime data indicate immigration status. Some indication of victimisation for some migrant groups (those without English language fluency) can be derived from the police Language Line services, based on the demand for telephone interpreting from the police forces of the UK (Audit Commission, 2007). Otherwise data is held on the number of foreign nationals in prisons. However, the latter will include non-migrants as well as migrants.</p>

<b>Main use</b>	<b>Dataset</b>	<b>Description</b>
<b>Attitudes to immigrants</b>	Scottish Social Attitudes (SSA)	The Scottish Social Attitudes (SSA) survey has been conducted annually since 1999. The questionnaires vary each year. In 2006, it included a question on attitudes towards Eastern European migrants (whether they were taking Scottish people's jobs). With a sample size of around 1,600 adults it allows disaggregation, including geographical.

## Appendix B: Key studies included in the review

### Economic Impact

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
de Lima <i>et al</i> (2005) Migrant Workers in the Highlands and Islands	Interviews with 53 employers, 25 migrant workers, 9 service providers and national bodies. Additional focus groups.
Scottish Economic Research (2006) The Tayside migrant labour population: scale, impacts and experiences	Survey completed by 700 employers and in-depth follow-up of 47 employers, survey completed by 112 migrant workers and survey of support organisations.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals. Focus groups with A8 nationals, interviews with 15 employers and 17 service providers.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in East Renfrewshire	Consultation with 9 service providers and 7 employers. Questionnaire-based survey of 21 A8 nationals and focus groups with additional A8 nationals.
de Lima <i>et al</i> (2007) A Study of Migrant Workers in Grampian	Consultation with 61 employers, 87 migrant workers and 46 service providers using a range of research methods, including structured surveys and focus groups.
Fife Partnership (2007) Migrant Workers in Fife – Survey 2007	Interview survey of 904 migrants.
Hall Aitken (2007) Migrant Workers in Dumfries and Galloway	Review of existing research, survey of 103 employers, survey of 85 migrant workers and interviews with a further 15, stakeholder workshop of agencies providing support or services.
Kociolek (2007) Polish Newcomers Experiences in the Highlands and Islands of Scotland	Meetings attended by 90 migrant workers.



Sim <i>et al</i> (2007) Achieving a better understanding of A8 migrant labour needs in Lanarkshire	Survey of 48 migrant workers and focus groups with a further 46, consultation with local organisations, survey of 8 employers and 3 employment agencies.
Brown and Danson (2008) Fresh Talent or Cheap Labour? Accession State Migrant Labour in the Scottish Economy	Review of evidence.
Hall Aitken (2008) Progression of migrant workers	Interviews with employers, stakeholders and migrants (numbers not specified).
Metcalf <i>et al</i> (2008) Employment of migrant workers: case studies of selected employers in Wales and Scotland	52 employer case studies, 28 in Scotland.

### Public Services

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Arai, L. (2005). Migrants & public services in the UK: a review of the recent literature. Oxford	Synthesis of research material at UK level.
Parellel56 (2005) Inward Migrant and Returners	Survey of frontline service staff (387 respondents, 32% response rate).
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals. Focus groups with A8 nationals, interviews with 15 employers and 17 service providers.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in East Renfrewshire	Consultation with 9 service providers and 7 employers. Questionnaire-based survey of 21 A8 nationals and focus groups with additional A8 nationals.
de Lima <i>et al</i> (2007) A Study of Migrant Workers in Grampian	Consultation with 61 employers, 87 migrant workers and 46 service providers using a range of research methods, including structured surveys and focus groups.

Fife Partnership (2007) Migrant Workers in Fife – Survey 2007	Interview survey of 904 migrants.
Hall Aitken (2007) Migrant Workers in Dumfries and Galloway	Review of existing research, survey of 103 employers, survey of 85 migrant workers and interviews with a further 15, stakeholder workshop of agencies providing support or services.
Orchard, P <i>et al</i> (2007) A Community Profile of EU Migrants in Edinburgh and an evaluation of their access to key services	A range of methods including survey of 67 EU nationals including respondents from 7 of the A8 states, survey of a range of services and qualitative interviews with several.
Sim <i>et al</i> (2007) Achieving a better understanding of A8 migrant labour needs in Lanarkshire	Survey of 48 migrant workers and focus groups with a further 46, consultation with local organisations, survey of 8 employers and 3 employment agencies.
Edinburgh City Council (2008) Inward Migration, report of Policy and Strategy Committee	Review of data sources relating to recent migratory trends in Edinburgh leading to estimate of costs.

## Housing

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
de Lima <i>et al</i> (2005) Migrant Workers in the Highlands and Islands	Interviews with 53 employers, 25 migrant workers, 9 service providers and national bodies. Additional focus groups.
Citizens Advice Scotland (2006), Migrant Workers	Reports from CAB advisers.
Cooté (2006) Homeless A8 migrants – the Scottish experience	Survey of all local authorities across Scotland, response from 28/32.
Scottish Economic Research (2006) The Tayside migrant labour population: scale, impacts and experiences	Survey completed by 700 employers and in-depth follow-up of 47 employers, survey completed by 112 migrant workers and survey of support organisations.

Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Housing issues explored through questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals and interviews with 17 service providers. Study reviews other evidence.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in East Renfrewshire	Consultation with 9 service providers and 7 employers. Housing issues explored through questionnaire-based survey of 21 A8 nationals, focus groups with additional A8 nationals.
Collins, M (2007) Housing, work and welfare experiences of new migrants in Scotland	Interviews with 78 Polish migrant workers and additional focus groups, review of research and consultation with stakeholders.
de Lima et al (2007) A Study of Migrant Workers in Grampian	Consultation with 61 employers, 87 migrant workers and 46 service providers using a range of research methods, including structured surveys and focus groups.
Hall Aitken (2007) Migrant Workers in Dumfries and Galloway	Housing issues explored within survey of 85 migrant workers and interviews with a further 15, stakeholder workshop of agencies providing support or services.
ODS Consulting (2007) Assessing the Housing Needs of Minority Ethnic Communities in Clackmannanshire	One of 3 studies (others in Falkirk and Stirling) based on consultation with public and voluntary organisations and consultation with minority ethnic communities, including migrants.
Orchard, P <i>et al</i> (2007) A Community Profile of EU Migrants in Edinburgh and an evaluation of their access to key services	Housing issues explored through survey of 67 EU nationals including respondents from 7 of the A8 states.
Sim <i>et al</i> (2007) Achieving a better understanding of A8 migrant labour needs in Lanarkshire	Housing data from survey of 48 migrant workers and focus groups with a further 46.
Poole and Adamson (2008) Report on the Situation of the Roma Community in Govanhill, Glasgow	Interviews with key service providers.
Tribal (2008) Glasgow Housing Association – Migrant Workers Research: Final Report	Analysis of applications and allocations, interviews with stakeholders, 6 focus groups and case studies.

### Schools, children and social care

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Save the Children (2002) Starting Again: young asylum-seekers views on life in Glasgow	Survey of 738 young asylum-seekers, 35 focus groups in schools, group interviews with parents and interviews with public services.
Arshad <i>et al</i> (2004), Minority Ethnic Pupils' Experiences of School in Scotland	Survey of teachers and interviews with 81 teachers, 96 pupils and 38 parents across 24 Scottish schools.
Save the Children (2004) My mum is now my best friend: Asylum-seeker and Refugee Families in Glasgow	Interviews and focus groups with 93 child and adult refugees.
Save the Children (2006) Future Scots: Pre Five services for Asylum Seekers and Refugees in Glasgow	Interviews and focus groups with 36 parents, interviews with service providers and stakeholders.
Scottish Refugee Council (2006) This is a good place to live and think about the future	An applied social research project including qualitative interviews the service providers and with children.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals. Focus groups with A8 nationals, interviews with 15 employers and 17 service providers.
Candappa <i>et al</i> (2007), Education and Schooling for Asylum-Seeking Refugee Students in Scotland: An Exploratory Study	Exploratory study including interviews with teachers, interviews with children, young people and parents.
Poole and Adamson (2008) Report on the Situation of the Roma Community in Govanhill, Glasgow	Interviews with key service providers.
Reynolds (2008) The Impacts and Experiences of Migrant Children in UK Secondary Schools	Qualitative research in two UK schools.
The Scottish Government (2008), Pupils in Scotland, 2007	Presentation of data from the annual pupil census in September 2007.

### Health

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Roshan (2005) Supporting New Communities: a qualitative study of health needs among asylum seekers and refugee communities in North Glasgow	Literature review, qualitative interviews with 113 asylum seekers and refugees and focus group with professionals.

GoWell (2006) Community Health and Well-being Survey	Survey of 6,016 adults across 14 sites in Glasgow.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals. Focus groups with A8 nationals, interviews with 15 employers and 17 service providers.
de Lima <i>et al</i> (2007) A Study of Migrant Workers in Grampian	Consultation with 61 employers, 87 migrant workers and 46 service providers using a range of research methods, including structured surveys and focus groups.
Hall Aitken (2007) Migrant Workers in Dumfries and Galloway	Review of existing research, survey of 103 employers, survey of 85 migrant workers and interviews with a further 15, stakeholder workshop of agencies providing support or services.
Orchard, P <i>et al</i> (2007) A Community Profile of EU Migrants in Edinburgh and an evaluation of their access to key services	Survey of 67 EU nationals including respondents from 7 of the A8 states.
Sim <i>et al</i> (2007) Achieving a better understanding of A8 migrant labour needs in Lanarkshire	Survey of 48 migrant workers and focus groups with a further 46.
Jarvis (2008) Alcohol Consumption in Black and Minority Ethnic Groups and recent immigrants in Scotland: current situation on information available	Review of data and existing research.
Poole and Adamson (2008) Report on the Situation of the Roma Community in Govanhill, Glasgow	Interviews with key service providers.

## ESOL

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Rice <i>et al</i> (2005) National 'English for Speakers of Other Languages' (ESOL) Strategy: Mapping Exercise and Scoping Study	Survey of ESOL managers, teachers and learners. Interviews with managers, teachers and service providers and focus groups with learners.

Niace (2006) More than a language: NIACE Committee of Inquiry on English for Speakers of Other Languages	Results of UK-wide consultation.
Beadle and Silverman (2007) Examining the Impact of EU Enlargement and the Introduction of the UK Citizenship Test on Provision of English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) in Scotland	Analysis of datasets, survey of 200 providers, interviews with 49 providers and stakeholders and with 30 learners and providers.
Learning Link Scotland (2007) ESOL in Scotland's Voluntary Sector	Two surveys of voluntary organisations with response from 111 (response rate not given), and interviews with an unspecified number.
Scottish Government (2007) The Adult ESOL Strategy for Scotland	Results of consultation.

### Community cohesion/equalities

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Save the Children (2002) Starting Again: young asylum-seekers views on life in Glasgow	Survey of 738 young asylum-seekers, 35 focus groups in schools, group interviews with parents and interviews with public services.
Save the Children (2004) My mum is now my best friend: Asylum-seeker and Refugee Families in Glasgow	Interviews and focus groups with 93 child and adult refugees.
Wren (2004) Building Bridges: Local responses to the resettlement of asylum seekers in Glasgow	Focus groups and feedback sessions with 10 partnership networks covering areas where asylum seekers are housed.
de Lima <i>et al</i> (2005) Migrant Workers in the Highlands and Islands	Interviews with 53 employers, 25 migrant workers, 9 service providers and national bodies. Additional focus groups.
Bromley <i>et al</i> (2006) Attitudes to Discrimination in Scotland: Scottish Social Attitudes Survey	Survey of 1,594 adults of discriminatory attitudes in respect of ethnicity, gender, disability and sexual orientation.
Lewis (2006) Warm Welcome? Understanding public attitudes to asylum seekers in Scotland	13 focus groups with residents of Dundee, Glasgow and Edinburgh.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals. Focus groups with A8 nationals, interviews with 15 employers and 17 service providers.

Fife Partnership (2007) Migrant Workers in Fife – Survey 2007	Interview survey of 904 migrants.
Kociolek (2008) Polish Newcomers Experiences in the Highlands and Islands of Scotland	Meetings attended by 90 migrant workers.
Pillai <i>et al</i> (2007) The reception and integration of new migrant communities	50 Stakeholder interviews and 17 focus groups in 6 locations of the UK, including Edinburgh and Perth.
Wilson (2007) Barriers to Integration: Issues facing A8 communities in Scotland	Questionnaire completed by 56 A8 migrants.
IBP Strategy and Research (2008) Findings of the Citizen's Panel Survey on Vibrant Communities	Survey of 1,202 panel citizens of Argyll and Bute.

### Crime

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Save the Children (2006) A Hidden Trade: Child trafficking research in Scotland 2005/6	Interviews with 58 individuals from 18 agencies and 18 young people.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in Glasgow	Questionnaire based survey completed by 262 A8 nationals. Focus groups with A8 nationals, interviews with 15 employers and 17 service providers.
Blake Stevenson (2007) A8 Nationals in East Renfrewshire	Consultation with 9 service providers and 7 employers. Questionnaire-based survey of 21 A8 nationals and focus groups with additional A8 nationals.
Dowling <i>et al</i> (2007) Trafficking for the purposes of labour exploitation: a literature review	Literature review.

### Higher education and Fresh Talent

Study (author, year and title)	Methods
Kelly <i>et al</i> (2006) Higher education means business: A summary of the economic impact of Scottish higher education institutions	Review of key economic features of the Scottish HE sector.
Rogerson <i>et al</i> (2006) Progress Report on the Fresh Talent Initiative	Mapping exercise and dialogue with sample of key agencies.

Aberdeen City Council (2008) The economic impact of international students in Aberdeen City	Analysis of data and qualitative interviews with university staff.
Cavanagh <i>et al</i> (2008) Fresh Talent: Working in Scotland Scheme: An evidence review	Review of evidence.
MacLardie and Murray (2008) Evaluation of the Relocation Advisory Service: Phase 2	Surveys of customers and stakeholders; interview with customers, stakeholders and RAS staff.



ISSN 0950 2254  
ISBN 978 0 7559 7415 3  
(Web only publication)

[www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch)

RR Donnelley B59394 2/09

